



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

May 3, 2005

Ms. Melinda Ramos
Assistant City Attorney
City of Fort Worth
1000 Throckmorton Street
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

OR2005-03783

Dear Ms. Ramos:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 223510.

The Fort Worth Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a particular incident. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.115, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note, and you acknowledge, that the department has not complied with the time periods prescribed by section 552.301 of the Government Code in seeking an open records decision from this office. When a governmental body fails to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301, the information at issue is presumed public. *See* Gov't Code § 552.302; *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ); *City of Houston v. Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co.*, 673 S.W.2d 316, 323 (Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] 1984, no writ); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). To overcome this presumption, the governmental body must show a compelling interest to withhold the information. *See* Gov't Code § 552.302; *Hancock*, 797 S.W.2d at 381. Because sections 552.101, 552.115, and 552.130 can provide a compelling reason to withhold information, we will consider your arguments regarding these exceptions.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information made confidential by other statutes. You claim that the information submitted as Exhibit C is subject to section 48.101 of the Human Resources Code. This section pertains to the disclosure of reports of abuse, neglect, or exploitation of elderly and disabled persons in certain facilities and reads in relevant part as follows:

(a) The following information is confidential and not subject to disclosure under Chapter 552, Government Code:

(1) a report of abuse, neglect, or exploitation made under. . . chapter [48 of the Human Resources Code];

(2) the identity of the person making the report; and

(3) except as provided by this section, all files, reports, records, communications, and working papers used or developed in an investigation made under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

(b) Confidential information may be disclosed only for a purpose consistent with this chapter and as provided by [Texas Department of Protective and Regulatory Services] or investigating state agency rule and applicable federal law.

Hum. Res. Code § 48.101(a), (b). The requested information relates to the department's investigation of an injury to an elderly person. The only entities authorized to conduct an investigation under chapter 48 of the Human Resources Code are the Department of Protective and Regulatory Services and certain other state agencies, depending on the circumstances surrounding the incident. *See* Hum. Res. Code §§ 48.151, 48.152, 48.252, 48.301. You do not indicate that the submitted information was used by an agency authorized to conduct such an investigation. Upon review, we therefore determine that the requested records were not used or developed in an investigation made under chapter 48 of the Human Resources Code. Accordingly, we conclude that no portion of the submitted information may be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 48.101 of the Human Resources Code.

Next, you assert that the documents submitted as Exhibit D constitute medical records, access to which is governed by the Medical Practice Act ("MPA"), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides in pertinent part as follows:

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002(b), (c). Information that is subject to section 159.002 confidentiality includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. *See* Occ. Code §§ 159.002, .004; Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). Medical records must be released upon a patient's signed, written consent, provided that the consent specifies (1) the information to be covered by the release; (2) reasons or purposes for the release; and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. Occ. Code §§ 159.004, .005. Section 159.002(c) also requires that any subsequent release of medical records be consistent with the purposes for which the governmental body obtained the records. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). Medical records may be released only as provided under the MPA. Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). Based on our review, we agree that most of the documents submitted as Exhibit D are medical records under the MPA. For your convenience, we have marked the records that are subject to the MPA.

Next, we address your claim that the death certificate submitted as Exhibit E is excepted under section 552.115. This section provides that a death record maintained by the bureau of vital statistics of the Texas Department of Health or a local registration official is excepted from required public disclosure except that "a death record is public information and available to the public on and after the 25th anniversary of the date of death as shown on the record filed with the bureau of vital statistics or local registration official." Since section 552.115 only applies to a death certificate maintained by the bureau of vital statistics or local registration official, the department may not withhold the certificate of death pursuant to this provision. *See* Open Records Decision No. 338 (1982).

Lastly, we address your claim under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 prohibits the release of information that relates to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state or a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information we have marked in Exhibit C pursuant to section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary: (1) the medical records we have marked in Exhibit D may only be released in accordance with the MPA; (2) the department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information we have marked in Exhibit C; and (3) the remaining submitted information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days.

Id. § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Tex. Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Robert B. Rapfogel
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

RBR/krl

Ref: ID# 223510

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Joel Shields
Hagans, Bobb & Burdine P.C.
3200 Travis, 4th Floor
Houston, Texas 77006
(w/o enclosures)