



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

September 27, 2005

Mr. Nathan C. Barrow  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of Fort Worth  
1000 Throckmorton Street  
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

OR2005-08752

Dear Mr. Barrow:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 233128.

The Fort Worth Police Department (the "department") received a request for "a copy of Officer's Supplemental Report" for a specified case. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note that the submitted information contains an executed search warrant, a search warrant supporting affidavit, and a search warrant return signed by a magistrate. A search warrant affidavit is made public by statute if the search warrant has been executed. *See* Crim. Proc. Code art. 18.01(b). The exceptions to disclosure found in the Act do not apply to information that is made public by other statutes. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 623 at 3 (1994), 525 at 3 (1985). Therefore, the department must release the search warrant affidavit. With respect to the search warrant itself and the signed return, such information is subject to the remainder of this ruling as discussed below.

We also note that the submitted information includes ST-3 accident report forms completed pursuant to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. *See* Transp. Code § 550.064 (Texas Peace Officer's Accident Report form). Section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code states that, except as provided by subsection (c), accident reports are privileged and confidential. Section 550.065(c)(4) provides for the release of accident reports to a person who provides two of the following three pieces of information: (1) date of the accident; (2)

name of any person involved in the accident; and (3) specific location of the accident. Transp. Code § 550.065(c)(4). Under this provision, the Department of Public Safety or another governmental body is required to release a copy of an accident report to a person who provides the governmental body with two or more pieces of information specified by the statute. *Id.* In the present request, the requestor has provided the required information. Accordingly, the department must release the accident reports pursuant to section 550.065(c).

Next, we must address the department's obligations under section 552.301 of the Government Code. Subsections 552.301(a) and (b) provide:

(a) A governmental body that receives a written request for information that it wishes to withhold from public disclosure and that it considers to be within one of the [Act's] exceptions . . . must ask for a decision from the attorney general about whether the information is within that exception if there has not been a previous determination about whether the information falls within one of the exceptions.

(b) The governmental body must ask for the attorney general's decision and state the exceptions that apply within a reasonable time but not later than the 10th business day after the date of receiving the written request.

Gov't Code § 552.301(a), (b). You inform us that the department received the request for information on July 6, 2005. Based on this date, the tenth business day following the department's receipt of the written request was July 20, 2005. However, your letter seeking a decision from this office was not postmarked until July 21, 2005. Thus, we have no choice but to find that the department failed to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.308 (describing rules for calculating submission dates of documents sent via first class United States mail, common or contract carrier, or interagency mail).

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless the governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.302; *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). Section 552.108 is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body's interests and may be waived. *See* Gov't Code § 552.007; Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). The department's claim under section 552.108 is not a compelling reason to overcome the presumption of openness in this instance under section 552.302, and none of the remaining submitted information may be withheld on that basis. *See* Open Records Decision No. 663

at 5 (1999) (untimely request for decision resulted in waiver of discretionary exceptions); *but see* Open Records Decision No. 586 at 3 (1991) (need of another governmental body to withhold information under predecessor to section 552.108 provided compelling reason to withhold information). However, section 552.101 can provide a compelling reason to withhold information, and we will consider your arguments regarding this exception. *See* Open Records Decision No. 150 (1977) (compelling reason exists to withhold information when third party interests are at stake or when information is made confidential by another source of law).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information made confidential by other statutes. Criminal history record information (“CHRI”) generated by the National Crime Information Center (“NCIC”) or by the Texas Crime Information Center (“TCIC”) is confidential. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except that the DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083.

Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090 - .127. Thus, any CHRI generated by the federal government or another state may not be made available to the requestor except in accordance with federal regulations. *See* Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. We also note that the definition of CHRI does not include driving record information. Gov’t Code § 411.082(2)(B). We have marked the CHRI in the submitted documents that must be withheld.

Next, we note that some of the remaining submitted information is subject to other mandatory exceptions to disclosure.<sup>1</sup> First, section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if it: (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable

---

<sup>1</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions like sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.147 on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987). These exceptions also provide compelling reasons to withhold information for purposes of section 552.302.

person; and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. In addition, this office has determined that financial information that relates only to an individual ordinarily satisfies the first element of the common law privacy test, but the public has a legitimate interest in the essential facts about a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 600 at 9-12 (1992) (identifying public and private portions of certain state personnel records), 545 at 4 (1990) (attorney general has found kinds of financial information not excepted from public disclosure by common law privacy to generally be those regarding receipt of governmental funds or debts owed to governmental entities), 523 at 4 (1989) (noting distinction under common law privacy between confidential background financial information furnished to public body about individual and basic facts regarding particular financial transaction between individual and public body), 373 at 4 (1983) (determination of whether public's interest in obtaining personal financial information is sufficient to justify its disclosure must be made on case-by-case basis). We have marked personal financial information that the department must withhold under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We also note that the remaining submitted information contains Texas motor vehicle record information. Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information that relates to a driver's license or motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state. Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold Texas motor vehicle record information we have marked pursuant to section 552.130.

Lastly, the remaining submitted information contains a social security number. Section 552.147 of the Government Code<sup>2</sup> provides that "[t]he social security number of a living person is excepted from" required public disclosure under the Act. Therefore, the department must withhold the social security number we have marked under section 552.147.<sup>3</sup>

In summary, the department must (1) release the search warrant affidavit pursuant to article 18.01(b) of the Code of Criminal Procedure; (2) release the accident reports pursuant to section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code; (3) withhold the CHRI we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law and chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code; (4) withhold the personal financial

---

<sup>2</sup>Added by Act of May 23, 2005, 79th Leg., R.S., S.B. 1485, § 1, sec. 552.147(a) (to be codified at Tex. Gov't Code § 552.147).

<sup>3</sup>We note that section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy; (5) withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information we have marked in accordance with section 552.130 of the Government Code; (6) withhold the marked social security number pursuant to section 552.147 of the Government Code; and (7) release the remaining submitted information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within ten calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for

contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within ten calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "R.B. Rapfogel". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first letters of the first and last names being capitalized and prominent.

Robert B. Rapfogel  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

RBR/krl

Ref: ID# 233128

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Stanley Pollard  
Safeco Insurance  
1600 North Collins Boulevard, Suite 3000  
Richardson, Texas 75080  
(w/o enclosures)