



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

June 2, 2004

Ms. Alice Caruso
Assistant Disclosure Officer
Texas Workforce Commission
101 East 15th Street
Austin, Texas 78778

OR2004-4493

Dear Ms. Caruso:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 202746.

The Texas Workforce Commission (the "commission") received a request for the commission's case file, correspondence, appeal files, and hearing tapes regarding a named individual. You state that some responsive information will be released to the requestor. You claim that the remaining requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.107 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we must address the procedural requirements of section 552.301 of the Government Code. Pursuant to section 552.301(b), a governmental body must ask the attorney general for a decision as to whether requested information must be disclosed not later than the tenth business day after the date of receiving the written request for information. Further, pursuant to section 552.301(e), a governmental body is required to submit to this office within fifteen business days of receiving an open records request (1) general written comments stating the reasons why the stated exceptions apply that would allow the information to be withheld, (2) a copy of the written request for information, (3) a signed statement or sufficient evidence showing the date the governmental body received the written request, and (4) a copy of the specific information requested or representative samples, labeled to indicate which exceptions apply to which parts of the documents. The commission received the request for information on February 23, 2004. However, the commission did not request a decision from

this office or submit the required information until March 30, 2004. Consequently, the commission failed to comply with the requirements of both section 552.301(b) and section 552.301(e) of the Government Code.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to submit to this office the information required in section 552.301(b) results in the legal presumption that the information is public and must be released. Information that is presumed public must be released unless a governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information to overcome this presumption. *See Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to Gov't Code § 552.302); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). Section 552.107 of the Government Code is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects the governmental body's interests and may be waived by the governmental body. Thus, section 552.107 does not demonstrate a compelling reason to withhold information from the public. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 676 at 12 (2002) (harm to governmental body's interests under section 552.107 not compelling reason for non-disclosure), 630 at 4-5 (1994) (governmental body may waive statutory predecessor to section 552.107); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally). However, because your section 552.101 claim can provide a compelling reason to overcome the presumption of openness, we will address the applicability of section 552.101 to the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information made confidential by other statutes. You claim that the submitted information is confidential under federal regulations. We note that the regulations found at section 603 of title 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations send a clear message that "claim information" in the files of a state unemployment compensation agency is to be disclosed only to a "receiving agency," as defined in the regulations, or to other specified parties. *See* 20 C.F.R. §§ 603.1 et seq.; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 476 at 4 (1987). Otherwise, pursuant to section 603.7 of title 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations, state unemployment compensation agencies, such as the commission, must protect the confidentiality of claim information. "Claim information" means information regarding whether an individual is receiving, has received, or has applied for unemployment compensation, as well as "[a]ny other information contained in the records of the State employment compensation agency which is needed by the requesting agency to verify eligibility for, and the amount of, benefits." 20 C.F.R. § 603.2(c)(1), (5). We also note that the names of employers and employees who file unemployment compensation appeals fall within the definition of "claim information" and that the federal regulations prohibit the commission from disclosing this information. *See* Open Records Decision No. 476 at 4 (1987).

You also argue that the federal Social Security Act requires states to comply with the directives of the United States Department of Labor (the "department") in administering state unemployment insurance ("UI") programs and that a department directive, UI Program Letter No. 34-97, specifies the conditions under which such claim information may be released. You do not inform us whether the release provisions of either part 603 or the UI Letter apply. Therefore, we conclude that, although the information at issue is confidential, it must be released if any of the release provisions in UI Program Letter No. 34-97 or part 603 of title 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations apply. *See* UI Program Letter 34-97 (allowing disclosure to "private entity under a written agreement which requires 'informed consent' from the individual to whom the information pertains"); 20 C.F.R. pt. 603. Otherwise, the commission must withhold the submitted information in its entirety pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code and these federal provisions.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental

body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Debbie K. Lee
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

DKL/seg

Ref: ID# 202746

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Brenda McAfee
Epstein Becker Green Wickliff & Hall, P.C.
1000 Louisiana, Suite 5400
Houston, Texas 77002
(w/o enclosures)