



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

July 29, 2004

Ms. Elaine S. Hengen
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
2 Civic Center Plaza, 9th Floor
El Paso, Texas 79901

OR2004-6395

Dear Ms. Hengen:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 206206.

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request regarding physical evidence collected in a specified investigation. In particular, the requestor asks the department to make certain evidentiary objects available for inspection by the requestor's expert. You contend that section 552.101 of the Government Code prohibits the department from allowing access to the evidence at issue. We have considered your claims.

The Public Information Act (the "Act") applies to "public information," defined as "information that is collected, assembled, or maintained under a law or ordinance or in connection with the transaction of official business . . . by a governmental body[.]" Gov't Code § 552.002(a)(1). This office has determined that tangible physical items are not "information" as that term is contemplated under the Act. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision No. 581 (1990). Thus, the "evidentiary objects" to which you refer are not "public information" for purposes of the Act. We therefore conclude that the Act does not require the department to make such evidence available to the requestor in response to the present request. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.002, .021. Because we base our conclusion on section 552.002 of the Government Code, we do not reach your claim under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within thirty calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within ten calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within ten calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within ten calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Tex. Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't

Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within ten calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'D. Saldivar', with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

David R. Saldivar
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

DRS/seg

Ref: ID# 206206

c: Mr. Stewart W. Forbes
Forbes & Forbes
718 Myrtle
El Paso, Texas 79901