



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

June 2, 2005

Mr. Paul Sarahan
Director, Litigation Division
Texas Commission on Environmental Quality
P. O. Box 13087
Austin, Texas 78711-3087

OR2005-04805

Dear Mr. Sarahan:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 225208.

The Texas Commission on Environmental Quality ("TCEQ") received a request for certain financial information submitted to TCEQ by J&E Oil, Inc. ("J&E"). You claim that some of the requested information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. You also state that the request may involve J&E's proprietary interests. Accordingly, you inform us, and provide documentation showing, that pursuant to section 552.305 of the Government Code, you notified J&E of the request for information and of its right to submit arguments explaining why the information concerning the company should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305 (permitting interested third party to submit to attorney general reasons why requested information should not be released); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (determining that statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in certain circumstances). We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

First, we note that an interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice under section 552.305(d) to submit its reasons, if any, as to why requested information relating to that party should be withheld from disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B). As of the date of this letter, this office has not received comments from J&E explaining how the release of the submitted information will affect the company's proprietary interests. Thus, J&E has not demonstrated that any of

the submitted information is proprietary for purposes of chapter 552 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.110; *see also, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 661 at 5-6 (1999) (to prevent disclosure of commercial or financial information, party must show by specific factual evidence, not conclusory or generalized allegations, that release of requested information would cause that party substantial competitive harm), 552 at 5 (1990) (party must establish *prima facie* case that information is trade secret), 542 at 3 (1990). Accordingly, TCEQ may not withhold any of the requested information on the basis of any proprietary interest that J&E may have in the information.

We now address your claim regarding the submitted information. Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information made confidential by other statutes. Prior decisions of this office have held that section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code renders tax return information confidential. *See* Attorney General Opinion H-1274 (1978) (tax returns); Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992) (W-4 forms), 226 (1979) (W-2 forms). Tax return information is defined as data furnished to or collected by the Internal Revenue Service with respect to the determination of possible existence of liability of any person under title 26 of the United States Code for any tax. *See* 26 U.S.C. § 6103(b). We have marked the tax return information that must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code as information made confidential by federal law.

We also note that the submitted information contains an individual's social security number. The 1990 amendments to the federal Social Security Act, 42 U.S.C. § 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I), which are also encompassed by section 552.101 of the Government Code, make confidential social security numbers and related records that are obtained or maintained by a state agency or political subdivision of the state pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. *See id.* We have no basis for concluding that this social security number is confidential under section 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I), and therefore excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 on the basis of that federal provision. We caution, however, that section 552.352 of the Government Code imposes criminal penalties for the release of confidential information. Prior to releasing any social security number information, you should ensure that no such information was obtained or is maintained by TCEQ pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990.

We also note that the submitted information contains insurance policy numbers that are subject to section 552.136 of the Government Code. This section states that "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." Gov't Code § 552.136. We have marked the policy numbers that must be withheld in accordance with section 552.136.

In summary: (1) the tax return information we have marked must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law; (2) the social

security number may also be confidential under federal law; (3) the insurance policy numbers we have marked must be withheld under section 552.136 of the Government Code; and (4) the remaining submitted information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Tex. Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code

§ 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Robert B. Rapfogel
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

RBR/krl

Ref: ID# 225208

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Derly J. Uribe
Law Offices of Francisco J. Saldana, Jr.
P. O. Box 6779
Laredo, Texas 78042-6779
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Jerry L. Barth
President
J&E Oil, Inc.
P. O. Box 38
Elsa, Texas 78543
(w/o enclosures)