



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

August 22, 2005

Ms. Margo M. Kaiser
Staff Attorney
Open Records Unit
Texas Workforce Commission
101 East 15th Street
Austin, Texas 78778-0001

OR2005-07575

Dear Ms. Kaiser:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 230508.

The Texas Workforce Commission (the "commission") received a request for "certified copies of all materials in the [commission's] files for [a named claimant], including tapes of any hearings" and "an index or similar statement of the scope of any materials withheld or deleted by the [c]ommission."¹ You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.103, 552.107, and 552.111 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.²

You state that Exhibit B-3 consists of confidential claim information. Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information made confidential by other statutes. The regulations found at section 603 of title 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations send a clear message that "claim

¹We note that the department sought and received clarification from the requestor. See Gov't Code § 552.222(b) (governmental body may communicate with requestor for purpose of clarifying or narrowing request for information).

²We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

information” in the files of a state unemployment compensation agency is to be disclosed only to a “receiving agency,” as defined in the regulations, or to other specified parties. *See* 20 C.F.R. §§ 603.1 *et seq.*; *see also* Open Records Decision No.476 at 4 (1987). Otherwise, pursuant to section 603.7 of title 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations, state unemployment compensation agencies, such as the commission, must protect the confidentiality of claim information. “Claim information” means information regarding whether an individual is receiving, has received, or has applied for unemployment compensation, as well as “[a]ny other information contained in the records of the State employment compensation agency which is needed by the requesting agency to verify eligibility for, and the amount of, benefits.” 20 C.F.R. § 603.2(c)(1), (5). We also note that the names of employers and employees who file unemployment compensation appeals fall within the definition of “claim information” and that the federal regulations prohibit the commission from disclosing this information. *See* Open Records Decision No. 476 at 4 (1987).

The federal Social Security Act requires states to comply with the directives of the United States Department of Labor (the “department”) in administering state unemployment insurance (“UI”) programs, and a department directive, UI Program Letter No. 34-97, specifies the conditions under which such claim information may be released. You state that “the requestor does not fall into any of the exceptions to the confidentiality requirements imposed by federal and state laws and regulations.” Therefore, the commission must withhold Exhibit B-3 in its entirety pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with these federal provisions. *See* UI Program Letter 34-97 (allowing disclosure to “private entity under a written agreement which requires ‘informed consent’ from the individual to whom the information pertains”); *see also* 20 C.F.R. pt. 603. We have also marked a duplicate document in Exhibit B-1 that must be withheld on this basis.

Section 552.103(a), the “litigation exception,” excepts from disclosure information relating to litigation to which the state or a political subdivision is or may be a party. A governmental body has the burden of providing relevant facts and documents to show that the section 552.103(a) exception is applicable in a particular situation. The test for meeting this burden is a showing that (1) litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated, and (2) the information at issue is related to that litigation. *Univ. of Tex. Law Sch. v. Tex. Legal Found.*, 958 S.W.2d 479, 481 (Tex. App.—Austin 1997, no pet.); *Heard v. Houston Post Co.*, 684 S.W.2d 210, 212 (Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] 1984, writ ref’d n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 551 at 4 (1990). The commission must meet both prongs of this test for information to be excepted under section 552.103(a).

You state, and have submitted to this office information showing, that a pending lawsuit has been filed in 205th Judicial District Court of El Paso County against the commission. We thus find that you have shown that litigation was pending for purposes of section 552.103 at the time the commission received the request. Your representations and our review of the information shows that the remaining information you submitted as Exhibit B-1 is related

to the pending litigation.³ We note however, that generally, once information has been obtained by all parties to the litigation through discovery or otherwise, no section 552.103(a) interest exists with respect to that information. Open Records Decision Nos. 349 (1982), 320 (1982). Thus, information that has either been obtained from or provided to the opposing party in the anticipated litigation is not excepted from disclosure under section 552.103(a), and it must be disclosed. As it appears that some of the information you claim is excepted from release under section 552.103 has been provided to the opposing party in the anticipated litigation, we find that this information may not be withheld under section 552.103. You may withhold the remaining portions of Exhibit B-1 that have not been provided to the opposing party in the pending litigation pursuant to section 552.103. Finally, we note that the applicability of section 552.103(a) ends once the litigation has been concluded. Attorney General Opinion MW-575 (1982); Open Records Decision No. 350 (1982). As our ruling on this issue is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments.

In summary, Exhibit B-3 and the marked portion of Exhibit B-1 must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 603.2(c)(1), (5) of title 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations. The remaining portions of Exhibit B-1 that the opposing party has previously seen or to which it has had access must be released. The remaining information in Exhibit B-1 may be withheld under section 552.103 of the Government Code. You may also withhold Exhibit B-2 under section 552.103.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the

³The documents you have submitted as Exhibit B-2 are identical to documents submitted in Exhibit B-1. You may withhold the duplicate documents under section 552.103 as set out above in our discussion of Exhibit B-1.

statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Tex. Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



L. Joseph James
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

LJJ/seg

Ref: ID# 230508

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Lacey L. Gourley
Bracewell & Giuliani
106 South St. Mary's Street, Suite 800
San Antonio, Texas 78205-3603
(w/o enclosures)