



December 10, 2001

Mr. Michael Jay Burns  
Supervising Attorney  
Information Release  
Texas Workforce Commission  
101 East 15<sup>th</sup> Street  
Austin, Texas 78778-0001

OR2001-5756

Dear Mr. Burns:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 155913.

The Texas Workforce Commission (the "commission") received a request for eleven categories of information related to specified job postings. You state that the commission will release some responsive information to the requestor. You claim that a portion of the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.117, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.<sup>1</sup>

We first note that the submitted information does not appear to contain information responsive to those categories of the request related to reference checks and investigator's notes including background information, nor have you raised any exceptions to its disclosure. Therefore, we assume that, to the extent this information exists, it has been released to the requestor. If not, you must do so immediately. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.006, .301, .302; Open Records Decision No. 664 (2000) (concluding that section 552.221(a) requires that information not excepted from disclosure must be released as soon as possible under the circumstances).

---

<sup>1</sup>We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code protects "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." You contend that the personal financial information contained in the submitted documents is protected from disclosure by the common law right of privacy. Information is protected by the common law right of privacy when (1) it is highly intimate and embarrassing such that its release would be highly objectionable to a person of ordinary sensibilities, and (2) there is no legitimate public interest in its disclosure. See *Industrial Foundation v. Texas Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 683-85 (Tex. 1976), *cert denied*, 430 U.S. 931 (1977); see also Open Records Decision No. 611 at 1 (1992). Prior decisions of this office have found that financial information relating only to an individual ordinarily satisfies the first requirement of the test for common law privacy, but that there is a legitimate public interest in the essential facts about a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body. See Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992), 545 (1990), 373 (1983).

In Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987), this office concluded that the educational training of applicants; the names and addresses of their former employers, the dates of their employment, the kind of work, their salary per month, and their reasons for leaving; the names, occupations, addresses, and phone numbers of their character references; and their job preferences or abilities, did not constitute the kind of "intimate" information that is protected by disclosural privacy. Additionally, the public interest in this information would justify its disclosure, as it bears on the applicants' past employment record and their suitability for the employment position in question. After examining the submitted information, we conclude that the information at issue is not confidential under the common law right of privacy and is not excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

You argue that section 552.117 may also be applicable to some of the submitted information. Section 552.117 excepts from disclosure the home addresses and telephone numbers, social security numbers, and family member information of current or former officials or employees of a governmental body who request that this information be kept confidential under section 552.024. Whether a particular piece of information is protected by section 552.117 must be determined at the time the request for it is made. See Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). Therefore, the commission may only withhold information under section 552.117 on behalf of current or former officials or employees who made a request for confidentiality under section 552.024 prior to the date on which the request for this information was made. For those employees who timely elected to keep their personal information confidential, the commission must withhold the employees' home addresses and telephone numbers, social security numbers, and any information that reveals whether these employees have family members. We have marked the types of information that must be withheld for those employees who made timely elections. The commission may not withhold this information under section 552.117 for those employees who did not make a timely election to keep the information confidential.

Social security numbers may be withheld in some circumstances under section 552.101 of the Government Code. A social security number or "related record" may be excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 in conjunction with the 1990 amendments to the federal Social Security Act, 42 U.S.C. § 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I). *See* Open Records Decision No. 622 (1994). These amendments make confidential social security numbers and related records that are obtained and maintained by a state agency or political subdivision of the state pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. *See id.* We have no basis for concluding that any of the social security numbers in the file are confidential under section 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I), and therefore excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 on the basis of that federal provision. We caution, however, that section 552.352 of the Public Information Act imposes criminal penalties for the release of confidential information. Prior to releasing any social security number information, you should ensure that no such information was obtained or is maintained by the commission pursuant to any provision of law, enacted on or after October 1, 1990.

You assert that a portion of the responsive information is excepted from public disclosure under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 provides in relevant part:

(a) Information is excepted from the requirement of Section 552.021 if the information relates to:

(1) a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state[.]

The commission must withhold the Texas driver's license numbers under section 552.130.

The submitted information also contains e-mail addresses obtained from the public. The Seventy-seventh Legislature recently added section 552.137 to chapter 552 of the Government Code. This new exception makes certain e-mail addresses confidential.<sup>2</sup> Senate Bill 694, as passed May 14, 2001, signed by the Governor May 26, 2001, and made effective immediately, provides in relevant part:

Sec. 552.137. CONFIDENTIALITY OF CERTAIN E-MAIL ADDRESSES.

(a) An e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body is confidential and not subject to disclosure under this chapter.

---

<sup>2</sup>House Bill 2589, which also makes certain e-mail addresses confidential, took effect on September 1, 2001. *See* Act of May 22, 2001, 77th Leg., R.S., H.B. 2589, § 5 (to be codified at Gov't Code § 552.136). The language of section 552.136, as added by House Bill 2589, is identical to that of section 552.137.

(b) Confidential information described by this section that relates to a member of the public may be disclosed if the member of the public affirmatively consents to its release.

Act of May 14, 2001, 77th Leg., R.S., S.B. 694, § 1 (to be codified at Gov't Code § 552.137). You do not inform us that a member of the public has affirmatively consented to the release of any e-mail address contained in the submitted materials. The commission must, therefore, withhold the marked e-mail addresses under section 552.137.

In summary, for those employees who timely elected to keep their personal information confidential, the commission must withhold the employees' home addresses and telephone numbers, social security numbers, and any information that reveals whether these employees have family members. Texas driver's license numbers must be withheld from public disclosure under section 552.130. The commission must withhold the marked e-mail addresses under section 552.137.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at 877/673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Department of Public Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.--Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at 512/475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Cindy Nettles". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first name "Cindy" written in a larger, more prominent script than the last name "Nettles".

Cindy Nettles  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

CN/sdk

Ref: ID# 155913

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Kevin Steverson  
8111 Manderville Lane, #1718  
Dallas, Texas 75231  
(w/o enclosures)