



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

May 11, 2006

Ms. Bertha A. Ontiveros
Assistant County Attorney
El Paso County
500 East San Antonio, Room 503
El Paso, Texas 79901

OR2006-04899

Dear Ms. Ontiveros:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 249208.

The El Paso Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for information regarding two specified motor vehicle accidents. You state that you have released a portion of the requested information to the requestor. You claim that the remaining information is exempted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.103, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim.

Pursuant to section 552.301 of the Government Code, a governmental body has certain procedural obligations when it receives a written request for information that it wishes to withhold. Under section 552.301(e), a governmental body is required to submit to this office within fifteen business days of receiving an open records request (1) general written comments stating the reasons why the stated exceptions apply that would allow the information to be withheld, (2) a copy of the written request for information, (3) a signed statement or sufficient evidence showing the date the governmental body received the written request, and (4) a copy of the specific information requested or representative samples, labeled to indicate which exceptions apply to which parts of the documents. Gov't Code § 552.301(e)(1)(A)-(D). You state that the council received the request for information on February 23, 2006. Thus, the fifteen-business-day deadline to comply with section 552.301(e) was March 16, 2006. However, as of the date of this letter you have not submitted a copy or representative sample of the requested information, nor written comments stating the reasons why the exceptions that you raised would allow the information to be withheld. Accordingly, we conclude that you have failed to comply with section 552.301 with respect to this information.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released. Information that is presumed public must be released unless a governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information to overcome this presumption. See Gov't Code § 552.302; *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). Normally, a compelling reason to withhold information exists where some other source of law makes the information confidential or where third party interests are at stake. See Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977). Sections 552.103 and 552.108 of the Government Code are discretionary exceptions to disclosure that protect a governmental body's interests and may be waived. See *Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive section 552.103); Open Records Decisions No. 542 at 4 (1990) (statutory predecessor to section 552.103 subject to waiver), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver); Open Records Decision No. 655 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally). Thus, the sheriff's office may not withhold any of the requested information under section 552.103 or section 552.108 of the Government Code.

The other exceptions you raise, sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code, are mandatory exceptions and each may constitute a compelling reason that overcomes the presumption of openness caused by a failure to comply with section 552.301. See Gov't Code §§ 552.007, .352; Open Records Decision No. 674 at 3 n.4 (2001) (mandatory exceptions). However, because you have not submitted the requested information, we have no basis for finding that the information is excepted from disclosure under these exceptions. Thus, we have no choice but to order the information released per section 552.302. If you believe the information is confidential and may not lawfully be released, you must challenge the ruling in court as outlined below.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Brian J. Rogers
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

BJR/krl

Ref: ID# 249208

c: Mr. Christopher Shane
Northpointe Professional Center
8815 Dyer Street, Suite 150
El Paso, Texas 79904
(w/o enclosures)