ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

November 14, 2005

Ms. Sharon Alexander
Associate General Counsel
Texas Department of Transportation
125 East 11th Street
Austin, Texas 78701-2483

OR2005-10234

Dear Ms. Alexander:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 236328.

The Texas Department of Transportation (the "department") received a request for copies of letters of interest from consultants who made the short-list for a particular department project. You indicate that release of the requested information may implicate the proprietary interests of the following third parties: CH2MHILL; Chiang, Patel, & Yerby, Inc.; S & B Infrastructure, Ltd.; and Dannenbaum Engineering Corp. You state that you notified these companies of the request and of their right to submit arguments to this office as to why their information should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d) (permitting interested third party to submit to attorney general reasons why requested information should not be released); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (determining that statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception to disclosure in certain circumstances). We have reviewed the submitted information.

An interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice under section 552.305(d) to submit its reasons, if any, as to why information relating to that party should be withheld from public disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B). As of the date of this letter, none of the interested third parties have submitted to this office any reasons explaining why their information should not be released. We thus have no basis for concluding that any portion of the submitted information constitutes proprietary information, and none of it may be withheld on that basis. *See, e.g.*, *id.* § 552.110; Open Records Decision Nos. 661 at 5-6 (1999) (to prevent disclosure of commercial or financial information, party must show by specific factual evidence, not conclusory or generalized allegations, that release of requested information would cause that

party substantial competitive harm), 552 at 5 (1990) (party must establish *prima facie* case that information is trade secret), 542 at 3 (1990). Accordingly, the department may not withhold any portion of the submitted information on the basis of any proprietary interest. As you claim no other exceptions from disclosure, the submitted information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for

contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

L. Joseph James
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

LJJ/seg

Ref: ID# 236328

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Salvador A. Mercado
110 Devonshire Court
Laredo, Texas 78041
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Antonio H. Arredondo
CH2MHILL
9311 San Pedro Avenue
San Antonio, Texas 78216
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Joe Arteritano, P.E.
Chiang, Patel, & Yerby, Inc.
300 East Sonterra Boulevard, Suite 430
San Antonio, Texas 78258
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Daniel Rios
S & B Infrastructure, Ltd.
5408 North 10th Street
McAllen, Texas 78504
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Louis H. Jones, Jr., P.E.
Dannenbaum Engineering Corp.
9421 Camp Bowie Boulevard, Suite 400
Fort Worth, Texas 76116
(w/o enclosures)