



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

October 12, 2004

Ms. Luz E. Sandoval Walker
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
2 Civic Center Plaza - 9th Floor
El Paso, Texas 79901

OR2004-8628

Dear Ms. Walker:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 211224.

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for any information regarding a named individual. You state that the department will release a portion of the submitted information to the requestor. However, you claim that the remaining requested information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. Section 261.201(a) of the Family Code provides as follows:

(a) The following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Because the submitted information relates to an investigation of alleged child abuse, it is generally confidential under section 261.201 of the Family Code.

However, in this instance, the requestor is a staff investigator for the State Board of Educator Certification (“SBEC”) and states that SBEC is conducting an investigation of an individual who has applied for or currently holds educator credentials. SBEC has a right of access to some of the information at issue under section 261.201. Information that is confidential under section 261.201 may be disclosed for purposes “consistent with this code and applicable . . . state law.” Section 22.082 of the Education Code provides that “[t]he State Board for Educator Certification shall obtain from any law enforcement or criminal justice agency all criminal history record information [(“CHRI”)] that relates to an applicant for or holder of a certificate.” Educ. Code § 22.082. CHRI consists of “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” Gov’t Code § 411.082(2); *see also* Gov’t Code §§ 411.090 (SBEC is entitled to obtain CHRI from Department of Public Safety about a person who has applied to the board for a certificate under Subchapter B, Chapter 21, Education Code), 411.087(a)(2) (agency that is entitled to obtain CHRI from the DPS is also authorized to “obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state criminal history record information maintained by that [agency]”); *cf. Brookshire v. Houston Indep. Sch. Dist.*, 508 S.W.2d 675, 678-79 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1974, no writ) (when legislature defines term in one statute and uses same term in relation to same subject matter in latter statute, later use of term is same as previously defined). Therefore, if release is for a purpose consistent with the Family Code, the department must release information from the submitted documents to SBEC that shows the type of allegation made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions. *See* Open Records Decision No. 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exceptions to disclosure under the Public Information Act). If release is not consistent with the Family Code, the CHRI and the remainder of the submitted information are confidential under section 261.201 of the Family Code and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code. You state that the department will release information from the submitted documents to this requestor that shows the type of allegation made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions.¹ Therefore, we agree that the

¹We note that because the requestor has a special right of access to this information in this instance, the department must again seek a decision from this office if it receives another request for the same information from another requestor.

department must withhold the remainder of the information pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge

this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



W. Montgomery Meitler
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

WMM/krl

Ref: ID# 211224

Enc: Submitted documents

c: Mr. Scott Byram
Staff Investigator
State Board for Educator Certification
Capitol Station, P. O. Box 12728
Austin, Texas 78711-2548
(w/o enclosures)