



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

August 25, 2004

Mr. Gary Allmon Grimes
Schuereberg & Grimes
210 West Main
Mesquite, Texas 75149

OR2004-7278

Dear Mr. Grimes:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 210521.

The Mesquite Independent School District (the "district"), which you represent, received a request for four categories of information pertaining to a named individual and the Poteet girls' basketball program. You state that the district has made some of the responsive information available to the requestor, but claim that some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.026, 552.101 and 552.114 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and have reviewed the information you submitted.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision," and encompasses information protected by other statutes. You indicate that the submitted documentation contains information identifying district students and parents that is confidential pursuant to the Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act of 1974 ("FERPA"). FERPA provides that no federal funds will be made available under any applicable program to an educational agency or institution that releases personally identifiable information, other than directory information, contained in a student's education records to anyone but certain enumerated federal, state, and local officials and institutions, unless otherwise authorized by the student's parent. *See* 20 U.S.C. § 1232g(b)(1); *see also* 34 C.F.R. § 99.3 (defining personally identifiable information). Section 552.026 of the Government Code incorporates

FERPA into chapter 552 of the Government Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 634 at 6-8 (1995). Section 552.026 provides as follows:

This chapter does not require the release of information contained in education records of an educational agency or institution, except in conformity with the Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act of 1974, Sec. 513, Pub. L. No. 93-380, 20 U.S.C. Sec. 1232g.

Gov't Code § 552.026. "Education records" under FERPA are those records that contain information directly related to a student and that are maintained by an educational agency or institution or by a person acting for such agency or institution. *See* 20 U.S.C. § 1232g(a)(4)(A).

Section 552.114(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information in a student record at an educational institution funded wholly or partly by state revenue." This office generally has treated "student record" information under section 552.114(a) as the equivalent of "education record" information that is protected by FERPA. *See* Open Records Decision No. 634 at 5 (1995). FERPA protects information to the extent "reasonable and necessary to avoid personally identifying a particular student," or "one or both parents of such a student." *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 332 (1982), 206 (1978).

In Open Records Decision No. 634 (1995), this office concluded that: (1) an educational agency or institution may withhold from public disclosure information that is protected by FERPA and excepted from required public disclosure by sections 552.026 and 552.101 of the Government Code without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision as to those exceptions, and (2) an educational agency or institution that is state-funded may withhold from public disclosure information that is excepted from required public disclosure by section 552.114 of the Government Code as a "student record," insofar as the "student record" is protected by FERPA, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision as to that exception. *See* Open Records Decision No. 634 at 6-8 (1995). In this instance, as you have submitted information that you contend is confidential under FERPA, we address the applicability of FERPA to the information.

Upon review, we agree that the submitted documents include education records that contain information identifying particular district students and parents. Thus, we agree that information in the submitted documents that personally identifies students and parents is generally confidential under FERPA. In this case, the submitted documents reflect that the present requestor is associated with the district girls basketball program at issue and knows the identities of students identified in the documents. We therefore find that withholding only the names of these students would not suffice to avoid the release of personally identifiable information contained in student education records as mandated by FERPA. Accordingly, we have marked the information in the submitted documents that the district must withhold pursuant to FERPA.

We further note, however, that the requestor has a right of access under FERPA to certain information in the submitted documents that constitutes education records of the requestor's child. Under FERPA, a student's parents have an affirmative right of access to their child's education records, although this right does not extend to information in the student's records that identifies other students. *See* 20 U.S.C. § 1232g(a)(1)(A); 34 C.F.R. § 99.3; *see also* 34 C.F.R. § 99.12(a) ("If the education records of a student contain information on more than one student, the parent or eligible student may inspect and review or be informed of only the specific information about that student."). Some of the information at issue pertains to the requestor's child. We therefore determine that the requestor has the right under FERPA to inspect and review or be informed of such information. However, information pertaining to other students in such records must be withheld under FERPA and has been marked accordingly.

We note that the remaining submitted documents contain account number information that is excepted from disclosure under section 552.136 of the Government Code.¹ Section 552.136 provides in relevant part:

(a) In this section, "access device" means a card, plate, code, account number, personal identification number, electronic serial number, mobile identification number, or other telecommunications service, equipment, or instrument identifier or means of account access that alone or in conjunction with another access device may be used to:

(1) obtain money, goods, services, or another thing of value; or

(2) initiate a transfer of funds other than a transfer originated solely by paper instrument.

(b) Notwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.

Gov't Code § 552.136. The district must withhold the account number information that we have marked pursuant to section 552.136 of the Government Code.

Lastly, we note that the remaining submitted information contains e-mail addresses subject to section 552.137. As amended by the 78th Legislature, this section provides as follows:

¹ The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions like sections 552.136 and 552.137 on behalf of a governmental body but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

(a) Except as otherwise provided by this section, an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body is confidential and not subject to disclosure under this chapter.

(b) Confidential information described by this section that relates to a member of the public may be disclosed if the member of the public affirmatively consents to its release.

(c) Subsection (a) does not apply to an e-mail address:

(1) provided to a governmental body by a person who has a contractual relationship with the governmental body or by the contractor's agent;

(2) provided to a governmental body by a vendor who seeks to contract with the governmental body or by the vendor's agent;

(3) contained in a response to a request for bids or proposals, contained in a response to similar invitations soliciting offers or information relating to a potential contract, or provided to a governmental body in the course of negotiating the terms of a contract or potential contract; or

(4) provided to a governmental body on a letterhead, coversheet, printed document, or other document made available to the public.

(d) Subsection (a) does not prevent a governmental body from disclosing an e-mail address for any reason to another governmental body or to a federal agency.

Gov't Code § 552.137. Section 552.137(a) is applicable to certain e-mail addresses of members of the public that are provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body, unless the individual to whom the e-mail address belongs has affirmatively consented to its public disclosure. Section 552.137(a) is not applicable to the types of e-mail addresses listed in section 552.137(c) or to an institutional e-mail address, an Internet website address, or an e-mail address that a governmental entity maintains for one of its officials or employees. Therefore, the marked e-mail addresses are confidential under section 552.137(a). The district must withhold all such e-mail addresses under section 552.137, unless the owner of a particular e-mail address has affirmatively consented to its public disclosure. We note that the requestor has a special right of access to his own information under section 552.023. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023 (person or person's authorized representative has special right of access to information relating to person and protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests).

In summary, we have marked information in the submitted documents that the district must withhold pursuant to FERPA. We have marked account number information that must be withheld pursuant to section 552.136, and e-mail addresses that must be withheld under section 552.137, unless the owner of a particular e-mail address has affirmatively consented to its public disclosure. The district must release the remaining submitted information to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,


Marc A. Barenblat
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MAB/jh

Ref: ID# 210521

Enc: Submitted documents

c: Mr. Larry Allen
2332 Penrose
Mesquite, Texas 75150
(w/o enclosures)