



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

November 14, 2005

Mr. Asem Eltiar
Assistant Police Legal Advisor
City of Arlington
P.O. Box 1065
Arlington, Texas 76004

OR2005-10232

Dear Mr. Eltiar:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 236207.

The Arlington Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a particular accident investigation and the personnel records of any and all officers involved. In a letter dated September 21, 2005, the requestor clarified and limited the personnel records request to "training and disciplinary files only," excluding "the involved officers' personal, financial, medical, income tax, driver's license numbers, employment applications, or other information in their personnel files that does not relate to the request." Due to this clarification, most of the information in Exhibit C and Exhibit D are no longer responsive to the present request. This ruling does not address the public availability of any information that is not responsive to the request, and the department is not required to release such information in Exhibits C and D in response to the request for information. *See Econ. Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266 (Tex.Civ.App.—San Antonio 1978, writ dism'd). You claim that the requested responsive information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.108 and 552.122 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

¹We assume that the representative sample of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988)*. This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Section 552.108(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See* Gov’t Code §§ 552.108(a)(1), (b)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state that Exhibit B pertains to an ongoing criminal investigation. We note that the submitted compact disc also relates to this investigation. Based on your representations and our review of the submitted information, we conclude that you have demonstrated the applicability of section 552.108 to the information at issue. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases).

However, section 552.108 does not except basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). We believe such basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-87. Thus, the department must release the types of information that are considered to be front page information, even if this information is not actually located on the front page. *See* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information made public by *Houston Chronicle*). The remaining information in Exhibit B may be withheld pursuant to section 552.108(a)(1). We note that you have the discretion to release all or part of the remaining information that is not otherwise confidential by law. Gov’t Code § 552.007.

Section 552.122(b) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure test items developed by a licensing agency or governmental body. In Open Records Decision No. 626 (1994), this office determined that the term “test item” in section 552.122 includes any standard means by which an individual’s or group’s knowledge or ability in a particular area is evaluated, but does not encompass evaluations of an employee’s overall job performance or suitability. Whether information falls within the section 552.122 exception must be determined on a case-by-case basis. Open Records Decision No. 626 at 6 (1994). This office has generally found section 552.122 to apply in cases where release of “test items” might compromise the effectiveness of future examinations. *Id.* at 4-5; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 118 (1976). Additionally, when answers to test questions might reveal the questions themselves, the answers may be withheld under section 552.122(b). *See* Open Records Decision No. 626 at 8 (1994).

You contend that portions of Exhibit E consist of test items that are excepted from disclosure under section 552.122(b) of the Government Code. You also state that the release of those test items could “give an advantage to police recruits if they are released to the public.” However, we find that the submitted information in Exhibit E consists of training reports, physical fitness assessments, defensive tactics examinations, and driving evaluations. These

items do not test any specific knowledge of an applicant. Accordingly, no part of Exhibit E may be withheld under section 552.122 of the Government Code.

We note that Exhibit E contains a driver's license number. Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information that "relates to . . . a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state [or] a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state." Gov't Code § 552.130. The department must withhold the driver's license number, which we have marked, under section 552.130.

We note that Exhibit E contains a social security number. Section 552.147 of the Government Code² provides that "[t]he social security number of a living person is excepted from" required public disclosure under the Act. The department must withhold the social security number, which we have marked, under section 552.147.³

In summary, other than basic information, the department may withhold Exhibit B and the submitted compact disc under section 552.108 of the Government Code and must withhold the marked driver's license number under section 552.130 and the marked social security number in Exhibit E under section 552.147. The remaining responsive information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

²Added by Act of May 23, 2005, 79th Leg., R.S., S.B. 1485, ch. 397, 2005 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 1091 (Vernon) (to be codified at Tex. Gov't Code § 552.147).

³We note that section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Jaime L. Flores
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JLF/jpa

Ref: ID# 236207

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Ralph Henry Bauer
101 E. Randol Mill, Suite 106
Arlington, Texas 76011
(w/o enclosures)