



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

October 19, 2004

Mr. Joel K. B. Winful
Assistant District Attorney
Civil Division
Dallas County
411 Elm Street, 5th Floor
Dallas, Texas 75202

OR2004-8895

Dear Mr. Winful:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 211261.

Dallas County (the "county") received a request for the access card information of a named individual for a four-month period. In particular, the requestor states that he "would like to know what time [the individual] is coming into the office in the morning and what time he is leaving in the afternoon." You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Section 552.101 encompasses common law privacy. In Open Records Decision No. 169 (1977), this office recognized that information that would ordinarily be subject to disclosure may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common law privacy on a showing of "special circumstances." See Open Records Decision No. 123 (1976). In that decision, the employees demonstrated that their lives would be placed in danger if their addresses were released to the public. ORD 169 at 7. This office further noted that the initial determination of credible threats and safety concerns should be made by the governmental body to which a request for disclosure is directed, and this office will determine whether a governmental body has demonstrated the existence of special

circumstances on a case-by-case basis. *Id.* We noted, however, that “special circumstances” do not include “a generalized and speculative fear of harassment or retribution.” *Id.* at 6.

You inform us that the individual whose records were requested drives the county Sheriff to and from work. Further, you assert that the release of the requested information would reveal the specific entrance and exit locations used by the Sheriff, as well as the arrival and departure times of the Sheriff. You have also provided an affidavit from Chief Deputy Larry Forsyth stating that threats have been made against the Sheriff and expressing concern that release of the requested information would enable “individuals to plan an attack on the Sheriff based upon [access to the Sheriff’s] habits and patterns.” Based on these representations and our review of the submitted information, we conclude the county has demonstrated the existence of special circumstances. Accordingly, the county must withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common law privacy.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov’t Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body’s intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



James L. Coggeshall
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JLC/seg

Ref: ID# 211261

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Jon Alexis
5930 Junius
Dallas, Texas 75214
(w/o enclosures)