



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

October 12, 2005

Mr. Gary Grief
Acting Executive Director
Texas Lottery Commission
P. O. Box 16630
Austin, Texas 78761-6630

OR2005-09249

Dear Mr. Grief:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 234113.

The Texas Lottery Commission (the "commission") received a request for a proposal that Dittler Brothers, Inc. ("Dittler") submitted to the commission for services related to "instant ticket printing." You indicate that the submitted information may be excepted under section 552.110 of the Government Code, but take no position as to whether this information is excepted under that section. The commission notified Oberthur Gaming Technologies Corporation, which you state now owns Dittler's lottery activities, and Ipsos America, Inc. of the commission's receipt of the request for information and of each company's right to submit arguments to this office as to why the requested information should not be released to the requestor. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in the Act in certain circumstances).

You inform us that the submitted information is identical to the information that was the subject of a previous request for information, in response to which this office issued Open Records Letter No. 2005-07407 (2005). In that ruling, we concluded that the commission must withhold the social security numbers in the submitted proposal pursuant to section 552.147 of the Government Code and must release the remaining information that

was at issue; however, in releasing this remaining information, we noted that commission must comply with copyright law in releasing any copyrighted documents. As we have no indication that there has been a change in the law, facts, or circumstances on which the prior ruling was based, we conclude that the commission must continue to rely on our decision in Open Records Letter No. 2005-07404 with respect to the submitted information. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(f); Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001) (setting forth the four criteria for a "previous determination").¹

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within ten calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental

¹The four criteria for this type of "previous determination" are (1) the records or information at issue are precisely the same records or information that were previously submitted to this office pursuant to section 552.301(e)(1)(D) of the Government Code; (2) the governmental body which received the request for the records or information is the same governmental body that previously requested and received a ruling from the attorney general; (3) the attorney general's prior ruling concluded that the precise records or information are or are not excepted from disclosure under the Act; and (4) the law, facts, and circumstances on which the prior attorney general ruling was based have not changed since the issuance of the ruling. *See* Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001).

body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within ten calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Robert B. Rapfogel
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

RBR/krl

Ref: ID# 234113

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Barb McMillin
Pollard Banknote Limited
1499 Buffalo Place
Winnipeg, Manitoba, Canada R3T1L7
(w/o enclosures)