



October 17, 2001

Mr. Sim W. Goodall
Police Legal Advisor
City of Arlington Police Department
P.O. Box 1065
Arlington, Texas 76004-1065

OR2001-4691

Dear Mr. Goodall:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 153485.

The City of Arlington Police Department (the "department") received a request for fourteen categories of information relating to a named employee of the department. You indicate that you will release information responsive to items 9 and 10 of the request to the requestor. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.117, 552.122, 552.130, and 552.136 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.¹

You have noted that some of the materials at issue (Exhibit C) may be protected by copyright. A custodian of public records must comply with the copyright law and is not required to furnish copies of records that are copyrighted. Attorney General Opinion JM-672 (1987). A governmental body must allow inspection of copyrighted materials unless an exception applies to the information. *Id.* If a member of the public wishes to make copies

¹We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

of copyrighted materials, the person must do so unassisted by the governmental body. In making copies, the member of the public assumes the duty of compliance with the copyright law and the risk of a copyright infringement suit. *See* Open Records Decision No. 550 (1990).

You claim that section 552.108 will except the submitted information in Exhibit B from public disclosure. Section 552.108(a) excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime.” Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain, if the information does not supply the explanation on its face, how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See* Gov’t Code §§ 552.108(a)(1), (b)(1), .301(e)(1)(a); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state that the requested information in Exhibit B relates to a pending DWI investigation. Based upon this representation, we conclude that the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.--Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases). Therefore, the department may withhold the information in Exhibit B under section 552.108.

We note, however, that information normally found on the front page of an offense report is generally considered public. *See generally* Gov’t Code § 552.108(c); *Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.--Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976); Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976). Thus, you must release the types of information that are considered to be front page offense report information, even if this information is not actually located on the front page of the offense report. Although section 552.108(a)(1) authorizes you to withhold the remaining information in Exhibit B from disclosure, you may choose to release all or part of the information at issue that is not otherwise confidential by law. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.007.

Section 552.101 excepts “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” The submitted information contains employee W-4 forms, which are excepted from public disclosure by federal law. 26 U.S.C. § 6103(a)(2), (b)(2)(A), (p)(8). Attorney General Op. MW-372 (1981). Thus, the department must withhold the W-4 forms in Exhibit D.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrines of common law and constitutional privacy. Common law privacy protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Industrial Found. v. Texas Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976), *cert. denied*, 430 U.S. 931 (1977). The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas

Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. 540 S.W.2d at 683.

This office has found that the following types of information are excepted from required public disclosure under common law privacy: some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps), and personal financial information not relating to the financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992), 545 (1990). The records submitted in Exhibit D contain information which is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 in conjunction with common law privacy. We have marked this information.

We next find that some of the information in the personnel file is made confidential by section 1703.306 of the Occupations Code, which provides:

(a) A polygraph examiner, trainee, or employee of a polygraph examiner, or a person for whom a polygraph examination is conducted or an employee of the person, may not disclose information acquired from a polygraph examination to another person other than:

- (1) the examinee or any other person specifically designated in writing by the examinee;
- (2) the person that requested the examination;
- (3) a member, or the member's agent, of a governmental agency that licenses a polygraph examiner or supervises or controls a polygraph examiner's activities;
- (4) another polygraph examiner in private consultation; or
- (5) any other person required by due process of law.

Occ. Code § 1703.306. We find that certain information in the personnel file was obtained through polygraph examinations. It does not appear that any of the exceptions in section 1703.306 apply in this case. *See* Open Records Decision 565 (1990)(construing predecessor statute). Accordingly, the information we have marked is confidential pursuant to section 1703.306 of the Occupations Code and is therefore excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

You state that the documents in Exhibit D-9 are test questions and answers. Section 552.122(b) excepts from disclosure test items developed by a licensing agency or governmental body. In Open Records Decision No. 626 (1994), this office determined that the term "test item" in section 552.122 includes any standard means by which an individual's or group's knowledge or ability in a particular area is evaluated, but does not encompass evaluations of an employee's overall job performance or suitability. Whether information falls within the section 552.122 exception must be determined on a case-by-case basis. Open Records Decision No. 626 at 6 (1994). Having reviewed the submitted questions, we agree that they are "test items" as contemplated by section 552.122(b). Therefore, you may withhold the questions and answers under section 552.122(b).

Section 552.119 excepts from public disclosure a photograph of a peace officer² that, if released, would endanger the life or physical safety of the officer unless one of three exceptions applies. The three exceptions are: (1) the officer is under indictment or charged with an offense by information; (2) the officer is a party in a fire or police civil service hearing or a case in arbitration; or (3) the photograph is introduced as evidence in a judicial proceeding. This section also provides that a photograph exempt from disclosure under this section may be made public only if the peace officer gives written consent to the disclosure. Open Records Decision No. 502 (1988). The submitted copy of a photograph depicts a peace officer and it does not appear that any of the exceptions are applicable. You have not informed us that the peace officer has executed any written consents to disclosure. Thus, we agree that you must withhold the photograph depicting the peace officer.

The requested records contain information that is excepted from disclosure under section 552.117(2). The department must withhold those portions of the records that reveal the officer's home address, home telephone number, social security number, and information that reveals whether the officer has family members. Gov't Code §552.117(2). The department must also withhold the officer's *former* home addresses and telephone information from disclosure. See Open Records Decision No. 622 (1994).

Finally, we note that the submitted information contains a driver's license number and vehicle identification number. Section 552.130 provides in relevant part:

(a) Information is excepted from the requirement of Section 552.021 if the information relates to:

(1) a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state; [or]

(2) a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state[.]

²"Peace officer" is defined by article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure.

You must withhold the Texas driver's license number and vehicle identification number.

In summary, polygraph results, W-4 forms, the Texas driver's license number, and the vehicle identification number are all confidential by law and must be withheld. The marked information in Exhibit D is confidential and must be withheld from disclosure under section 552.101 in conjunction with common law privacy. Records that reveal the officer's home address, home telephone number, social security number, and information that reveals whether the officer has family members must be withheld under section 552.117. The photograph of the peace officer must be withheld pursuant to section 552.119. With the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the information in Exhibit B under section 552.108. Test questions and answers may be withheld under section 552.122(b). The department is not required to furnish copies of records that are copyrighted.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at 877/673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental

body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Department of Public Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.--Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the General Services Commission at 512/475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Cindy Nettles
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CN/seg

Ref: ID# 153485

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Gregory L. Dorst
Attorney at Law, P.L.L.C.
1100 East Pioneer Parkway, Suite 100
Arlington, Texas 76010
(w/o enclosures)