



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

June 3, 2004

Mr. Billy B. Mullens
Staff Attorney
Legal Service Division
Texas General Land Office
P.O. Box 12873
Austin, Texas 78711

OR2004-4554

Dear Mr. Mullens:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 202742.

The Texas General Land Office (the "land office") received a request for four contracts between the land office and Tobin International, Ltd. ("Tobin") from January 1, 2000 to March 17, 2004. You indicate that release of the submitted information would implicate the proprietary interests of Tobin. Pursuant to section 552.305 of the Government Code, you state and provide documentation showing that you notified Tobin of the request for information and of its opportunity to submit arguments to this office. *See Gov't Code § 552.305* (permitting interested third party to submit to attorney general reasons why requested information should not be released); Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (determining that statutory predecessor to Gov't Code § 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception to disclosure in certain circumstances).

We note that an interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice under section 552.305(d) to submit its reasons, if any, as to why requested information relating to that party should be withheld from disclosure. *See Gov't Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B)*. As of the date of this letter, Tobin has not submitted any comments to this office explaining how release of its information would implicate its proprietary interests. Therefore, Tobin has provided us with no basis to conclude that it has a protected proprietary interest in its information. *See Gov't Code § 552.110*; Open Records

Decision Nos. 661 at 5-6 (1999)(to prevent disclosure of commercial or financial information, party must show by specific factual evidence, not conclusory or generalized allegations, that release of requested information would cause that party substantial competitive harm), 552 at 5 (1990) (party must establish *prima facie* case that information is trade secret), 542 at 3 (1990). Accordingly, Tobin's information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Melissa Vela-Martinez
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MVM/sdk

Ref: ID# 202742

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Debra Ravel
Staff Attorney
Railroad Commission of Texas
P.O. Box 12967
Austin, Texas 78711
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Andy Longoria
Tobin International, Ltd.
1355 Central Parkway South, Suite 500
San Antonio, Texas 78232
(w/o enclosures)