



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

June 29, 2005

Mr. James M. Frazier III
Assistant General Counsel
Texas Department of Criminal Justice
P. O. Box 4004
Huntsville, Texas 77342-4004

OR2005-05759

Dear Mr. Frazier:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 227189.

The Texas Department of Criminal Justice (the "department") received a request for ten categories of information related to two named department employees. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.122, and 552.134 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code §552.101. This section encompasses information other statutes make confidential. The information submitted by the department contains I-9 forms (Employment Eligibility Verification), which are governed by section 1324a of Title 8 of the United States Code. This section provides that an I-9 form and "any information contained in or appended to such form, may not be used for purposes other than for enforcement of this chapter" and for enforcement of other federal statutes governing crime and criminal investigations. *See* 8 U.S.C. § 1324a(b)(5); *see also* 8 C.F.R. § 274a.2(b)(4). Release of the forms in this instance would be "for purposes other than for enforcement" of the referenced federal statutes. Accordingly, we conclude that the I-9 forms are confidential and may only be released in compliance with the federal laws and regulations governing the employment verification system.

The information submitted by the department also contains W-2 and W-4 forms. Section 6103(a) of Title 26 of the United States Code provides that tax return information is confidential. *See* 26 U.S.C. § 6103(a)(2), (b)(2)(A), (p)(8); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 600 (1992); Attorney General Op. MW-372 (1981). Accordingly, the department must withhold these forms pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 6103(a) of Title 26 of the United States Code.

We understand you to assert that the submitted fingerprints are excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 in conjunction with sections 560.001, 560.002, and 560.003 of the Government Code.¹ These sections provide as follows:

Sec. 560.001. DEFINITIONS. In this chapter:

- (1) "Biometric identifier" means a retina or iris scan, fingerprint, voiceprint, or record of hand or face geometry.
- (2) "Governmental body" has the meaning assigned by Section 552.003 [of the Government Code], except that the term includes each entity within or created by the judicial branch of state government.

Sec. 560.002. DISCLOSURE OF BIOMETRIC IDENTIFIER. A governmental body that possesses a biometric identifier of an individual:

- (1) may not sell, lease, or otherwise disclose the biometric identifier to another person unless:
 - (A) the individual consents to the disclosure;
 - (B) the disclosure is required or permitted by a federal statute or by a state statute other than Chapter 552 [of the Government Code]; or
 - (C) the disclosure is made by or to a law enforcement agency for a law enforcement purpose; and
- (2) shall store, transmit, and protect from disclosure the biometric identifier using reasonable care and in a manner that is the same as or

¹These sections, formerly found at chapter 559 of the Government Code as sections 559.001, 559.002, and 559.003, were renumbered by the Regular Session of the Seventy-eighth Legislature, effective September 1, 2003. *See* Act of May 20, 2003, 78th Leg., R.S., ch. 1275, § 2 (78), 2003 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 4140, 4144.

more protective than the manner in which the governmental body stores, transmits, and protects its other confidential information.

Sec. 560.003. APPLICATION OF CHAPTER 552. A biometric identifier in the possession of a governmental body is exempt from disclosure under Chapter 552.

Gov't Code §§ 560.001, .002, .003. It does not appear to this office that section 560.002 permits the disclosure of the submitted fingerprint information. Therefore, the department must withhold the fingerprints we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code.

The department raises section 552.122 of the Government Code for a portion of its submitted information. Section 552.122 excepts from disclosure "a test item developed by a . . . governmental body[.]" Gov't Code § 552.122(b). In Open Records Decision No. 626 (1994), this office determined that the term "test item" in section 552.122 includes "any standard means by which an individual's or group's knowledge or ability in a particular area is evaluated," but does not encompass evaluations of an employee's overall job performance or suitability. Open Records Decision No. 626 at 6 (1994). The question of whether specific information falls within the scope of section 552.122(b) must be determined on a case-by-case basis. *Id.* Traditionally, this office has applied section 552.122 where release of "test items" might compromise the effectiveness of future examinations. *Id.* at 4-5; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 118 (1976). Section 552.122 also protects the answers to test questions when the answers might reveal the questions themselves. *See* Attorney General Opinion JM-640 at 3 (1987); Open Records Decision No. 626 at 8 (1994).

The department contends that "the questions are intended to display the technical expertise of the applicant," and further, that "the questions are not usually statements about background or experience." After reviewing the information, we agree that most of the submitted questions test an individual's knowledge in a particular area and thus constitute "test items" as contemplated by section 552.122(b). Furthermore, we find that the answers to these questions might reveal the questions themselves. Therefore, pursuant to section 552.122 of the Government Code, the department may withhold the questions we have marked, as well as the corresponding preferred and actual answers. We find, however, that the remaining questions are general questions evaluating an applicant's general workplace skills and overall suitability for employment, and do not test any specific knowledge of an applicant. Accordingly, we determine that these remaining questions are not test items for purposes of section 552.122. The department may not withhold these remaining questions, or the preferred or actual answers to these remaining questions, pursuant to section 552.122 of the Government Code.

We note that the information submitted by the department includes the social security number and address of a department employee. In Open Records Letter No. 2005-01067

(2005), we issued a previous determination that authorizes the department to withhold the personal information of a current or former employee of the department under section 552.117(a)(3) of the Government Code without the necessity of again requesting an attorney general decision with regard to the applicability of this exception. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(a); Open Records Decision No. 673 at 7-8 (2001) (delineating elements of second type of previous determination under Gov't Code § 552.301(a)). Accordingly, the department must withhold the social security number and address of the department employee in accordance with Open Records Letter No. 2005-01067.

The department also raises section 552.134 of the Government Code for a portion of the submitted information. Sections 552.134 relates to inmates of the department and provides in relevant part:

(a) Except as provided by Subsection (b) or by Section 552.029 [of the Government Code], information obtained or maintained by the Texas Department of Criminal Justice is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information about an inmate who is confined in a facility operated by or under a contract with the department.

Gov't Code § 552.134(a). Section 552.029 of the Government Code provides:

Notwithstanding Section 508.313 or 552.134, the following information about an inmate who is confined in a facility operated by or under a contract with the Texas Department of Criminal Justice is subject to required disclosure under Section 552.021:

...

(8) basic information regarding the death of an inmate in custody, an incident involving the use of force, or an alleged crime involving the inmate.

Gov't Code § 552.029(8). The remaining information submitted by the department concerns inmates who were confined in a facility operated by the department. Section 552.134 is explicitly made subject to section 552.029. Under section 552.029, basic information regarding the death of an inmate in custody, an alleged crime involving an inmate, and an incident involving the use of force is subject to required disclosure. Basic information includes the time and place of the incident, names of inmates and department officials directly involved, a brief narrative of the incident, a brief description of any injuries sustained, and information regarding criminal charges or disciplinary actions filed as a result of the incident. The information at issue includes an investigation of an incident involving the use of force. Accordingly, with the exception of basic information that must be released

pursuant to section 552.029(8), the department must withhold the remaining submitted information under section 552.134 of the Government Code.

In summary, (1) the department must withhold the I-9, W-2, and W-4 forms under section 552.101 in conjunction with federal law; (2) the department must withhold the fingerprints we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code; (3) the department may withhold the questions we have marked, and their corresponding preferred and actual responses, pursuant to section 552.122(b) of the Government Code; (3) the department must withhold the social security number and address of the department employee in accordance with Open Records Letter No. 2005-01067; and (4) with the exception of basic information that must be released pursuant to section 552.029(8), the department must withhold the submitted information it has marked under section 552.134 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Tex. Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Elizabeth A. Stephens". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first name "Elizabeth" and last name "Stephens" clearly legible.

Elizabeth A. Stephens
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

EAS/krl

Ref: ID#227189

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Yolanda M. Torres
ACLU of Texas
Prison and Jail Accountability Project
P. O. Box 515
Huntsville, TX 77342-0515
(w/o enclosures)