



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

June 28, 2005

Mr. Juan J. Cruz  
Escamilla & Poneck, Inc.  
5219 McPherson Road, Suite 306  
Laredo, Texas 78041

OR2005-05728

Dear Mr. Cruz:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 227156.

The Clint Independent School District (the "school district"), which you represent, received a request for a copy of the requestor's personnel file and any complaint or investigation files compiled by the school district. You state that you have released the personnel file and portions of the investigation that are not excepted from public disclosure to the requestor on behalf of the school district but claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.107 and 552.114 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note that the records in Exhibit C did not exist when the district received the request. *See Econ. Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266 (Tex. Civ. App.—San Antonio 1978, writ *dism'd*); Open Records Decision No. 452 at 3 (1986) (governmental body not required to disclose information that did not exist at time request was received). Because this information is not responsive to the request, we do not address it in this ruling.

Now we turn to your arguments for Exhibit B. Section 552.114 of the Governmental Code exempts from disclosure student records at an educational institution funded completely or in part by state revenue. This office generally applies the same analysis under section 552.114 and the Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act of 1974 ("FERPA").

*See* Open Records Decision No. 539 (1990). Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses FERPA.<sup>1</sup> FERPA provides that no federal funds will be made available under any applicable program to an educational agency or institution that releases personally identifiable information (other than directory information) contained in a student's education records to anyone but certain enumerated federal, state, and local officials and institutions, unless otherwise authorized by the student's parent. *See* 20 U.S.C. § 1232g(b)(1). "Education records" means those records that contain information directly related to a student and are maintained by an educational agency or institution or by a person acting for such agency or institution. *Id.* § 1232g(a)(4)(A). Section 552.026 of the Government Code provides that "information contained in education records of an educational agency or institution" may only be released under the Act in accordance with FERPA.

In Open Records Decision No. 634 (1995), this office concluded that (1) an educational agency or institution may withhold from public disclosure information that is protected by FERPA and excepted from required public disclosure by sections 552.026 and 552.101 without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision as to those exceptions, and (2) an educational agency or institution that is state-funded may withhold from public disclosure information that is excepted from required public disclosure by section 552.114 as a "student record," insofar as the "student record" is protected by FERPA, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision as to that exception. *See* Open Records Decision No. 634 at 6-8 (1995). In this instance, you have submitted information that you contend is confidential under FERPA. Accordingly, we will address your claim.

Information must be withheld from required public disclosure under FERPA only to the extent "reasonable and necessary to avoid personally identifying a particular student." *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 332 (1982), 206 (1978). Such information includes both information that directly identifies a student, as well as information that, if released, would allow the student's identity to be easily traced. This office has found that a student's handwritten comments are protected under FERPA because they make identity of student easily traceable through handwriting, style of expression, or particular incidents related. Open Records Decision No. 224 (1979). Exhibit C includes students' handwritten comments that are confidential under FERPA and must be withheld under sections 552.101 and 552.114.

However, we note that FERPA provides that "directory information" may be released to the public if the institution or agency complies with section 1232g(a)(5)(B) of title 20 of the United States Code. "Directory information" includes the student's name, address, telephone listing, date and place of birth, major field of study, participation in officially recognized activities and sports, weight and height of members of athletic teams, dates of attendance,

---

<sup>1</sup>Section 552.101 excepts from required public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision," and incorporates confidentiality provisions such as FERPA into the Act. Gov't Code § 552.101.

degrees and awards received, and the most recent previous educational agency or institution attended by the student. 20 U.S.C. § 1232g(a)(5)(A). Section 1232g(a)(5)(B) provides as follows:

[a]ny educational agency or institution making public directory information shall give public notice of the categories of information which it has designated as such information with respect to each student attending the institution or agency and shall allow a reasonable period of time after such notice has been given for a parent to inform the institution or agency that any or all of the information designated should not be released without the parent's prior consent.

20 U.S.C. § 1232g(a)(5)(B). This office has previously held that a class roster is directory information. *See* Open Records Decision No. 244 (1980). The submitted information also includes a class roster with additional handwritten notes beside each student's name. Accordingly, if the school district has designated class rosters as directory information, then the district is required to disclose the portion of the submitted class roster that discloses students' names, dates of birth, telephone listing after complying with federal notice requirements for release of directory information. *Id.*; 34 C.F.R. § 99.37. However, the handwritten notes and other portions of the submitted class roster are not directory information and must be withheld under section 552.114 and FERPA. To the extent the district has not designated class rosters as directory information, the district must withhold the class roster in its entirety under section 552.114 and FERPA.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the

Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Tex. Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



L. Joseph James  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

LJJ/seg

Ref: ID# 227156

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Victor Enriquez  
200 North Festival, #603  
El Paso, Texas 79912  
(w/o enclosures)