



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

December 28, 2004

Ms. Mia Settle-Vinson
Assistant City Attorney
City of Houston
P. O. Box 1562
Houston, TX 77251-1562

OR2004-10848

Dear Ms. Settle-Vinson:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 215393.

The Houston Police Department (the "department") received a request for all information pertaining to seven addresses. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.103, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. Section 261.201(a) of the Family Code provides as follows:

(a) The following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

- (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and
- (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Because Exhibits 3, 14, and 16 consist of files, reports, records, communications, or working papers used or developed in an investigation under chapter 261, the information is within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. You inform our office that the department has not adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information. Therefore, Exhibits 3, 14, and 16 are confidential pursuant to section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute). Accordingly, the department must withhold Exhibits 3, 14, and 16 from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code as information made confidential by law.¹ Furthermore, because section 261.201(a) protects all “files, reports, communications, and working papers” related to an investigation of child abuse, the department must not release front page offense report information in cases of alleged child abuse.

Section 552.101 also encompasses Family Code section 58.007. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997 are confidential under section 58.007. The relevant language of section 58.007(c) reads as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapter B.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). Exhibits 13 and 15 involve juvenile conduct that occurred after September 1, 1997. It does not appear that any of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply. Therefore, Exhibits 13 and 15 are confidential pursuant to section 58.007(c) of the Family Code and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

We now turn to your argument under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Section 552.108(a)(1) excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement

¹We note, however, that if the Texas Department of Family and Protective Services has created a file on this alleged abuse, the child’s parent(s) may have the statutory right to review that file. *See* Fam. Code § 261.201(g); Act of June 2, 2003, 78th Leg., R.S., ch. 198, § 1.27, 2003 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 611, 641 (“A reference in law to the Department of Protective and Regulatory Service means the Department of Family and Protective Services.”).

agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime.” Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See* Gov’t Code §§ 552.108(a)(1), (b)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state that Exhibits 2, 4, 7, and 17 relate to inactive criminal investigations. You also state that the statute of limitations has not run in any of these cases and “the investigations may be reactivated once additional leads are developed.” Based upon this representation, we conclude that the release of these offense reports would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases).

Section 552.108(a)(2) excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate that the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. Based on the information you provided, we understand you to assert that Exhibits 5, 6, 9, and 12 pertain to cases that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Therefore, we agree that section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). We believe such basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*, including a detailed description of the offense. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 185; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information made public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, you must release the types of information that are considered to be front page offense report information, even if this information is not actually located on the front page of the offense report. Although section 552.108 authorizes you to withhold the remaining information in Exhibits 2, 4, 5, 6, 7, 9, 12, and 17 from disclosure, you may choose to release all or part of this information that is not otherwise confidential by law. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.007.²

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common law privacy. Common law privacy protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indust. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976), *cert. denied*, 430 U.S. 931 (1977). The

²Generally, basic information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976), is not excepted from public disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code. Open Records Decision No. 597 (1991). We therefore need not address your argument under section 552.103.

types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. In addition, this office has found that the following types of information are excepted from required public disclosure under common law privacy: an individual's criminal history when compiled by a governmental body, *see* Open Records Decision No. 565 (citing *United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749 (1989)); personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992), 545 (1990); some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps); and identities of victims of sexual abuse, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 440 (1986), 393 (1983), 339 (1982). We have marked the type of information in Exhibits 5 and 11 that must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common law privacy. After considering your arguments and reviewing Exhibit 8, we conclude that there is no information in Exhibit 8 protected by section 552.101 in conjunction with common law privacy.

We finally consider your argument under section 552.130 for the remaining information, Exhibits 10 and 18. Section 552.130 provides in relevant part:

(a) Information is excepted from the requirement of Section 552.021 if the information relates to:

(1) a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state; [or]

(2) a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state[.]

Gov't Code § 552.130. You must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information that we have marked in Exhibit 10. We note, however, that section 552.130 protects privacy interests, and thus this section is not applicable to the Texas driver's license and motor vehicle information of an individual who is deceased. *See Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enters., Inc.*, 589 S.W.2d 489, 491 (Tex. App.—Texarkana 1979, writ ref'd n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 272 at 1 (1981) (right of privacy lapses at death). Therefore, you must release the Texas motor vehicle record information in Exhibit 18.

We note that Exhibit 18 contains a social security number of a living individual.³ Social security numbers may be withheld in some circumstances under section 552.101 of the Government Code. A social security number or "related record" may be excepted from

³Federal law protecting social security numbers is privacy based and does not protect the interests of a dead person. *See Moore*, 589 S.W.2d 489; ORD 272.

disclosure under section 552.101 in conjunction with the 1990 amendments to the federal Social Security Act, 42 U.S.C. § 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I). *See* Open Records Decision No. 622 (1994). These amendments make confidential social security numbers and related records that are obtained and maintained by a state agency or political subdivision of the state pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. *See id.* We have no basis for concluding that the social security number in Exhibit 18 is confidential under section 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I), and therefore excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 on the basis of that federal provision. We caution, however, that section 552.352 of the Act imposes criminal penalties for the release of confidential information. Prior to releasing any social security number information, you should ensure that no such information was obtained or is maintained by the department pursuant to any provision of law, enacted on or after October 1, 1990.

In summary, Exhibits 3, 14, and 16 must be withheld in their entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. Exhibits 13 and 15 must also be withheld in their entirety under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. Section 552.108 authorizes you to withhold Exhibits 2, 4, 5, 6, 7, 9, 12, and 17, but you must release basic information from these exhibits. The information marked in Exhibits 5 and 11 must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with the doctrine of common law privacy. The marked motor vehicle record information in Exhibit 10 must be withheld under section 552.130. The marked social security number in Exhibit 18 may be confidential under federal law. The remaining submitted information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the

governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Elizabeth A. Stephens
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

EAS/krl

Ref: ID#215393

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. David S. Siegel
Susman Godfrey L.L.P.
1000 Louisiana, Suite 5100
Houston, TX 77002-5096
(w/o enclosures)