



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

GREG ABBOTT

September 30, 2003

Mr. Brad Norton  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of Austin - Law Department  
P.O. Box 1546  
Austin, Texas 78767-1546

OR2003-6871

Dear Mr. Norton:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 188594.

The City of Austin (the "city") received a request for any information related to a specified incident and any information related to similar incidents within the last five years. You state that the city will release some of the requested information to the requestor. However, you claim that a portion of the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.103, 552.107, 552.111, 552.117, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.<sup>1</sup>

Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. You assert that some of the documents you have marked are Emergency Medical Services ("EMS") records, access to which is governed by the provisions of section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code. Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). Section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code, the Emergency Medical Services Act, provides:

(b) Records of the identity, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by emergency medical services personnel or by a physician providing medical

---

<sup>1</sup>We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). Here, we do not address any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

supervision that are created by the emergency medical services personnel or physician or maintained by an emergency medical services provider are confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

....

(g) The privilege of confidentiality under this section does not extend to information regarding the presence, nature of injury or illness, age, sex, occupation, and city of residence of a patient who is receiving emergency medical services. . . .

Health & Safety Code § 773.091(b), (g). Section 773.091(b) thus protects from disclosure the submitted EMS records. *See* Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). However, information regarding the presence, nature of injury or illness, age, sex, occupation, and city of residence of a patient is not confidential. Health & Safety Code § 773.091(g). It does not appear that any of the exceptions to confidentiality set forth in section 773.092 of the Health and Safety Code apply in this instance. Accordingly, the city must withhold the submitted EMS records under section 552.101 of the Government Code, except for information required to be released under section 773.091(g).<sup>2</sup>

You also assert that the submitted information contains medical records, access to which is governed by the Medical Practice Act (“MPA”), chapter 159 of the Occupations Code. Section 159.002 provides in pertinent part:

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient’s behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002( b), (c). The MPA governs access to medical records. Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). The MPA requires that any subsequent release of medical records be consistent with the purposes for which a governmental body obtained the records. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). Moreover, information that is subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. *See*

---

<sup>2</sup>As we are able to make this determination, we need not address your argument under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Occ. Code § 159.002(a), (b), (c); Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). Upon our review of the remaining submitted information, there is no indication that any of the documents were created or maintained by a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. Therefore, the MPA is inapplicable to the remaining submitted information.

Next, you claim section 552.103 of the Government Code in regard to a portion of the submitted information. This section provides as follows:

(a) Information is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information relating to litigation of a civil or criminal nature to which the state or a political subdivision is or may be a party or to which an officer or employee of the state or a political subdivision, as a consequence of the person's office or employment, is or may be a party.

....

(c) Information relating to litigation involving a governmental body or an officer or employee of a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under Subsection (a) only if the litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date that the requestor applies to the officer for public information for access to or duplication of the information.

A governmental body has the burden of providing relevant facts and documents to show that the section 552.103(a) exception is applicable in a particular situation. The test for meeting this burden is a showing that (1) litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date the governmental body received the request for information, and (2) the information at issue is related to that litigation. *University of Tex. Law Sch. v. Texas Legal Found.*, 958 S.W.2d 479, 481 (Tex. App.--Austin 1997, no pet.); *Heard v. Houston Post Co.*, 684 S.W.2d 210, 212 (Tex. App.--Houston [1st Dist.] 1984, writ ref'd n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 551 at 4 (1990). A governmental body must meet both prongs of this test for information to be excepted under section 552.103(a).

You have submitted to this office a copy of the plaintiff's first amended original petition filed in the District Court 200<sup>th</sup> Judicial District Travis County, Texas in which the city is named as a defendant. Based on the information you provided, we agree that litigation involving the city was pending at the time it received the instant request for information. In addition, we find that the submitted information you have marked is related to the pending litigation for purposes of section 552.103(a). Thus, you may withhold this information pursuant to section 552.103 of the Government Code.<sup>3</sup>

---

<sup>3</sup>As we are able to make this determination, we need not address your arguments under sections 552.107 and 552.111 of the Government Code.

Generally, however, once information has been obtained by all parties to the litigation through discovery or otherwise, no section 552.103(a) interest exists with respect to that information. Open Records Decision Nos. 349 (1982), 320 (1982). Thus, information that has either been obtained from or provided to the opposing party in the pending litigation is not excepted from disclosure under section 552.103(a), and must be disclosed. Further, the applicability of section 552.103(a) ends once the litigation has been concluded. Attorney General Opinion MW-575 (1982); Open Records Decision No. 350 (1982).

Section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the home addresses and telephone numbers, social security numbers, and family member information of current or former officials or employees of a governmental body who request that this information be kept confidential under section 552.024 of the Government Code. *See Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(1)*. However, information subject to section 552.117(a)(1) may not be withheld from disclosure if the current or former employee made the request for confidentiality under section 552.024 after the request for information at issue was received by the governmental body. Whether a particular piece of information is public must be determined at the time the request for it is made. *See Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989)*. For an employee who timely elected to keep his personal information confidential, we agree that you must withhold the types of section 552.117(a)(1) information you have highlighted and the additional information we have marked. The city may not withhold this information under section 552.117(a)(1) for an employee who did not make a timely election to keep the information confidential.

If a timely election was not made, we note that social security numbers must be withheld in some circumstances under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the 1990 amendments to the federal Social Security Act, 42 U.S.C. § 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I). *See Open Records Decision No. 622 (1994)*. These amendments make confidential social security numbers and related records that are obtained and maintained by a state agency or political subdivision of the state pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. *See id.* We have no basis for concluding that the social security numbers in the responsive information are confidential under section 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I), and therefore excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 of the Public Information Act (the "Act") on the basis of that federal provision. We caution, however, that section 552.352 of the Act imposes criminal penalties for the release of confidential information. Prior to releasing any social security number information, the city should ensure that no such information was obtained or is maintained by the city pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990.

In summary, we conclude that: 1) the city must withhold the EMS records you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 773.091(b) of the Health and Safety Code, except for information required to be released under section 773.091(g); 2) the city may withhold the information you have marked as section 552.103 information under that section; 3) if a timely election was made under

section 552.024, the city must withhold the section 552.117(a)(1) information; and 4) social security numbers may be confidential under federal law. All remaining submitted information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



W. Montgomery Meitler  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

WMM/lmt

Ref: ID# 188594

Enc: Submitted documents

c: Blair Dancy  
Hull, Henricks & MacRae, L.L.P.  
Bank One Tower  
221 W. 6<sup>th</sup> St., Suite 2000  
Austin, Texas 78701-3407  
(w/o enclosures)