ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

January 5, 2006

Mr. John C. West
Office of the Inspector General
Texas Department of Criminal Justice
P. O. Box 13084
Austin, Texas 78711

Mr. James M. Frazier, III
Texas Department of Criminal Justice
Office of the General Counsel
P. O. Box 4004
Hunstville, Texas 77342-4004

OR2006-00146

Dear Mr. West and Mr. Frazier:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 239609.

The Texas Department of Criminal Justice (the "department") received a request for information related to seventeen deceased inmates. The department and the Office of the Inspector General (the "OIG") have submitted separate requests for a decision from this office. The department, by letter dated November 15, 2005, has withdrawn its request for a decision because the department has no information responsive to the request. The OIG states that it has previously released some responsive information to the requestor with redactions pursuant to the previous determination issued by this office in Open Records Letter No. 2005-01067 (2005) in response to a prior request for information from the requestor.[1] *See* Gov't Code § 552.232 (prescribing procedures for response to repetitious or redundant request for information). The OIG claims that the remaining requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.134 of the

[1]Open Records Letter No. 2005-01067 (2005) serves as a previous determination for the department that the present and former home addresses and telephone numbers, social security numbers, and family member information of current or former employees of the department, regardless of whether the current or former employee complies with section 552.1175 of the Government Code, are excepted from disclosure under section 552.117(a)(3) of the Government Code.

Government Code. We have considered the claimed exceptions and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note that the information submitted by the OIG includes custodial death reports. In 2003, the Office of the Attorney General (the "OAG") revised the format of a custodial death report. Previously, the report consisted of five sections. In Open Records Decision No. 521 at 5 (1989), we concluded that under article 49.18(b) of the Code of Criminal Procedure in conjunction with a directive issued by the OAG, section one of a custodial death report filed with this office was public information and must be released, but sections two through five of the report, as well as attachments to the report, were confidential. *See* Crim. Proc. Code art. 49.18(b) (attorney general shall make report, with exception of any portion of report that attorney general determines is privileged, available to any interested person). Some of the custodial death reports at issue consist of the prior format, and the OIG indicates that section one of these reports has been released to the requestor. A custodial death report now consists of two pages and an attached summary of how the death occurred. The OAG has determined that the two-page report and summary must be released to the public; however, any other documents submitted with the revised report are confidential under article 49.18 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. *See also* Open Records Decision No. 623 at 3 (1994) (exceptions to public disclosure under Act generally not applicable to information that another statute expressly makes public). Therefore, the OIG must release the revised custodial death reports and the summaries of how the deaths occurred under article 49.18 of the Code of Criminal Procedure.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate that the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. You assert that the requested information pertains to criminal cases that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Therefore, we agree that section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston,* 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Accordingly, we conclude that, with the exception of basic information that the OIG states has previously been released to the requestor, the OIG may withhold the remaining information at issue under section 552.108(a)(2). We note that you have the discretion to release all or part of the remaining information that is not otherwise confidential by law. Gov't Code § 552.007.

In summary, the OIG must release the revised custodial death reports and the summaries of how the deaths occurred under article 49.18 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. With the exception of basic information that the OIG states has previously been released to the

requestor, the OIG may withhold the remaining information at issue under section 552.108 of the Government Code.[2]

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

---

[2]Because we reach this conclusion, we need not address your remaining arguments, except to note that the information that is subject to section 552.029(8) corresponds to the basic front-page information that is made public under section 552.108(c). *See* Gov't Code § 552.108(c); *Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177, 186-188 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976); Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public in *Houston Chronicle*).

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

Cindy Nettles
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CN/er

Ref: ID# 239609

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Scott Medlock
Texas Civil Rights Project
Michael Tiger Human Rights Center
1405 Montopolis Drive
Austin, Texas 78741-3438
(w/o enclosures)