



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

August 30, 2005

Ms. Sandra Smith  
Executive Director  
Texas Board of Chiropractic Examiners  
333 Guadalupe, Suite 3-825  
Austin, Texas 78701-3942

OR2005-07896

Dear Ms. Smith:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 231262.

The Texas Board of Chiropractic Examiners (the "board") received a request for information related to a particular facility and a named chiropractor. You state that some responsive information has been provided to the requestor. You claim that portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.026, 552.101, 552.108, 552.114, 552.130, and 552.137 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision," and encompasses information protected by other statutes. The Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act of 1974 ("FERPA") provides that no federal funds will be made available under any applicable program to an educational agency or institution that releases personally identifiable information (other than directory information) contained in a student's education records to anyone but certain enumerated federal, state, and local officials and institutions, unless otherwise authorized by the student's parent.<sup>1</sup> See 20 U.S.C. § 1232g(b)(1). "Education records" means those records that contain information directly related to a

---

<sup>1</sup>We note that section 552.026 of the Government Code incorporates FERPA into the Act, and section 552.114 excepts from disclosure "information in a student record at an educational institution funded wholly or partly by state revenue." This office generally has treated "student record" information excepted under section 552.114(a) as the equivalent of "education record" information that is protected by FERPA. See Open Records Decision No. 634 at 6-8 (1995).

student and are maintained by an educational agency or institution or by a person acting for such agency or institution. *Id.* § 1232g(a)(4)(A). The board is not an educational agency or institution.

However, FERPA provides that an educational agency or institution may only transfer personal information to a third party “on the condition that such party will not permit any other party to have access to such information without the written consent of the parents of the student.” *Id.* § 1232g(b)(4)(B). The federal regulations provide that a third party that receives such information from an educational agency may use the information only for the purposes for which the disclosure was made. 34 C.F.R. § 99.33(a)(2).

You inform us that “[the submitted] transcripts are original transcripts received directly from the educational institution.” Based on your representation that the board received these transcripts directly from an educational agency or institution, we find that the board may only release these transcripts on consent of the named chiropractor in accordance with sections 1232g(b)(4)(B) and 99.33(a)(2).

Criminal history record information (“CHRI”) generated by the National Crime Information Center (“NCIC”) or by the Texas Crime Information Center (“TCIC”) is confidential. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except that the DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083.

Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI, but a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-411.127. Thus, any CHRI generated by the federal government or another state may not be made available to the requestor except in accordance with federal regulations. *See* Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). We note that driving record information is not made confidential by the confidentiality provisions that govern CHRI. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.082(2)(B) (definition of CHRI does not include driving record information). The CHRI in the submitted information obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency is confidential under chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code; therefore, the board must withhold this information under section 552.101.<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>2</sup>As our ruling is dispositive, we do not address your remaining claims for this information.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information that “relates to . . . a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license or permit issued by an agency of this state [or] a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state.” Gov’t Code § 552.130. In accordance with section 552.130, the board must withhold the Texas driver’s license number you have marked.

You claim that an e-mail address within the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.137 of the Government Code. This section excepts from disclosure “an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body” unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *See* Gov’t Code § 552.137(a)-(c). The e-mail address at issue does not appear to be of a type specifically excluded by section 552.137(c). You do not inform us that the member of the public to whom the e-mail address at issue pertains has affirmatively consented to the release of his e-mail address. The board must, therefore, withhold the e-mail address it has marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code.

Section 552.147 of the Government Code provides that “[t]he social security number of a living person is excepted from” required public disclosure under the Act.<sup>3</sup> Therefore, the board must withhold the social security number contained in the submitted information under section 552.147.<sup>4</sup>

In summary, pursuant to FERPA, the board may only release the transcripts upon the consent of the chiropractor to whom they pertain. CHRI is confidential under chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code, and must be withheld under section 552.101. The board must also withhold the marked information under sections 552.130 and 552.137. A social security number must be withheld under section 552.147. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov’t Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the

---

<sup>3</sup>Added by Act of May 23, 2005, 79th Leg., R.S., S.B. 1485, § 1, sec. 552.147(a) (to be codified at Tex. Gov’t Code § 552.147).

<sup>4</sup>We note that section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person’s social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Tex. Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

Cindy Nettles  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

CN/jpa

Ref: ID# 231262

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Brent J. Walker, FCLS  
Senior Investigator  
Progressive Casualty Insurance Co.  
16055 Space Center Blvd., Ste 550  
Houston, Texas 77062  
(w/o enclosures)