ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

August 20, 2004

Mr. Harold Willard
Police Legal Advisor
City of Lubbock
P.O. Box 2000
Lubbock, Texas 79457

OR2004-7127

Dear Mr. Willard:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 207722.

The Lubbock Police Department (the "department") received two requests for information pertaining to incidents between a private citizen and a police officer, including videotapes, and one request for the personnel file of the officer. You state you have provided some of the requested information to the requestors, but claim that the remaining information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.[1]

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 143.089(g) of the Local Government Code. We understand that the City of Lubbock (the "city") is a civil service city under chapter 143 of the Local Government Code. Section 143.089 contemplates two different types of personnel files: a file that must be maintained by the city's civil service director or the director's designee and another file that may be maintained by the city's police department for its own use. Local Gov't Code § 143.089(a), (g). In cases in which a police department investigates a police officer's misconduct and takes disciplinary action against an officer, it is required by section 143.089(a)(2) to place all investigatory

[1]We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

records relating to the investigation and disciplinary action, including background documents such as complaints, witness statements, and documents of like nature from individuals who were not in a supervisory capacity, in the police officer's civil service file maintained under section 143.089(a). *Abbott v. City of Corpus Christi*, 109 S.W.3d 113, 122 (Tex. App.–Austin 2003, no pet.). All investigatory materials in a case resulting in disciplinary action are "from the employing department" when they are held by or in possession of the department because of its investigation into a police officer's misconduct, and the department must forward them to the civil service commission for placement in the civil service personnel file. *Id.* Such records are subject to release under chapter 552 of the Government Code. *See* Local Gov't Code § 143.089(f); Open Records Decision No. 562 at 6 (1990). However, information maintained in a police department's personnel file pursuant to section 143.089(g) is confidential and must not be released. *City of San Antonio v. Tex. Attorney Gen.*, 851 S.W.2d 946, 949 (Tex. App.–Austin 1993, writ denied).

You represent that the information contained in Exhibit E is maintained in the department's personnel files pursuant to section 143.089(g). Therefore, we find that the submitted information in Exhibit E is confidential pursuant to section 143.089(g) of the Local Government Code and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code.[2]

However, the information in Exhibit D consists of offense reports and other records pertaining to the criminal investigation of the incident. Because the department conducted a criminal investigation, this information is also maintained independently, separate and apart from the department's personnel files. The department may not engraft the confidentiality afforded to records under section 143.089(g) to other records that exist independently of the internal affairs investigation. Accordingly, we conclude that the information in Exhibit D is not confidential under section 143.089, and is not excepted from release under section 552.101 on that ground.

You also assert that Exhibit D, as well as the submitted videotape, DVD, and cassette tape, are excepted under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Section 552.108(a)(1) excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime [if] release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime." Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.108(a)(1), (b)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state that this information relates to a pending criminal prosecution. Based upon this representation, we conclude that the release of this information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime.

---

[2]We note that section 143.089(g) requires a police department that receives a request for information maintained in a file under section 143.089(g) to refer the requestor to the civil service director or the director's designee. If you have not already done so, you must refer the requestor to the civil service director at this time.

However, section 552.108 does not except basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). We believe such basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston,* 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.–Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, with the exception of the basic front page offense and arrest information, you may withhold this information from disclosure based on section 552.108(a)(1). We note that you have the discretion to release all or part of the information that is not otherwise confidential by law. Gov't Code § 552.007.

To conclude, the information in Exhibit E is confidential under section 143.089(g) of the Local Government Code and excepted from release under section 552.101 of the Government Code. In addition, all but the basic information in Exhibit D, as well as the submitted videotape, DVD, and cassette tape, are excepted from release under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code; the basic information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

James L. Coggeshall
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JLC/seg

Ref: ID# 207722

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Sabrina G. Forse
KCBD TV
5600 Avenue A
Lubbock, Texas 79404

Mr. Russ Poteet
News Director
KAMC/KLBK
7403 University
Lubbock, Texas 79423
(w/o enclosures)