



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

October 20, 2004

Mr. Mark G. Mann  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of Garland  
P.O. Box 469002  
Garland, Texas 75046-9002

OR2004-8941

Dear Mr. Mann:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 211110.

The Garland Police Department (the "department") received a request for thirty specific police reports. You state that you have released some of the requested information, but you claim that the remaining information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime [if] release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime." Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.108(a)(1), 552.301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You inform us that the information you seek to withhold under section 552.108 pertains to ongoing investigations. We therefore believe that release of the yellow highlighted information in the submitted reports "would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime." *See* Gov't Code 552.108(a)(1). Thus, you may

withhold this information under section 552.108(a)(1).<sup>1</sup> We note that you have the discretion to release all or part of the information protected by section 552.108 that is not otherwise confidential by law. Gov't Code § 552.007.

Section 552.101 excepts "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common law privacy. Common law privacy protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Industrial Found. v. Texas Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976), *cert. denied*, 430 U.S. 931 (1977). The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. 540 S.W.2d at 683. In addition, this office has found that the following types of information are excepted from required public disclosure under common law privacy: an individual's criminal history when compiled by a governmental body, *see* Open Records Decision No. 565 (citing *United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749 (1989)); personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992), 545 (1990); some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps); and identities of victims of sexual abuse, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 440 (1986), 393 (1983), 339 (1982). With respect to report number 2003R018231, we agree that the privacy right of the individual to whom the report pertains is implicated, but it is not necessary to withhold all the information highlighted in pink in order to protect this individual's privacy. We have marked the information in report number 2003R018231 that must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common law privacy.

Common law privacy is also implicated when an individual's criminal history information is compiled by a governmental entity. You contend that the criminal history information highlighted in orange is protected by common law privacy. In this instance, however, the information highlighted in orange was obtained from the National Crime Information Center ("NCIC") database, and its release is therefore governed by chapter 411 of the Government Code.

---

<sup>1</sup> As our ruling under section 552.108 encompasses the orange highlighted information found in report number 2002R011373, we do not address your section 552.101 claim against disclosure as it applies to this report.

Criminal history record information (“CHRI”) obtained from the National Crime Information Center (the “NCIC”) or the Texas Crime Information Center (the “TCIC”) is confidential under federal and state law. Federal law governs the dissemination of CHRI obtained from the NCIC network. Federal regulations prohibit the release to the general public of CHRI that is maintained in state and local CHRI systems. *See* 28 C.F.R. § 20.21(c)(1) (“Use of criminal history record information disseminated to noncriminal justice agencies shall be limited to the purpose for which it was given”) and (c)(2) (“No agency or individual shall confirm the existence or nonexistence of criminal history record information to any person or agency that would not be eligible to receive the information itself”); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 565 at 10-12 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its own individual law with respect to CHRI that it generates. *See id.* at 10-12. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) of the Government Code authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.089(b). Thus, CHRI generated by the federal government or another state may be disclosed only in accordance with the federal regulations. Likewise, CHRI held by the Texas Department of Public Safety (the “DPS”) or another criminal justice agency must be withheld from the public as provided by subchapter F of chapter 411 of the Government Code.

The information highlighted in orange, however, is releasable under section 411.081(b). Section 411.081(b) allows a police department to disclose to the public CHRI “that is related to the offense for which a person is involved in the criminal justice system.” Gov’t Code § 411.081(b). Because the information pertains to outstanding charges for which the individuals at issue are currently involved in the criminal justice system, we conclude that the department may not withhold the information highlighted in orange under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the federal regulations or subchapter F of chapter 411 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses 58.007 of the Family Code. Section 58.007 provides that juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997 are confidential. *See* Fam. Code § 58.007. Section 58.007 states in pertinent part:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are

separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapter B.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). Based on your arguments and our review of report number 2003R033727, we agree that this report constitutes juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997. It does not appear that any exceptions to confidentiality apply in this instance. Accordingly, we conclude that the department must withhold report number 2003R033727 pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.

We note that the submitted information contains social security numbers. A social security number may be excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 in conjunction with the 1990 amendments to the federal Social Security Act, 42 U.S.C. § 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I). *See* Open Records Decision No. 622 (1994). These amendments make confidential social security numbers and related records that are obtained and maintained by a state agency or political subdivision of the state pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. *See id.* In this case, we have no basis for concluding that any of the social security numbers in the reports are confidential under section 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I), and therefore excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 on the basis of that federal provision. We caution, however, that section 552.352 of the Public Information Act imposes criminal penalties for the release of confidential information. Prior to releasing any social security number information, you should ensure that no such information was obtained or is maintained by the department pursuant to any provision of law, enacted on or after October 1, 1990.

Finally, the department asserts the information highlighted in green is excepted from disclosure under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 provides in relevant part:

(a) Information is excepted from the requirement of Section 552.021 if the information relates to:

(1) a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state; [or]

(2) a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state[.]

Thus, the department must withhold the Texas driver's license, license plate, and vehicle identification numbers highlighted in green under section 552.130. The remaining green

highlighted information we have marked is not protected under section 552.130, and thus this information must be released to the requestor.

In summary, we conclude the following: (1) the yellow highlighted information may be withheld from disclosure under section 552.108; (2) we have marked the information in report number 2003R018231 that must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common law privacy; (3) report number 2003R033727 must be withheld in its entirety under section 552.101 in conjunction with 58.007 of the Family Code; (4) social security numbers may be confidential under federal law; and (5) except for the information we have marked, the green highlighted information must be withheld from disclosure under section 552.130. The remaining information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Caroline E. Cho  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

CEC/sdk

Ref: ID# 211110

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. R. Christopher Cowan  
The Cowan Law Firm  
4144 North Central Expressway, Suite 370  
Dallas, Texas 75204  
(w/o enclosures)