



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

November 9, 2004

Ms. Cynthia Villarreal-Reyna
Agency Counsel Section Chief
Legal and Compliance Division, MC 110-1A
Texas Department of Insurance
P.O. Box 149104
Austin, Texas 78714-9104

OR2004-9544

Dear Ms. Villarreal-Reyna:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 212622.

The Texas Department of Insurance (the "department") received a request for "residential property and personal automobile insurance rate filings [for rates that will become effective] on or after December 1, 2004." You claim that the cover letter and transmittal sheet that are part of the filing at issue contain information that is excepted from disclosure under section 552.137 of the Government Code. While the department takes no position regarding whether the remaining information at issue should be withheld, you state, and provide documentation showing, that the department notified United Services Automobile Association ("USAA") and Geico Indemnity Company ("Geico") of the request and of their right to submit arguments to this office as to why the information should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (determining that statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception to disclosure under Act in certain circumstances). We have reviewed the claimed exceptions and the submitted information.

We note that an interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice under section 552.305(d) to submit its reasons, if any, as to why requested information relating to that party should be withheld from disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B). As of the date of this letter, Geico has not submitted any

comments to this office explaining how release of the requested information would affect its proprietary interests. Therefore, Geico has provided us with no basis to conclude that it has protected proprietary interests in any of the submitted information. *See, e.g.*, Gov't Code § 552.110(b) (to prevent disclosure of commercial or financial information, party must show by specific factual or evidentiary material, not conclusory or generalized allegations, that it actually faces competition and that substantial competitive injury would likely result from disclosure); Open Records Decision Nos. 639 at 4 (1996), 552 at 5 (1990) (party must establish *prima facie* case that information is trade secret), 542 at 3 (1990). Thus, information pertaining to Geico may not be withheld from disclosure under section 552.110 of the Government Code.

USAA has submitted comments to this office in which the company argues that certain information in filings to the department is excepted from disclosure under section 552.110 of the Government Code. In its comments, USAA objects to disclosure of filings related to "territorial information [which] includes territory boundary definitions, differentials, and maps." We note, however, that the department has not submitted such information for review. This ruling does not address the applicability of USAA's claimed exceptions for information that has not been submitted for our review by the department. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(e)(1)(D) (governmental body seeking attorney general's opinion under the Act must submit a copy or representative samples of the specific information requested). As USAA does not seek to withhold any of the remaining submitted information pertaining to it, the department must release this information, with the following exception.

Section 552.137 of the Government Code provides:

(a) Except as otherwise provided by this section, an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body is confidential and not subject to disclosure under this chapter.

(b) Confidential information described by this section that relates to a member of the public may be disclosed if the member of the public affirmatively consents to its release.

(c) Subsection (a) does not apply to an e-mail address:

(1) provided to a governmental body by a person who has a contractual relationship with the governmental body or by the contractor's agent;

(2) provided to a governmental body by a vendor who seeks to contract with the governmental body or by the vendor's agent;

(3) contained in a response to a request for bids or proposals, contained in a response to similar invitations soliciting offers or information relating to a potential contract, or provided to a governmental body in the course of negotiating the terms of a contract or potential contract; or

(4) provided to a governmental body on a letterhead, coversheet, printed document, or other document made available to the public.

(d) Subsection (a) does not prevent a governmental body from disclosing an e-mail address for any reason to another governmental body or to a federal agency.

Gov't Code § 552.137. Section 552.137 requires a governmental body to withhold certain e-mail addresses of members of the public that are provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with the governmental body, unless the relevant members of the public have affirmatively consented to the release of the e-mail addresses. The department states that it has not received consent to release the e-mail addresses at issue. Accordingly, we have marked the e-mail addresses in the submitted information that the department must withhold pursuant to section 552.137 of the Government Code.

In summary, we have marked e-mail addresses that must be withheld under section 552.137 of the Government Code. The remainder of the submitted information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the

governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877)673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512)475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Cindy Nettles
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CN/jh

Ref: ID# 212622
Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Ware Wendell
Policy Director, Texas Watch
Suite 108
1300 Guadalupe
Austin, Texas 78701
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Robert George Davis
United Services Auto Association
9800 Fredericksburg Road
San Antonio, Texas 78288
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Cynthia Dodd Smith
Senior Counsel
United Services Automobile Association
USAA Texas Lloyds Company
9800 Fredericksburg Road
San Antonio, Texas 78288
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Olga Minor Nicely
Geico Indemnity Company
One Geico Plaza
Washington, D.C. 20047
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. James G. Brown
4201 Spring Valley Road
Dallas, Texas 75244
Attorney for service for Geico
(w/o enclosures)