



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

October 18, 2005

Mr. James M. Frazier, III
Assistant General Counsel
Texas Department of Criminal Justice
P.O. Box 4004
Huntsville, Texas 77342

OR2005-09439

Dear Mr. Frazier:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 234718.

The Texas Department of Criminal Justice (the "department") received a request for information related to Push-Up Foundations, Inc. ("Push Up"). While you raise no exceptions to disclosure on behalf of the department, you indicate that release of the submitted information may implicate the proprietary interests of Push Up. Accordingly, the department notified Push Up of the request and of its right to submit arguments to this office as to why the information should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (determining that statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception to disclosure under Act in certain circumstances). We have considered the claimed exceptions and reviewed the submitted information. We have also considered comments submitted by the requestor. *See* Gov't Code § 552.304 (providing that interested party may submit comments stating why information should or should not be released).

We note that Push Up seeks to withhold information that the department has not submitted to this office for review.¹ We do not reach Push Up's arguments with regard to information that has not been submitted for our review by the department. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(e)(1)(D) (governmental body requesting a decision from Attorney General must submit a copy of the specific information requested, or representative sample if voluminous amount of information was requested).

¹Specifically, Push Up seeks to withhold the audits of Push Up "for FY 2002 to present." The department submitted only portions of Push Up's FY 2004 audit and financial statements.

Push Up claims that some of the submitted information is excepted from public disclosure under section 552.110 of the Government Code, which excepts from disclosure “[c]ommercial or financial information for which it is demonstrated based on specific factual evidence that disclosure would cause substantial competitive harm to the person from whom the information was obtained.” Gov’t Code § 552.110(b). This exception to disclosure requires a specific factual or evidentiary showing, not conclusory or generalized allegations, that substantial competitive injury would likely result from release of the information at issue. *Id.*; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 661 at 5-6 (1999).

Having considered Push Up’s arguments, we find that Push Up has established that release of its financial statements would cause the company harm. Therefore the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.110(b). The remaining submitted information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov’t Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep’t of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Cindy Nettles
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CN/jpa

Ref: ID# 234718

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Lori Renteria
1511 Haskell Street
Austin, Texas 78702-5311
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Kelly A. McDonald
Brown & Carls L.L.P.
106 East Sixth Street, Suite 550
Austin, Texas 78701
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Audra Mills
Push Up Foundation
2326 East Cesar Chavez
Austin, Texas 78702
(w/o enclosures)