



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

September 26, 2005

Ms. Cynthia Villarreal-Reyna
Section Chief, Agency Counsel
Legal & Compliance Division
Texas Department of Insurance
P.O. Box 149104
Austin, Texas 78714-9104

OR2005-08712

Dear Ms. Villarreal-Reyna:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 232959.

The Texas Department of Insurance (the "department") received a request for specified private passenger auto rate filings of Old American County Mutual Fire Insurance Company ("Old American"), Viking Insurance, and Dairyland Insurance. You state that most of the responsive filings will be provided to the requestor. You claim that portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure pursuant to section 552.137 of the Government Code. Although you take no position regarding the remaining submitted information, you contend that it may contain proprietary information subject to exception under the Act. Accordingly, you state, and provide documentation showing, that you notified Old American of the department's receipt of the request for information and of the company's right to submit arguments to this office as to why the requested information should not be released to the requestor. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in the Act in certain circumstances). We have received correspondence from Old American. We have considered the submitted arguments and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with

a governmental body” unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *See* Gov’t Code § 552.137(a)-(c). Section 552.137 does not apply to a government employee’s work e-mail address because such an address is not that of the employee as a “member of the public,” but is instead the address of the individual as a government employee. The e-mail addresses you have marked do not appear to be of a type specifically excluded by section 552.137(c). In addition, you inform us that the department has not received consent for the release of the e-mail addresses at issue. Therefore, the department must withhold the e-mail addresses you have marked under section 552.137.

Old American asserts that its underwriting guidelines and rules are excepted from disclosure under section 552.110 of the Government Code. However, the department informs this office that the information at issue “contains no underwriting guidelines.” Thus, we need not reach Old American’s arguments.

To conclude, the department must withhold the e-mail addresses you have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released to the requestor.

Although Old American requests a previous determination regarding the underwriting guidelines and rules at issue, we decline to issue one at this time. Accordingly, this letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov’t Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general’s Open Government Hotline, toll

free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Cindy Nettles
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CN/jpa

Ref: ID# 232959

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Rafael Varela
Pronto MGA Ltd.
1175 West Price, Suite 5
Brownsville, Texas 78521
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Thomas A. McCall
Old American County Mutual
P.O. Box 700668
Dallas, Texas 75370
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Bruce McCandless, III
Long, Burner, Parks & DeLargy
P.O. Box 2212
Austin, Texas 78768-2212
(w/o enclosures)