



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

June 27, 2005

Mr. Jeff Lopez
Assistant General Counsel
Office of the General Counsel
Texas Department of Public Safety
P. O. Box 4087
Austin, Texas 78773-0001

OR2005-05661

Dear Mr. Lopez:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 226944.

The Texas Department of Public Safety (the "department") received a request for all information related to a particular motor vehicle accident. You state that you have released a copy of the accident report and the first page offense report information. You claim that the remaining requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Initially, we note that a portion of the submitted information constitutes grand jury records that are not subject to the Act. This office has concluded that grand juries are part of the judiciary and are, thus, not subject to the Act. *See Gov't Code § 552.003* ("governmental body" does not include judiciary). Records that are within the constructive possession of grand juries are not public information that is subject to disclosure under the Act. *See Open Records Decision No. 513 (1988)*. When an individual or entity acts at the direction of the grand jury as its agent, information prepared or collected by the agent is within the grand jury's constructive possession and is not subject to the Act. *See id.* Information that is not so held or maintained is subject to the Act and may be withheld only if a specific exception

¹We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988)*. This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

to disclosure is applicable. *See id.* We note that some of the submitted information was obtained through the use of a grand jury subpoena at the direction of the grand jury. You further state that “the information is within the actual or constructive possession of the grand jury.” Thus, we understand that the department is holding these records as an agent of the grand jury. Accordingly, the records we have marked are in the constructive possession of the grand jury and thus, are not subject to disclosure under the Act.

We now address your arguments for the remaining submitted information. Section 552.108(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime.” Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See Gov’t Code §§ 552.108(a)(1), (b)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state that the remaining requested information relates to a pending criminal case. Based upon this representation, we conclude that the release of the remaining submitted information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases). Therefore, you may withhold this information under section 552.108(a)(1). We note that you have the discretion to release all or part of this information that is not otherwise confidential by law.

In summary, the marked grand jury records are in the custody of the department as agent of the grand jury and are not subject to the Act pursuant to section 552.003 of the Government Code. You may withhold the remaining submitted information under section 552.108. As our ruling on these issues is dispositive, we need not consider your remaining arguments.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov’t Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Tex. Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Elizabeth A. Stephens
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

EAS/krl

Ref: ID#226944

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Vincent (Sonny) Monteagudo
ISIS Investigations, Inc.
427 S. Vine
Tyler, TX 75702
(w/o enclosures)