



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

December 15, 2004

Ms. Ashley D. Fourt
Assistant District Attorney
Tarrant County
401 West Belknap
Fort Worth, Texas 76196-0201

OR2004-10618

Dear Ms. Fourt:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 215561.

The Tarrant County Sheriff's Department (the "department") received a request for reports made from October 11, 2002 to December 30, 2003 pertaining to a certain address. The department has released some information but claims the two offense reports in Exhibit B are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered your claimed exceptions to disclosure and have reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. Section 261.201(a) of the Family Code provides as follows:

(a) The following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Because offense report number 2003-03347 was used or developed in an investigation of child abuse, the information is within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. You have not indicated that the department has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information. Therefore, we assume that no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, the department must withhold offense report number 2003-03347 from disclosure pursuant to section 261.201 of the Family Code.¹ *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute). Offense report number 2003-09489 does not pertain to an investigation under chapter 261 of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect. Thus, the department may not withhold offense report number 2003-09489 under section 261.201.

The department also asserts the report is confidential under section 58.007 of the Family Code. Section 58.007 makes certain juvenile law enforcement records confidential. Family Code section 51.04(a) states that the Juvenile Justice Code, Title 3 of the Family Code, “covers the proceedings in all cases involving the delinquent conduct or conduct indicating the need for supervision engaged in by a person who was a child within the meaning of [Title 3] at the time he engaged in the conduct.” Thus, section 58.007 deems confidential law enforcement records from all cases involving a child engaging in delinquent conduct or conduct indicating the need for supervision. A “child” is a person who is

(A) ten years of age or older and under 17 years of age; or

(B) seventeen years of age or older and under 18 years of age who is alleged or found to have engaged in delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision as a result of acts committed before becoming 17 years of age.

Fam. Code § 51.02(1). Here, the offender was seventeen years of age when he committed the offense. Thus, section 58.007 does not apply to offense report number 2003-09489. The department must release this report.

Lastly, we note that the department states it has released Exhibit C to the requestor. However, the department has redacted some information from Exhibit C and has not asked this office for a decision on whether it may withhold the redacted information as required by

¹Because section 261.201 is dispositive, we do not address the department’s other claims.

section 552.301(a) of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(a). Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the information is public and must be released. Information that is presumed public must be released unless a governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information to overcome this presumption. *See Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to Gov't Code § 552.302); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). This office has held that a compelling reason exists to withhold information when the information is confidential by another source of law. *See* Open Records Decision No. 150 (1977) (presumption of openness overcome by a showing that the information is made confidential by another source of law or affects third party interests). Some of the redacted information in Exhibit C is confidential.

The fingerprints are subject to sections 559.001, 559.002, and 559.003 of the Government Code. They provide as follows:

Sec. 559.001. DEFINITIONS. In this chapter:

- (1) "Biometric identifier" means a retina or iris scan, fingerprint, voiceprint, or record of hand or face geometry.
- (2) "Governmental body" has the meaning assigned by Section 552.003 [of the Government Code], except that the term includes each entity within or created by the judicial branch of state government.

Sec. 559.002. DISCLOSURE OF BIOMETRIC IDENTIFIER. A governmental body that possesses a biometric identifier of an individual:

- (1) may not sell, lease, or otherwise disclose the biometric identifier to another person unless:
 - (A) the individual consents to the disclosure;
 - (B) the disclosure is required or permitted by a federal statute or by a state statute other than Chapter 552 [of the Government Code]; or
 - (C) the disclosure is made by or to a law enforcement agency for a law enforcement purpose; and

(2) shall store, transmit, and protect from disclosure the biometric identifier using reasonable care and in a manner that is the same as or more protective than the manner in which the governmental body stores, transmits, and protects its other confidential information.

Sec. 559.003. APPLICATION OF CHAPTER 552. A biometric identifier in the possession of a governmental body is exempt from disclosure under Chapter 552.

It does not appear to this office that section 559.002 permits the disclosure of the submitted fingerprints. Therefore, the department must withhold the fingerprints under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 559.003 of the Government Code.

Two of the reports pertain to juvenile conduct. Thus, we have marked the reports that are confidential under section 58.007 of the Family Code.

Exhibit C includes a social security number that may be excepted from required public disclosure under section 552.101 of the act in conjunction with the 1990 amendments to the federal Social Security Act, 42 U.S.C. § 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I), if it was obtained or is maintained by a governmental body pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. *See* Open Records Decision No. 622 (1994). These amendments make confidential social security numbers and related records that are obtained and maintained by a state agency or political subdivision of the state pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. *See id.* We have no basis for concluding that any of the social security numbers in the file are confidential under section 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I), and therefore excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 on the basis of that federal provision. We caution, however, that section 552.352 of the Public Information Act imposes criminal penalties for the release of confidential information. Prior to releasing the social security number, you should ensure that no such information was obtained or is maintained by the department pursuant to any provision of law, enacted on or after October 1, 1990.

In addition, the Texas driver's license numbers the department has redacted are excepted from disclosure under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 excepts from disclosure information relating to a Texas driver's license. Thus, the department must withhold the Texas driver's license numbers under section 552.130.

Lastly, the department redacted phone numbers and addresses. However, the department does not explain why this information is confidential as required by section 552.301(e) of the Government Code. Thus, the department must release the phone numbers and addresses. *See* Gov't Code § 552.302.

In summary, the department must withhold offense report number 2003-03347 from disclosure pursuant to section 261.201 of the Family Code, the marked report under section

58.007 of the Family Code, the Texas driver's license numbers under section 552.130, and the fingerprints under section 559.003 of the Government Code. The social security number may be confidential under the Social Security Act. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Tex. Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Yen-Ha Le".

Yen-Ha Le
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

YHL/sdk

Ref: ID# 215561

Enc: Marked documents

c: Ms. Cindy Hedgpeth
7813 Sommerville Place Road
Fort Worth, Texas 76135
(w/o enclosures)