



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

April 29, 2005

Ms. Sandra Smith
Executive Director
Texas Board of Chiropractic Examiners
333 Guadalupe, Suite 3-825
Austin, Texas 78701-3942

OR2005-03695

Dear Ms. Smith:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code, the Public Information Act (the "Act"). Your request was assigned ID# 223029.

The Texas Board of Chiropractic Examiners (the "board") received a request for all files related to a named chiropractor. You state that the board will provide the requestor with some of the requested information. However, you claim that portions of the requested information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.026, 552.101, 552.114, 552.130, 552.136, and 552.137 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we address the board's obligations under section 552.301 of the Government Code. Subsections 552.301(a) and (b) provide:

(a) A governmental body that receives a written request for information that it wishes to withhold from public disclosure and that it considers to be within one of the [act's] exceptions . . . must ask for a decision from the attorney general about whether the information is within that exception if there has not been a previous determination about whether the information falls within one of the exceptions.

(b) The governmental body must ask for the attorney general's decision and state the exceptions that apply within a reasonable time but not later than the 10th business day after the date of receiving the written request.

Gov't Code § 552.301(a), (b). You state that the board received the instant request on February 4, 2005. You did not request a decision from this office until February 23, 2005. Consequently, you failed to request a decision within the ten business day period mandated by section 552.301. Because the request for a decision was not timely submitted, the requested information is presumed to be public information. Gov't Code § 552.302.

In order to overcome the presumption that the requested information is public information, a governmental body must provide compelling reasons why the information should not be disclosed. *Id.*; *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381 (Tex. App.--Austin 1990, no writ); *see* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). Because sections 552.026, 552.101, 552.114, 552.130, 552.136, and 552.137 of the Government Code can provide compelling reasons to overcome the presumption of openness, we will address your arguments.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. The Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act of 1974 ("FERPA") provides that no federal funds will be made available under any applicable program to an educational agency or institution that releases personally identifiable information (other than directory information) contained in a student's education records to anyone but certain enumerated federal, state, and local officials and institutions, unless otherwise authorized by the student's parent.¹ *See* 20 U.S.C. § 1232g(b)(1). "Education records" means those records that contain information directly related to a student and are maintained by an educational agency or institution or by a person acting for such agency or institution. *Id.* § 1232g(a)(4)(A). The board is not an educational agency or institution.

However, FERPA provides that an educational agency or institution may only transfer personal information to a third party "on the condition that such party will not permit any other party to have access to such information without the written consent of the parents of the student." *Id.* § 1232g(b)(4)(B). The federal regulations provide that a third party that receives such information from an educational agency may use the information only for the purposes for which the disclosure was made. 34 C.F.R. § 99.33(a)(2). You state that the board received the submitted transcripts directly from the educational institutions. Consequently, pursuant to sections 1232g(b)(4)(B) and 99.33(a)(2), the board may only release these transcripts upon consent of the named chiropractor.

¹Section 552.026 of the Government Code provides that "[t]his chapter does not require the release of information contained in education records of an educational agency or institution, except in conformity with [FERPA]." Gov't Code § 552.026. Section 552.114 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure student records at an educational institution funded completely or in part by state revenue. This office generally applies the same analysis under section 552.114 and FERPA. *See* Open Records Decision No. 539 (1990).

We note that the submitted transcripts, as well as the submitted facility application forms, contain the chiropractor's social security number. Section 58.001 of the Occupations Code provides as follows:

The social security number of an applicant for or holder of a license, certificate of registration, or other legal authorization issued by a licensing agency to practice in a specific occupation or profession that is provided to the licensing agency is confidential and not subject to disclosure under Chapter 552, Government Code.

Occ. Code § 58.001. Accordingly, we find that the licensee's social security number is confidential under section 58.001 of the Occupations Code and thus must be withheld from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

You contend that the information submitted as Exhibit E is confidential under section 201.206 of the Occupations Code. This section provides in part:

(a) The board's investigation files are confidential, privileged, and not subject to discovery, subpoena, or any other means of legal compulsion for release other than to the board or an employee or agent of the board.

...

(d) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), the board may:

(1) disclose a complaint to the affected license holder; and

(2) provide to a complainant the license holder's response to the complaint, if providing the response is considered by the board to be necessary to investigate the complaint.

Occ. Code § 201.206(a), (d). Section 201.206 was added to the Occupations Code by the Seventy-eighth Legislature and applies to "a complaint or investigation pending on [September 1, 2003] or filed on or after that date." Act of May 29, 2003, 78th Leg., R.S., ch. 329, § 7(b), 2003 Tex. Gen. Laws 1405, 1407. We find that the information submitted as Exhibit E consists of an investigation file that comes within the scope of section 201.206 of the Occupations Code. We therefore agree that the board must withhold Exhibit E in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common law privacy. Common law privacy protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex.*

Indus. Accident Bd., 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. This office has found that personal financial information not relating to the financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is protected by common law privacy. See Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992), 545 (1990). Additionally, this office generally concludes that ownership percentages reflect personal financial information. However, where an individual holds a one hundred percent interest in a business, the information simply reflects that the individual owns his own business. Thus, we find that this information is not highly intimate or embarrassing for purposes of the common law right to privacy, and the board may not withhold it under section 552.101 on that ground.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code prohibits the release of information that relates to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state or a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state. See Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, we agree that the board must withhold the marked Texas driver's license information under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code states that "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." Gov't Code § 552.136. The board must, therefore, withhold the bank account number we have marked in Exhibit D under section 552.136.

You note that the submitted information includes e-mail addresses. Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body" unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). See Gov't Code § 552.137(a)-(c). Section 552.137 does not apply to a government employee's work e-mail address because such an address is not that of the employee as a "member of the public" but is instead the address of the individual as a government employee. The e-mail addresses at issue do not appear to be of a type specifically excluded by section 552.137(c). Therefore, in accordance with section 552.137, the board must withhold the marked e-mail addresses unless the board receives consent to release them.

In summary, the board may only release the submitted transcripts upon consent of the named chiropractor pursuant to FERPA. Regardless of the applicability of FERPA, the chiropractor's social security number is confidential under section 58.001 of the Occupations Code and thus must be withheld from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. The investigation file submitted as Exhibit E must be withheld under

section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 201.206 of the Occupations Code. The board must withhold the marked information under sections 552.130, 552.136, and 552.137 of the Government Code. All remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Tex. Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this

ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Amanda Crawford". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large, looped initial "A".

Amanda Crawford
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

AEC/krl

Ref: ID# 223029

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Jerry L. Rios
Rios & Associates
3555 Timmons Lane, Suite 1250
Houston, TX 77027-6426
(w/o enclosures)