



OFFICE of the ATTORNEY GENERAL  
GREG ABBOTT

March 26, 2004

Lieutenant Arturo Valdez  
Central Records Division  
McAllen Police Department  
P.O. Box 220  
McAllen, Texas 78501

OR2004-2313

Dear Lt. Valdez:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 198106.

The McAllen Police Department (the "department") received a request for a report of Case #99-13116. You state that the department has released the basic front page offense report information as required by *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex.Civ.App.—Houston [14<sup>th</sup> dist], 1975). See Gov't Code § 552.108(c). You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

We will first address your responsibilities under the Act. Subsections 552.301(a) and (b) of the Government Code provide:

(a) A governmental body that receives a written request for information that it wishes to withhold from public disclosure and that it considers to be within one of the [act's] exceptions . . . must ask for a decision from the attorney general about whether the information is within that exception if there has not been a previous determination about whether the information falls within one of the exceptions.

(b) The governmental body must ask for the attorney general's decision and state the exceptions that apply within a reasonable time but not later than the 10th business day after the date of receiving the written request.

Gov't Code § 552.301(a), (b). You inform us that the department received the request for information on January 2, 2004. You did not request a decision from this office until January 20, 2004. Consequently, you failed to request a decision within the ten business day period mandated by section 552.301(b) of the Government Code.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless the governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.302; *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.--Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to Gov't Code § 552.302); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). A governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason by showing that the requested information is made confidential by law or third party interests are at stake. Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977). Section 552.108 of the Government Code, which protects law enforcement interests, is a discretionary exception and generally does not provide a compelling reason to overcome the presumption of openness. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 586 (1991) (governmental body may waive predecessor to section 552.108), 522 at 4 (1989) (discretionary exceptions in general). *But see* Open Records Decision Nos. 630 at 3 (1994), 586 at 3 (1991) (need of another governmental body to withhold information under predecessor to section 552.108 can provide compelling reason under section 552.302). In this instance, you have not provided us with a compelling reason under section 552.108. Therefore, you may not withhold the requested information under section 552.108 of the Government Code.

We note, however, that some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure by section 552.130 of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> Section 552.130 excepts from public disclosure information relating to a driver's license or motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state. Thus, we have marked the information in the submitted documents that the department must withhold pursuant to section 552.130.

Finally, we note that he submitted information contains social security numbers. Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision," and encompasses information that is protected from disclosure by other statutes. A social security number or "related record" may be excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 in conjunction with the 1990 amendments to the federal Social Security Act, 42 U.S.C. § 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I). *See* Open Records Decision No. 622 (1994). These amendments make confidential social security numbers and related records that are obtained and maintained by a state agency or

---

<sup>1</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions like sections 552.101 and 552.130 on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

political subdivision of the state pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. *See id.* We have no basis for concluding that any of the social security numbers in the file are confidential under section 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I), and therefore excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 on the basis of that federal provision. We caution, however, that section 552.352 of the Act imposes criminal penalties for the release of confidential information. Prior to releasing any social security number information, the department should ensure that no such information was obtained or is maintained by the department pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. We note, however, that because the laws regarding the confidentiality of social security numbers are intended to protect the privacy of living individuals, and not deceased persons, the right of privacy is purely personal and lapses at death. *See Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enters. Inc.*, 589 S.W.2d 489 (Tex. Civ. App.- Texarkana 1979, writ ref'd n.r.e.); *see also* Attorney General Opinions JM- 229 (1984); H-917 (1976). Accordingly, as the individual with whom one of the social security numbers at issue is associated is deceased, we conclude that the department may not withhold such social security number under section 552.101 in conjunction with federal law.

In summary, the department must withhold the Texas driver's license number that we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The social security numbers of living individuals contained in the submitted records may be confidential under federal law. The remaining submitted information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the

governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877)673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512)475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Cindy Nettles  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

CN/jh

Ref: ID# 198106  
Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Carol J. Wintrod  
Department of Veterans Affairs  
2200 Fort Roots Drive, Building 65  
North Little Rock, Arkansas 72114-1756  
(w/o enclosures)