



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

May 30, 2006

Mr. Charles H. Weir
Assistant City Attorney
City of San Antonio
P. O. Box 839966
San Antonio, Texas 78283-3966

OR2006-05636

Dear Mr. Weir:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 250107.

The San Antonio Police Department (the "department") received a request for a specified case file. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we must address the department's obligations under the Act. Pursuant to section 552.301(b) of the Government Code, a governmental body must ask for the attorney general's decision and state the exceptions that apply within ten business days after receiving the request. *See Gov't Code § 552.301(a), (b)*. You inform us that the department received the present request on February 13, 2006. However, you did not request a ruling from this office until March 23, 2006. *See Gov't Code § 552.308* (describing rules for calculating submission dates of documents sent via first class United States mail, common or contract carrier, or interagency mail). Consequently, we find that the department failed to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless a compelling reason exists for withholding the information from disclosure. *See Gov't Code § 552.302; Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). Generally speaking, a compelling reason exists when third party interests are at stake or when information is confidential by law. Open Records Decision No. 150

(1977). Because section 552.101 can provide a compelling reason to withhold information, we will address your argument under this exception.

Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 261.201 of the Family Code. This section provides as follows:

(a) The following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

(h) This section does not apply to an investigation of child abuse or neglect in a home or facility regulated under Chapter 42, Human Resources Code.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (h). You assert that the submitted information consists of working papers used in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse. However, section 261.201 does not apply to an investigation of child abuse or neglect in a home or facility regulated under chapter 42 of the Human Resources Code. *See id.* § 261.201(h). You have informed us, and the documents reflect, that the alleged incident at issue occurred at a child care facility that is regulated by the Texas Department of Family and Protective Services under chapter 42 of the Human Resources Code. We therefore find that section 261.201 is not applicable to the investigation at issue, and we determine that the department may not withhold any of the submitted information on that basis.

We note, however, that the submitted report contains information excepted from disclosure under chapter 411 of the Government Code. Section 552.101 also encompasses confidentiality relating to criminal history record information ("CHRI"). CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center ("NCIC") or by the Texas Crime Information Center ("TCIC") is confidential. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains,

except that the DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083.

Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090 - .127. Thus, any CHRI generated by the federal government or another state may not be made available to the requestor except in accordance with federal regulations. *See* ORD 565. Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. We have marked the CHRI in the submitted records that must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411 of the Government Code.

We further note that the submitted information contains medical records, access to which is specifically addressed by the Medical Practice Act, (the "MPA"), chapter 159 of the Occupations Code. ORD 565 at 7. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides in pertinent part:

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002(b), (c). As the patient is a minor, the medical records may be released only on the signed consent of the parent or legal guardian of the patient. Occ. Code § 159.005(a)(2). That consent must specify (1) the information to be covered by the release, (2) reasons or purposes for the release, and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. Occ. Code §§ 159.004, .005. As the attorney for the parents of the child who is the subject of the records, the requestor may have a right of access to that information under the MPA. We have marked the documents that are medical records and may only be released in accordance with the MPA. *See* Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991).

We also note that some of the submitted information is excepted under section 552.130 of the Government Code, which excepts from disclosure information relating to a Texas motor vehicle driver's license and information relating to a Texas motor vehicle title or registration. Gov't Code § 552.130. We note, however, that the requestor is the attorney for two of the

individuals to whom a portion of the Texas motor vehicle record information at issue pertains. Therefore, the requestor has a special right of access to such information under section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See id.* § 552.023(b) (governmental body may not deny access to person to whom information relates or person's agent on grounds that information is considered confidential by privacy principles). We have marked the Texas motor vehicle record information that the department must withhold under section 552.130.

We also note that the submitted information contains social security numbers. Section 552.147 of the Government Code provides that "[t]he social security number of a living person is excepted from" required public disclosure under the Act. In this instance, the requestor is the attorney for two individuals whose social security numbers are at issue. Therefore, the requestor has a right of access to his clients' social security numbers pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See id.* § 552.023(b). The department must withhold the social security numbers we have marked in the submitted information under section 552.147.¹

In summary, the department may only release the marked medical records in accordance with the MPA. The department must withhold the following: 1) the CHRI we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411 of the Government Code; 2) the marked Texas motor vehicle record information pursuant to section 552.130 of the Government Code; and 3) the social security numbers marked in the submitted information under section 552.147 of the Government Code.² The remaining submitted information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by

¹We note that section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

²We note that some of the submitted documents contain confidential information that is not subject to release to the general public. *See* Gov't Code § 552.352. However, as the attorney representing the parents of the minor with the privacy interest, the requestor has a special right of access to this information. Gov't Code § 552.023. Because some of the information is confidential with respect to the general public, if the department receives a future request for this information from an individual other than the requestor or her clients, the department should again seek our decision.

filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Candice M. De La Garza
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CMD/krl

Ref: ID# 240107

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Yolanda Moralez
Law Offices of Pat Maloney, P.C.
322 West Woodlawn Avenue
San Antonio, Texas 78212
(w/o enclosures)