



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

September 7, 2005

Ms. Sandra Smith
Executive Director
Texas Board of Chiropractic Examiners
333 Guadalupe, Suite 3-825
Austin, Texas 78701-3942

OR2005-08148

Dear Ms. Smith:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 231856.

The Texas Board of Chiropractic Examiners (the "board") received a request for all files pertaining to a named facility and chiropractor. You inform us that you are releasing some requested information but claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.114, and 552.137 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information protected by other statutes. The Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act of 1974 ("FERPA") provides that no federal funds will be made available under any applicable program to an educational agency or institution that releases personally identifiable information (other than directory information) contained in a student's education records to anyone but certain enumerated federal, state, and local officials and institutions, unless otherwise authorized by the student's parent. See 20 U.S.C. § 1232g(b)(1). "Education records" means those records that contain information directly related to a student and are maintained by an educational agency or institution or by a person acting for such agency or institution. *Id.* § 1232g(a)(4)(A). The board is not an educational agency or institution.

However, FERPA provides that an educational agency or institution may only transfer personal information to a third party “on the condition that such party will not permit any other party to have access to such information without the written consent of the parents of the student.” *Id.* § 1232g(b)(4)(B). The federal regulations provide that a third party that receives such information from an educational agency may use the information only for the purposes for which the disclosure was made. 34 C.F.R. § 99.33(a)(2).

You inform us that “[t]hese transcripts are original transcripts received directly from the educational institution (Tyler Junior College and Abilene Christian University)[.]” Based on your representation that the board received these transcripts directly from an educational agency or institution, we find that the board may only release these transcripts on consent of the named chiropractor in accordance with sections 1232g(b)(4)(B) and 99.33(a)(2).¹

Next, you contend that the information submitted as Exhibit C is confidential under section 201.206 of the Occupations Code. This section provides in relevant part as follows:

(a) The board’s investigation files are confidential, privileged, and not subject to discovery, subpoena, or any other means of legal compulsion for release other than to the board or an employee or agent of the board.

...

(d) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), the board may:

(1) disclose a complaint to the affected license holder; and

(2) provide to a complainant the license holder’s response to the complaint, if providing the response is considered by the board to be necessary to investigate the complaint.

Occ. Code § 201.206(a), (d). Section 201.206 was added to the Occupations Code by the Seventy-eighth Legislature and applies to “a complaint or investigation pending on [September 1, 2003] or filed on or after that date.” Act of May 29, 2003, 78th Leg., R.S., ch. 329, § 7(b), 2003 Tex. Gen. Laws 1405, 1407. We find that the information submitted as Exhibit C consists of an investigation file that comes within the scope of section 201.206 of the Occupations Code. We therefore agree that the board must withhold Exhibit C in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Lastly, we address your claim under section 552.137 of the Government Code. This section excepts from disclosure “an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the

¹Because of our ruling on this issue, we need not address your arguments regarding section 552.114 of the Government Code.

purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body” unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *See* Gov’t Code § 552.137(a)-(c). Section 552.137 is not applicable to an institutional e-mail address, an Internet website address, or an e-mail address that a governmental entity maintains for one of its officials or employees. We agree that the e-mail address of a chiropractor that you have marked is confidential under section 552.137. The board must withhold that e-mail address unless the chiropractor has affirmatively consented to its public disclosure. However, the other e-mail address that you have marked is that of a business. Also, the two Internet website addresses that you have marked are not subject to section 552.137. Thus, the board may not withhold that e-mail address or the two Internet website addresses under section 552.137.

In summary, the submitted transcripts may only be released on consent of the named chiropractor in accordance with section 1232g(b)(4)(B) of title 20 of the United States Code and section 99.33(a)(2) of title 34 of the Code of Federal Regulations. The investigative information submitted as Exhibit C must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 201.206 of the Occupations Code. The chiropractor’s e-mail address must be withheld pursuant to section 552.137 of the Government Code unless she has consented to its release. The remaining submitted information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov’t Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general’s Open Government Hotline, toll

free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Robert B. Rapfogel
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

RBR/seg

Ref: ID# 231856

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Stefano Milito
Harrison & Hull, L.L.P.
1600 Redbud Boulevard, Suite 300
McKinney, Texas 75069
(w/o enclosures)