ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

September 30, 2005

Mr. Stephen R. Alcorn
Assistant City Attorney
City of Grand Prairie
P.O. Box 53404
Grand Prairie, Texas 75053-4045

OR2005-08903

Dear Mr. Alcorn:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 233679.

The City of Grand Prairie (the "city") received requests for information pertaining to: the city's investigation and subsequent suspension of a named city employee, the city's policies and procedures concerning investigations of fire department employees, and the city's policies and procedures for employees on administrative leave. You state that the city does not have specific policies with regard to investigations of fire department personnel but that you will provide city policies regarding other employees.[1] You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we must address the city's obligations under section 552.301 of the Government Code. Sections 552.301(a) and (b) provide:

> (a) A governmental body that receives a written request for information that it wishes to withhold from public disclosure and that it considers to be within one of the [Act's] exceptions . . . must ask for a decision from the attorney general about whether the information is within that exception if there has not

[1]We note that the Act does not require a governmental body to disclose information that did not exist at the time the request was received. *Econ. Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266 (Tex.Civ.App.—San Antonio 1978, writ dism'd); Open Records Decision No. 452 at 3 (1986). However, a governmental body must make a good faith effort to relate a request for information to any responsive information that is within its custody or control. *See* Open Records Decision No. 561 at 8-9 (1990).

> been a previous determination about whether the information falls within one of the exceptions.
>
> (b) The governmental body must ask for the attorney general's decision and state the exceptions that apply within a reasonable time but not later than the tenth business day after the date of receiving the written request.

Gov't Code § 552.301(a), (b). You state that the city received this request for information on July 14, 2005. Therefore, you were required to submit your request for a decision from this office no later than July 28, 2005. Your request for a decision bears a post office cancellation mark indicating it was mailed on July 29, 2005. Consequently, we find that you failed to request a decision within the ten-business-day period mandated by section 552.301(b) of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.308(a) (ten-day requirement met if request bears post office cancellation mark indicating time within ten-day period).

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless the governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.302; *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). Generally, a governmental body may demonstrate a compelling reason to withhold information by a showing that the information is made confidential by another source of law or affects third party interests. *See* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). Section 552.103 of the Government Code is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects the governmental body's interests and may be waived by the governmental body. Thus, section 552.103 does not demonstrate a compelling reason to withhold information from the public. *See Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive section 552.103); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally). Accordingly, we conclude that the city may not withhold any portion of the submitted information under section 552.103. However, portions of the submitted information may be excepted from disclosure under sections 552.117 and 552.147 of the Government Code, which can provide compelling reasons to overcome the presumption of openness. We will address the applicability of these exceptions to the submitted information.

Section 552.117(a)(1) excepts from disclosure the home addresses and telephone numbers, social security numbers, and family member information of current or former officials or employees of a governmental body who timely elect to keep this information confidential pursuant to section 552.024. Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(1). Whether a particular piece of information is protected by section 552.117(a)(1) must be determined at the time the request

for it is received by the governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). Therefore, the city may only withhold information under section 552.117(a)(1) on behalf of current or former officials or employees who made a request for confidentiality under section 552.024 prior to the date on which the request for this information was made. To the extent these employees made elections for confidentiality prior to the date on which the instant request for the information was received, we find that the city must withhold the information we have marked pursuant to section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code.

The submitted information includes the social security number of a city employee. Even if the employee did not elect to withhold his social security number under section 552.024, his social security number is confidential under section 552.147 of the Government Code.[2] Section 552.147 provides that "[t]he social security number of a living person is excepted from" required public disclosure under the Act. Therefore, if the employee did not make a timely election, the city must withhold his social security number under section 552.147.[3] The remaining submitted information must be released to the requestor.

In summary, to the extent the information we have marked pertains to city employees who timely elected confidentiality, it must be withheld under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code. If the social security number in the submitted information belongs to an employee who did not timely elect confidentiality, it must be withheld under section 552.147 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

---

[2]Added by Act of May 23, 2005, 79th Leg., R.S., S.B. 1485, § 1, sec. 552.147(a) (to be codified at Tex. Gov't Code § 552.147).

[3]We note that section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

L. Joseph James
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

LJJ/seg

Ref: ID# 233679

Enc. Submitted documents

c: requestor
(w/o enclosures)