ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

December 14, 2004

Ms. Luz E. Sandoval Walker
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
2 Civic Center Plaza, 9th Floor
El Paso, Texas 79901

OR2004-10573

Dear Ms. Walker:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 215502.

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received seven requests for information related to a specified murder investigation. You state that some of the requested information has been released. You claim that the remaining requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.117, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

We first address your arguments for the submitted complaint report. You state that some of the information contained within the complaint report is excepted under section 552.117 of the Government Code. Section 552.117(a)(4) excepts from disclosure the home address, home telephone number, personal pager and cell phone numbers, social security number, and family member information of a peace officer who was killed in the line of duty, regardless of whether the deceased complied with Section 552.024 or 552.1175. Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(4). Section 552.117(a)(4) adopts the definition of peace officer found at article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. We have reviewed the submitted complaint report and marked the information that is excepted under section 552.117(a)(4).

You also argue that a portion of the submitted information is excepted under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 prohibits the release of information that relates to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state or a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state. *See* Gov't Code

§ 552.130. We have reviewed the submitted information and agree that the department must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.130.

Finally, you note that the submitted information contains a social security number. Social security numbers must be withheld in some circumstances under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the 1990 amendments to the federal Social Security Act, 42 U.S.C. § 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I).[1] *See* Open Records Decision No. 622 (1994). These amendments make confidential social security numbers and related records that are obtained or maintained by a state agency or political subdivision of the state pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. *See id.* We have no basis for concluding that the social security number at issue is confidential under section 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I), and therefore excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 of the Public Information Act (the "Act") on the basis of that federal provision. We caution, however, that section 552.352 of the Act imposes criminal penalties for the release of confidential information. Prior to releasing any social security number information, you should ensure that no such information was obtained or is maintained by the department pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990.

We now address your argument under section 552.108 of the Government Code for the remaining submitted information. Section 552.108(a)(1) excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime." Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977).

You state that the submitted information relates to a pending criminal investigation. Based on this representation, we conclude that release of this information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases). Accordingly, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information we have marked.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). We believe such basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*, including a detailed description of the offense. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 185; *see also* Open Records Decision

---

[1]Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information made confidential by other statutes.

No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information made public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, with the exception of basic information, you may withhold the information we have marked under section 552.108(a)(1). Although section 552.108 authorizes the department to withhold the remainder of the marked information, you may choose to release all or part of this information that is not otherwise confidential by law.[2] *See* Gov't Code § 552.007.

In summary, we conclude the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(4) and the information you have marked under section 552.130. A social security number may be confidential under federal law. The department may withhold the information we have marked under section 552.108, except for basic information, which must be released. The remaining submitted information must also be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

---

[2]Because our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments, except to note that basic information described in *Houston Chronicle* does not include information covered by section 552.130.

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

Sarah I. Swanson
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

SIS/krl

Ref: ID# 215502

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Carl Jones
KVIA
4140 Rio Bravo
El Paso, Texas 79902
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Daniel Borunda
El Paso Times
P. O. Box 20
El Paso, Texas 79999
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Tammy Fonce-Olivas
El Paso Times
P. O. Box 20
El Paso, Texas 7999
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Jeff Martin
Board of Nurse Examiners for the State of Texas
333 Guadalupe Street, Suite 3-460
Austin, Texas 78701
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Monica Balderrama
KFOX
6004 N. Mesa
El Paso, Texas 9912
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Laurel Chavez
Ward North America
4141 Pinnacle Street, Suite 308
El Paso, Texas 79902
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Lizbeth Licon
KDBC
2201 E. Wyoming
El Paso, Texas 79903
(w/o enclosures)