



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

December 28, 2004

Mr. John T. Patterson
Assistant City Attorney
City of Waco
P.O. Box 2570
Waco, Texas 76702-2570

OR2004-10843

Dear Mr. Patterson:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 215746.

The Waco Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to reports #02-024078, #02-040736, #02-027907, and #02-047492. You state that the department has released most of the requested information to the requestor and claim that portions of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common law privacy. Common law privacy protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976), *cert. denied*, 430 U.S. 931 (1977). The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. 540 S.W.2d at 683. This office has determined that other types of information are also private under section 552.101. *See Open*

Records Decision Nos. 659 at 4-5 (1999) (summarizing information held to be private), 470 at 4 (1987) (illness from severe emotional job-related stress), 455 at 9 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps), 343 at 1-2 (1982) (references in emergency medical records to drug overdose, acute alcohol intoxication, obstetrical/gynecological illness, convulsions/seizures, or emotional/mental distress). The submitted documents contain information that is considered highly intimate or embarrassing and is not of legitimate concern to the public. We have marked the information that must be withheld from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common law privacy.

Social security numbers may be withheld in some circumstances under section 552.101 of the Government Code. A social security number or "related record" may be excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 in conjunction with the 1990 amendments to the federal Social Security Act, 42 U.S.C. § 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I). *See* Open Records Decision No. 622 (1994). These amendments make confidential social security numbers and related records that are obtained and maintained by a state agency or political subdivision of the state pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. *See id.* We have no basis for concluding that any of the social security numbers in the file are confidential under section 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I), and therefore excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 on the basis of that federal provision. We caution, however, that section 552.352 of the Public Information Act imposes criminal penalties for the release of confidential information. Prior to releasing any social security number, you should ensure that no such information was obtained or is maintained by the department pursuant to any provision of law, enacted on or after October 1, 1990. Also, we note that the purpose of this provision is to protect the privacy interests of individuals. Since the right of privacy lapses at death, the department may not withhold the social security number of the deceased individual contained in the submitted documents. *See generally Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enters. Inc.*, 589 S.W.2d 489 (Tex. Civ. App.—Texarkana 1979, writ ref'd n.r.e.); *Justice v. Belo Broadcasting Corp.*, 472 F. Supp. 145, 146-47 (N.D. Tex. 1979); Attorney General Opinions JM-229 (1984); H-917 (1976); Open Records Decision No. 272 at 1 (1981) (privacy rights lapse upon death).

You also assert that the submitted fingerprint information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with sections 559.001, 559.002, and 559.003 of the Government Code. Please note that the 78th Legislature renumbered chapter 559 of the Government Code as chapter 560 of the Government Code. Acts 2003, 78th Leg., ch. 1275, § 2(78). Therefore, we address your argument under chapter 560 of the Government Code. Sections 560.001, 560.002, and 560.003 provide as follows:

Sec. 560.001. DEFINITIONS. In this chapter:

- (1) "Biometric identifier" means a retina or iris scan, fingerprint, voiceprint, or record of hand or face geometry.

(2) "Governmental body" has the meaning assigned by Section 552.003 [of the Government Code], except that the term includes each entity within or created by the judicial branch of state government.

Sec. 560.002. DISCLOSURE OF BIOMETRIC IDENTIFIER. A governmental body that possesses a biometric identifier of an individual:

(1) may not sell, lease, or otherwise disclose the biometric identifier to another person unless:

(A) the individual consents to the disclosure;

(B) the disclosure is required or permitted by a federal statute or by a state statute other than Chapter 552 [of the Government Code]; or

(C) the disclosure is made by or to a law enforcement agency for a law enforcement purpose; and

(2) shall store, transmit, and protect from disclosure the biometric identifier using reasonable care and in a manner that is the same as or more protective than the manner in which the governmental body stores, transmits, and protects its other confidential information.

Sec. 560.003. APPLICATION OF CHAPTER 552. A biometric identifier in the possession of a governmental body is exempt from disclosure under Chapter 552.

Gov't Code §§ 560.001-.003. Upon review, we find section 560.002 does not permit the disclosure of the submitted fingerprint information in this instance. Therefore, the department must withhold the highlighted fingerprint information under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure information that relates to:

(1) a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state;

(2) a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state; or

- (3) a personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or a local agency authorized to issue an identification document.

Gov't Code § 552.130(a). We agree that the department must be withhold the information it has highlighted as excepted under section 552.130. Please note, however, that the purpose of section 552.130 is to protect the privacy interests of individuals. Since the right of privacy lapses at death, the department may not withhold the Texas driver's license number contained in the submitted documents that pertains to a deceased individual. *See generally Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enters. Inc.*, 589 S.W.2d 489 (Tex. Civ. App.—Texarkana 1979, writ ref'd n.r.e.); *Justice v. Belo Broadcasting Corp.*, 472 F. Supp. 145, 146-47 (N.D. Tex. 1979); Attorney General Opinions JM-229 (1984); H-917 (1976); Open Records Decision No. 272 at 1 (1981) (privacy rights lapse upon death).

In summary, the department must withhold the information we have marked as excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common law privacy. The highlighted fingerprint information must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with chapter 560 of the Government Code. Any social security number related to a living person that was obtained and maintained by the department pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990 must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with 42 U.S.C. § 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I). The department must also withhold the highlighted Texas motor vehicle and driver's license information under section 552.130 of the Government Code. It may not withhold the submitted Texas driver's license number of the deceased individual. The remaining information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public

records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Amanda Crawford
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

AEC/sdk

Ref: ID# 215746

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Tommy Witherspoon
Tribune Herald
900 Franklin
Waco, Texas 76701-1906
(w/o enclosures)