



OFFICE *of the* ATTORNEY GENERAL
GREG ABBOTT

June 3, 2003

Mr. Robert R. Ray
Assistant City Attorney
City of Longview
P.O. Box 1952
Longview, Texas 75606-1952

OR2003-3761

Dear Mr. Ray:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 182088.

The City of Longview (the "city") received a request for all information contained in the requestor's personnel file and medical file for a certain period, a specified internal affairs investigation, unit activity summary, and accident report, and information relating to certain logs.¹ You state that the city has released a portion of the requested information to the requestor. However, you claim that the requested information you have marked is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.117, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

First, we note that some of the information at issue consists of medical records or contains information from medical records, access to which is governed by the Medical Practice Act ("MPA"), chapter 159 of the Occupations Code. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides:

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

¹We note that the Public Information Act (the "Act") does not require the city to answer factual questions, perform legal research, or create new information in responding to a request. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 605 at 2 (1992), 563 at 8 (1990), 555 at 1-2 (1990), 534 at 2-3 (1989); *see also* *AT&T Consultants, Inc. v. Sharp*, 904 S.W.2d 668, 676 (Tex.1995); *Fish v. Dallas Indep. Sch. Dist.*, 31 S.W.3d 678, 681(Tex. App.–Eastland, pet. denied). However, the city must make a good faith attempt to relate a request to information it holds. *See* Open Records Decision No. 561 at 8 (1990).

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

The information we have marked as subject to the MPA must be released upon the patient's signed, written consent, provided that the consent specifies (1) the information to be covered by the release, (2) reasons or purposes for the release, and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. Occ. Code §§ 159.004,.005. Section 159.002(c) also requires that any subsequent release of medical records be consistent with the purposes for which the governmental body obtained the records. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). The information at issue may be released only in accordance with the MPA, and otherwise must be withheld. Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code exempts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Section 552.101 encompasses confidentiality provisions such as section 58.007 of the Family Code. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997 are confidential under section 58.007. The relevant language of section 58.007(c) reads as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapter B.

You have marked information that involves juvenile conduct that occurred after September 1, 1997. It does not appear that any of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply; therefore, this information is confidential pursuant to section 58.007(c) of the Family Code, and it must be withheld from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

The submitted information also contains an accident report form that appears to have been completed pursuant to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. *See* Transp. Code § 550.064 (officer's accident report). Section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code states that, except as provided by subsection (c), accident reports are privileged and confidential. Section 550.065(c)(4) provides for release of accident reports to a person who provides two of the following three pieces of information: (1) date of the accident; (2) name of any person involved in the accident; and (3) specific location of the accident. Transp. Code § 550.065(c)(4)). Under this provision, a governmental entity is required to release a copy of an accident report to a person who provides the law enforcement agency with two or more pieces of information specified by the statute. *Id.* You indicate, and the request for information supports, that the requestor has not supplied two of the three pieces of information required by the statute. Thus, you must withhold the accident report, which you have marked, under section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code in conjunction with section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Further, the submitted information contains declarations of medical and psychological and mental health required by the Texas Commission on Law Enforcement Officer Standards and Education that are confidential pursuant to section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code. Section 1701.306 provides as follows:

(a) The commission may not issue a license to a person as an officer or county jailer unless the person is examined by:

(1) a licensed psychologist or by a psychiatrist who declares in writing that the person is in satisfactory psychological and emotional health to serve as the type of officer for which a license is sought; and

(2) a licensed physician who declares in writing that the person does not show any trace of drug dependency or illegal drug use after a physical examination, blood test, or other medical test.

(b) An agency hiring a person for whom a license as an officer or county jailer is sought shall select the examining physician and the examining psychologist or psychiatrist. The agency shall prepare a report of each declaration required by Subsection (a) and shall maintain a copy of the report on file in a format readily accessible to the commission. *A declaration is not public information.*

Therefore, the city must withhold the submitted declarations pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code.

The submitted documents also contain the requestor's I-9 and W-4 forms. Section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code provides that an Employment Eligibility Verification Form I-9 "may not be used for purposes other than for enforcement of this chapter" and for

enforcement of other federal statutes governing crime and criminal investigations. *See* 8 U.S.C. § 1324a(b)(5); *see also* 8 C.F.R. § 274a.2(b)(4). The release of submitted I-9 form in response to this request for information would be “for purposes other than for enforcement” of the referenced federal statutes. A Form I-9 may be released only for purposes of compliance with the federal laws and regulations governing the employment verification system. A W-4 form is confidential under section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code.² Therefore, the city must withhold the submitted I-9 and W-4 forms under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law.

Next, you claim that some of the information you have marked is confidential under section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code. In Open Records Decision No. 649 (1996), which interpreted section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code, we examined several confidentiality provisions in chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code. To the extent that the submitted information involves an emergency 9-1-1 district established in accordance with chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code, which authorizes the development of local emergency communications districts, the information may be confidential under chapter 772. Sections 772.118, 772.218, and 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code make confidential the originating telephone numbers and addresses of 9-1-1 callers furnished by a service supplier. *See* Open Records Decision No. 649 (1996). Section 772.118 applies to emergency communication districts for counties with a population over two million. Section 772.218 applies to emergency communication districts for counties with a population over 860,000. Section 772.318 applies to emergency communication districts for counties with a population over 20,000. Subchapter E, which applies to counties with populations over 1.5 million, does not contain a confidentiality provision regarding 9-1-1 telephone numbers and addresses. *See* Health & Safety Code §§ 772.401, *et seq.* Thus, if the emergency communication district here is subject to section 772.118, 772.218, or 772.318, the originating telephone numbers and addresses that you have marked are protected from public disclosure under section 552.101 as information deemed confidential by statute.

You assert that two of the documents you have marked are Emergency Medical Services (“EMS”) records, access to which is governed by the provisions of section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code. Section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code, the Emergency Medical Services Act, provides:

(b) Records of the identity, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by emergency medical services personnel or by a physician providing medical supervision that are created by the emergency medical services personnel or physician or maintained by an emergency medical services provider are confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

....

²We note that return information of any taxpayer may be disclosed to any person that the taxpayer designates. *See* 26 U.S.C. § 6103(c).

(g) The privilege of confidentiality under this section does not extend to information regarding the presence, nature of injury or illness, age, sex, occupation, and city of residence of a patient who is receiving emergency medical services. . . .

Health & Safety Code § 773.091(b), (g). Section 773.091(b) thus protects from disclosure the submitted EMS record. *See* Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). However, information regarding the presence, nature of injury or illness, age, sex, occupation, and city of residence of a patient is not confidential. Health & Safety Code § 773.091(g). It does not appear that any of the exceptions to confidentiality set forth in section 773.092 of the Health and Safety Code apply in this instance. Accordingly, the city must withhold the record we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code, except for information required to be released under section 773.091(g). However, section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code is inapplicable to the remaining document that you have marked because it is a commendation, not an EMS record.

Additionally, criminal history record information ("CHRI") generated by the National Crime Information Center ("NCIC") or by the Texas Crime Information Center ("TCIC") is confidential. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except that the DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083.

Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090 - .127. Thus, any CHRI generated by the federal government or another state may not be made available to the requestor except in accordance with federal regulations. *See* Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F.³

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. For information to be protected from public disclosure under common-law privacy, the information must meet the criteria set out in *Industrial Foundation v. Texas Industrial Accident Board*, 540 S.W.2d 668 (Tex. 1976), *cert. denied*, 430 U.S. 931 (1977). Information must be withheld from the

³We note, however, that the requestor may obtain his own CHRI directly from DPS. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083(b)(3).

public when (1) it is highly intimate and embarrassing such that its release would be highly objectionable to a person of ordinary sensibilities, and (2) there is no legitimate public interest in its disclosure. *Id.* at 685; Open Records Decision No. 611 at 1 (1992). The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has found that personal financial information not relating to the financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is protected by common-law privacy, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992), 545 (1990); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 373 (1983) (common-law privacy protects assets and income source information). Having reviewed the submitted information, we have marked the information that is considered highly intimate or embarrassing and is not of legitimate concern to the public. This information is protected by common-law privacy and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

You also claim that the additional information you have marked is excepted from disclosure pursuant to section 552.117 of the Government Code. Section 552.117(2) excepts the home address and telephone number, social security number, and family member information of a peace officer⁴ regardless of whether the officer made an election under section 552.024 of the Government Code. Therefore, we agree that the personal information you have marked must be withheld under section 552.117(2) of the Government Code.

Additionally, section 552.117(1) excepts the same information regarding current or former officials or employees of a governmental body who request that this information be kept confidential under section 552.024. Whether a particular piece of information is protected by section 552.117(1) must be determined at the time the request for it is made. *See* Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). Therefore, the city may only withhold information under section 552.117(1) on behalf of current or former officials or employees who made a request for confidentiality under section 552.024 prior to the date on which the request for this information was made. For an employee who timely elected to keep his personal information confidential, you must withhold the employee's home address and telephone number, social security number, and any family member information. The city may not withhold this information under section 552.117(1) for an employee who did not make a timely election to keep the information confidential.

We note that the remaining social security numbers may be withheld in some circumstances under section 552.101 in conjunction with the 1990 amendments to the federal Social Security Act, 42 U.S.C. § 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I). *See* Open Records Decision No. 622 (1994). These amendments make confidential social security numbers and related records that are obtained and maintained by a state agency or political subdivision of the state pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. *See id.* We have no basis for concluding that the social security numbers in the responsive information are confidential

⁴"Peace officer" is defined by article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure.

under section 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I), and therefore excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 of the Act on the basis of that federal provision. We caution, however, that section 552.352 of the Act imposes criminal penalties for the release of confidential information. Prior to releasing any social security number information, the city should ensure that no such information was obtained or is maintained by the city pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990.

Finally, section 552.130 of the Government Code prohibits the release of information that relates to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state or a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state or a personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or authorized local agency. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the city must withhold the Texas driver's license, identification, license plate, and motor vehicle information you have marked pursuant to section 552.130 of the Government Code. However, we have marked additional information to which section 552.130 is inapplicable and must be released.

In summary, we conclude that you must withhold the following information under section 552.101 of the Government Code: 1) the information you have marked under section 58.007 of the Family Code; 2) the accident report under section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code; 3) the declarations of medical condition and of psychological and emotional health we have marked under section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code; 4) the submitted I-9 and W-4 forms under federal law; 5) the originating telephone numbers and addresses you have marked if the emergency communication district here is subject to section 772.118, 772.218, or 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code; 6) the EMS record we have marked under section 773.091(b) of the Health and Safety Code, except for information required to be released under section 773.091(g); 7) any CHRI generated by TCIC and NCIC; 8) the information we have marked under common-law privacy; and 9) social security numbers that may be confidential under federal law. Additionally, we conclude that: 10) the medical records we have marked are subject to the MPA and may only be released accordingly; 11) if a timely election was made or if the information relates to a peace officer, you must withhold the section 552.117 information; and 12) you must withhold the section 552.130 information. All remaining information must be released.⁵

⁵We note that under section 552.023 of the Government Code a person or a person's authorized representative has a special right of access to records that contain information relating to the person that are protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests. Therefore, the requestor has a special right of access to his section 552.117 and section 552.130 information, and it must be released in this instance. Furthermore, we note that some of the remaining submitted information may be confidential and not subject to release to the general public. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023. However, as stated, the requestor in this instance has a special right of access to the information. Gov't Code § 552.023. Because some of the information may be confidential with respect to the general public, if the city receives a further request for this information from an individual other than this requestor or his authorized representative, the city should again seek our decision.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code

§ 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



W. Montgomery Meitler
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

WMM/lmt

Ref: ID# 182088

Enc: Submitted documents

c: Mr. Wade Turner
109 Briarmeadow Dr.
Longview, Texas 75604
(w/o enclosures)