ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

December 8, 2005

Ms. Carolen M. Hanahan
Feldman & Rogers, L.L.P.
5718 Westheimer, Suite 1200
Houston, Texas 77057

OR2005-11005

Dear Ms. Hanahan:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 237692.

The Fort Bend Independent School District (the "district"), which you represent, received two requests for the personnel files of two named teachers. You state that some of the requested information has been released, but claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.102 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. The Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act of 1974 ("FERPA") provides that no federal funds will be made available under any applicable program to an educational agency or institution that releases personally identifiable information, other than directory information, contained in a student's education records to anyone but certain enumerated federal, state, and local officials and institutions, unless otherwise authorized by the student's parent. *See* 20 U.S.C. § 1232g(b)(1). "Education records" means those records that contain information directly related to a student and are maintained by an educational agency or institution or by a person acting for such agency or institution. *Id.* § 1232g(a)(4)(A). This office generally applies the same analysis under section 552.114 as under FERPA. Open Records Decision No. 539 (1990).

Section 552.114 excepts from disclosure student records at an educational institution funded completely or in part by state revenue. Section 552.026 provides as follows:

> This chapter does not require the release of information contained in education records of an educational agency or institution, except in conformity with the Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act of 1974, Sec. 513, Pub. L. No. 93-380, 20 U.S.C. Sec. 1232g.

Gov't Code § 552.026. In Open Records Decision No. 634 (1995), this office concluded the following: (1) an educational agency or institution may withhold from public disclosure information that is protected by FERPA and excepted from required public disclosure by sections 552.026 and 552.101 without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision as to those exceptions, and (2) an educational agency or institution that is state-funded may withhold from public disclosure information that is excepted from required public disclosure by section 552.114 as a "student record," insofar as the "student record" is protected by FERPA, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision as to that exception.

You inform us that you are withholding some of the requested information pursuant to FERPA. We note, however, that the submitted documents also contain information that identifies students. Information must be withheld from required public disclosure under FERPA only to the extent "reasonable and necessary to avoid personally identifying a particular student." *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 332 (1982), 206 (1978). Thus, the district must withhold the information we have marked under FERPA if it identifies a student. We also note that the submitted videotape contains images of students; therefore, the district must also withhold these images under FERPA. If the district is unable to redact the student images in the submitted videotape, then the district must withhold the tape in its entirety pursuant to FERPA. *See* Open Records Decision No. 364 (1983).

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code, which provides that tax return information is confidential. *See* 26 U.S.C. § 6103(a)(2), (b)(2)(A), (p)(8); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 600 (1992); Attorney General Op. MW-372 (1981). Accordingly, the W-4 tax forms in Exhibit B are confidential under section 6103(a), and the district must withhold them under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

The confidentiality of I-9 forms (Employment Eligibility Verification) is governed by section 1324a of Title 8 of the United States Code. However, the submitted information does not contain any such forms; therefore, none of the submitted information is excepted under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1324a.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the Family and Medical Leave Act (the "FMLA"), section 2654 of title 29 of the United States Code. Section 825.500 of title 29 of the Code

of Federal Regulations identifies the record-keeping requirements for employers that are subject to the FMLA. Subsection (g) of section 825.500 states the following:

> [r]ecords and documents relating to medical certifications, recertifications or medical histories of employees or employees' family members, created for purposes of FMLA, shall be maintained as confidential medical records in separate files/records from the usual personnel files, and if ADA is also applicable, such records shall be maintained in conformance with ADA confidentiality requirements[,] except that:
>
> > (1) Supervisors and managers may be informed regarding necessary restrictions on the work or duties of an employee and necessary accommodations;
> >
> > (2) First aid and safety personnel may be informed (when appropriate) if the employee's physical or medical condition might require emergency treatment; and
> >
> > (3) Government officials investigating compliance with FMLA (or other pertinent law) shall be provided relevant information upon request.

29 C.F.R. § 825.500(g). Exhibit C consists of confidential medical records for purposes of section 825.500. Therefore, Exhibit C is confidential under the FMLA, and the district must withhold it pursuant to section 552.101.[1]

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 21.355 of the Education Code, which provides that "[a] document evaluating the performance of a teacher or administrator is confidential." This office has interpreted section 21.355 to apply to any document that evaluates, as that term is commonly understood, the performance of a teacher. *See* Open Records Decision No. 643 (1996). In Open Records Decision No. 643, we determined that a "teacher" for purposes of section 21.355 means a person who (1) is required to and does in fact hold a teaching certificate under subchapter B of chapter 21 of the Education Code or a school district teaching permit under section 21.055 and (2) is engaged in the process of teaching, as that term is commonly defined, at the time of the evaluation. *See id.* at 4. On review of the information, we agree that a portion of the submitted information consists of evaluations. Thus, provided that the employees at issue were required to hold and did hold the appropriate certificates and were teaching at the time of the submitted teaching evaluations, the information we have marked under section 21.355 is confidential, and the district must withhold the evaluations under section 552.101 of the Government Code. However, we find

---

[1]As we are able to resolve this under the FMLA, we do not address your other argument for exception of Exhibit C.

that the remaining documents do not consist of evaluations for purposes of section 21.355, and the district may not withhold this information under section 552.101 on that ground.

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." In *Hubert v. Harte-Hanks Texas Newspapers*, 652 S.W.2d 546 (Tex. App.—Austin 1983, writ ref'd n.r.e.), the court ruled that the test to be applied to information claimed to be protected under section 552.102(a) is the same as the test formulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation v. Texas Industrial Accident Board*, 540 S.W.2d 668 (Tex. 1976) for information claimed to be protected under the doctrine of common law privacy as incorporated by section 552.101. Accordingly, we address the district's section 552.102(a) claim in conjunction with its common law privacy claim under section 552.101.

Common law privacy protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Prior decisions of this office have found that financial information relating only to an individual ordinarily satisfies the first requirement of the test for common law privacy but that there is a legitimate public interest in the essential facts about a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992), 545 (1990), 373 (1983). For example, information related to an individual's mortgage payments, assets, bills, and credit history is generally protected by the common law right to privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 545, 523 (1989); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 600 (finding personal financial information to include choice of particular insurance carrier). The submitted documents contain personal financial information, and we do not believe that the public has a legitimate interest in it. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 620 (1993), 600 (1992). Thus, we conclude that this information, which we have marked, is confidential under common law privacy, and the district must withhold it pursuant to section 552.101.

You claim that Exhibit F is excepted under section 552.102(b). Section 552.102(b) excepts from disclosure all information from transcripts of professional public school employees other than the employee's name, the courses taken, and the degree obtained. Gov't Code § 552.102(b); Open Records Decision No. 526 (1989). Thus, with the exception of the employee's name, courses taken, and degree obtained, the district must withhold the transcripts in Exhibit F pursuant to section 552.102(b) of the Government Code.

We note that section 552.117 of the Government Code may be applicable to some of the remaining information. Section 552.117(a)(1) excepts from disclosure the current and former home addresses and telephone numbers, and family member information of current or former officials or employees of a governmental body who request that this information be kept confidential under section 552.024. Whether information is protected by section

552.117(a)(1) must be determined at the time the request for it is made. *See* Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). Pursuant to section 552.117(a)(1), the district must withhold this personal information that pertains to a current or former employee of the district who elected, prior to the district's receipt of the request for information, to keep such information confidential. Such information may not be withheld for individuals who did not make a timely election. We have marked information that must be withheld if section 552.117 applies.

We note that some of the remaining information is excepted under section 552.136 of the Government Code. Section 552.136(b) states that "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." The district must withhold the account numbers we have marked under section 552.136.

We also note that the remaining information contains e-mail addresses. Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body" unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *See* Gov't Code § 552.137(a)-(c). Section 552.137 does not apply to a government employee's work e-mail address because such an address is not that of the employee as a "member of the public," but is instead the address of the individual as a government employee. The e-mail addresses at issue do not appear to be of a type specifically excluded by section 552.137(c), and you do not inform us that a member of the public has affirmatively consented to their release. Therefore, the district must withhold the e-mail addresses we have marked under section 552.137.

Finally, the remaining information contains social security numbers. Section 552.147 of the Government Code provides that "[t]he social security number of a living person is excepted from" required public disclosure under the Act. Therefore, the district must withhold the social security numbers we have marked under section 552.147.[2]

To conclude, pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code, the district must withhold the following: (1) the information marked under FERPA; (2) the student images in the submitted videotape, or the videotape in its entirety if the district is unable to redact this information, pursuant to FERPA; (3) the W-4 forms under section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code; (4) Exhibit C under the FMLA; (5) the marked evaluations under section 21.355 of the Education Code; and (6) the marked information that is confidential under common law privacy. With the exception of the employee's name, courses taken, and degree obtained, the district must withhold Exhibit F pursuant to section 552.102(b) of the

---

[2]We note that section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

Government Code. The district must also withhold the following: (1) the information marked under section 552.117 if the employee at issue timely elected to withhold that information; (2) the information marked under section 552.136; (3) the e-mail addresses marked under section 552.137; and (4) the social security numbers marked under section 552.147. The district must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

James L. Coggeshall
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JLC/seg

Ref: ID# 237692

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Lee Anne Klentman
806 Strange Drive
Richmond, Texas 77469
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Eric Hanson
Houston Chronicle
P.O. Box 17821
Sugar Land, Texas 77486
(w/o enclosures)