



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

June 9, 2006

Ms. Beverly West Stephens
Assistant City Attorney
City of San Antonio
P.O. Box 839966
San Antonio, Texas 78283-3966

OR2006-06113

Dear Ms. Stephens:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 251195.

The City of San Antonio (the "city") received two requests for (1) all information about the licensing of a named taxi driver; and (2) copies of the file for a named taxi cab company. You claim that portions of the requested information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.122, 552.130, 552.136, and 552.147 of the Government Code. You also contend that information responsive to category two of the request may constitute proprietary information subject to exception under the Act. Pursuant to section 552.305(d) of the Government Code, you have notified Yellow Checker Cab of the request and of its opportunity to submit comments to this office. *See Gov't Code § 552.305* (permitting interested third party to submit to attorney general reasons why requested information should not be released); Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (determining that statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception to disclosure in certain circumstances). We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note that an interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice under section 552.305(d) to submit its reasons, if any, as to why information relating to that party should be withheld from public disclosure. *See Gov't Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B)*. As of the date of this letter, Yellow Checker Cab has

not submitted to this office any reasons explaining why the submitted information should not be released. We thus have no basis for concluding that any portion of the submitted information constitutes proprietary information pertaining to Yellow Checker Cab, and none of it may be withheld on that basis. *See* Gov't Code § 552.110; Open Records Decision Nos. 661 at 5-6 (1999) (to prevent disclosure of commercial or financial information, party must show by specific factual evidence, not conclusory or generalized allegations, that release of requested information would cause that party substantial competitive harm), 552 at 5 (1990) (party must establish *prima facie* case that information is trade secret), 542 at 3 (1990).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses other statutes. We note that the submitted documents include a ST-3 accident report form completed pursuant to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. *See* Transp. Code § 550.064 (Texas Peace Officer's Accident Report form). Section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code states that except as provided by subsection (c), accident reports are privileged and confidential. Section 550.065(c)(4) provides for the release of accident reports to a person who provides two of the following three pieces of information: (1) date of the accident; (2) name of any person involved in the accident; and (3) specific location of the accident. Transp. Code § 550.065(c)(4). Under this provision, the Department of Public Safety or another governmental body is required to release a copy of an accident report to a person who provides the governmental body with two or more pieces of information specified by the statute. *Id.* In the present request, the requestor has not provided the required information. Accordingly, the city must withhold the submitted accident report form pursuant to section 552.101 in conjunction with 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses information protected by other statutes. As you acknowledge, the submitted documents contain an I-9 form (Employment Eligibility Verification) and appended identification forms, which are governed by section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code. This section provides that an I-9 form and "any information contained in or appended to such form, may not be used for purposes other than for enforcement of this chapter" and for enforcement of other federal statutes governing crime and criminal investigations. *See* 8 U.S.C. § 1324a(b)(5); *see also* 8 C.F.R. § 274a.2(b)(4). Release of this information in this instance would be "for purposes other than for enforcement" of the referenced federal statutes. Therefore, we conclude that the I-9 form and the appended identification forms are confidential and may only be released in compliance with the federal laws and regulations governing the employment verification system. However, section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code does not apply to the remaining information you have marked. Therefore, this information may not be withheld on that basis.

Section 552.101 also encompasses criminal history record information ("CHRI") generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center.

Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except that the DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090 - .127. Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with chapter 411, subchapter F. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.082(2)(B) (term CHRI does not include driving record information). Therefore, the city must withhold the CHRI that we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with federal law and chapter 411 of the Government Code.

Next, we address your argument for the submitted fingerprints. Section 552.101 encompasses sections 560.001, 560.002, and 560.003 of the Government Code. These sections govern the public availability of fingerprint information and provide as follows:

Sec. 560.001. DEFINITIONS. In this chapter:

- (1) “Biometric identifier” means a retina or iris scan, fingerprint, voiceprint, or record of hand or face geometry.
- (2) “Governmental body” has the meaning assigned by Section 552.003 [of the Government Code], except that the term includes each entity within or created by the judicial branch of state government.

Sec. 560.002. DISCLOSURE OF BIOMETRIC IDENTIFIER. A governmental body that possesses a biometric identifier of an individual:

- (1) may not sell, lease, or otherwise disclose the biometric identifier to another person unless:
 - (A) the individual consents to the disclosure;
 - (B) the disclosure is required or permitted by a federal statute or by a state statute other than Chapter 552 [of the Government Code]; or

(C) the disclosure is made by or to a law enforcement agency for a law enforcement purpose; and

(2) shall store, transmit, and protect from disclosure the biometric identifier using reasonable care and in a manner that is the same as or more protective than the manner in which the governmental body stores, transmits, and protects its other confidential information.

Sec. 560.003. APPLICATION OF CHAPTER 552. A biometric identifier in the possession of a governmental body is exempt from disclosure under Chapter 552.

Gov't Code § 560.001-.003. You state that there is no indication that the requestor has a right of access to this information under section 560.002. Therefore, the city must withhold the marked fingerprint information under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code.

Next, the submitted information contains medical records. The Medical Practice Act ("MPA"), chapter 159 of the Occupations Code, governs access to medical record information. Section 159.002 provides in pertinent part:

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002(b), (c); *see* Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). The MPA requires that any subsequent release of medical records be consistent with the purposes for which a governmental body obtained the records. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). Moreover, information that is subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. *See* Occ. Code § 159.002(a), (b), (c); Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). We have marked the medical records in the submitted information that are subject to the MPA. Absent the applicability of an MPA access provision, the city must withhold this information pursuant to the MPA.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common law privacy. Common law privacy protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable

person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. In addition, this office has found that the following types of information are excepted from required public disclosure under common law privacy: personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992), 545 (1990); some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps); and identities of victims of sexual abuse, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 440 (1986), 393 (1983), 339 (1982). Upon review, the city must withhold the information we have marked pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common law privacy.

Section 552.122(b) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure test items developed by a licensing agency or governmental body. In Open Records Decision No. 626 (1994), this office determined that the term "test item" in section 552.122 includes any standard means by which an individual's or group's knowledge or ability in a particular area is evaluated, but does not encompass evaluations of an employee's overall job performance or suitability. Whether information falls within the section 552.122 exception must be determined on a case-by-case basis. Open Records Decision No. 626 at 6 (1994). Having reviewed the information at issue, we agree that it constitutes "test items" as contemplated by section 552.122(b). Therefore, you may withhold the information at issue under section 552.122(b).

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information [that] relates to . . . a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state [or] a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state." Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1), (2). Thus, the city must withhold the Texas driver's license and motor vehicle registration information we have marked under section 552.130.

The remaining documents also contain insurance policy numbers and bank account numbers. Section 552.136 of the Government Code states that "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." Gov't Code § 552.136. The city must, therefore, withhold the insurance policy numbers and bank account numbers we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. You fail to explain, however, how any of the remaining information you have marked constitutes an access device number for purposes of section 552.136. Accordingly, the city must only withhold the information we have marked pursuant to section 552.136 of the Government Code.

We note that the submitted documents contain an e-mail address that section 552.137 of the Government Code exempts from disclosure.¹ Section 552.137 exempts from disclosure “an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body” unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *See* Gov’t Code § 552.137(a)-(c). The e-mail address we have marked is not of the type specifically excluded by section 552.137(c). Therefore, unless the individual at issue consented to the release of her e-mail address, the city must withhold it in accordance with section 552.137 of the Government Code.

A social security number is confidential pursuant to section 552.147 of the Government Code, which provides that “[t]he social security number of a living person is excepted from” required public disclosure under the Act. Gov’t Code § 552.147. Accordingly, the city must withhold the marked social security number pursuant to section 552.147 of the Government Code.²

Finally, we note that a portion of the remaining submitted information is protected by copyright. A custodian of public records must comply with the copyright law and is not required to furnish copies of records that are copyrighted. Attorney General Opinion JM-672 (1987). A governmental body must allow inspection of copyrighted materials unless an exception applies to the information. *Id.* If a member of the public wishes to make copies of copyrighted materials, the person must do so unassisted by the governmental body. In making copies, the member of the public assumes the duty of compliance with the copyright law and the risk of a copyright infringement suit. *See* Open Records Decision No. 550 (1990).

In conclusion, the city must withhold the marked ST-3 form under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code. In addition, the city must withhold the marked I-9 form and appended identification forms, as well as the CHRI under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law. Next, the city must withhold the marked fingerprint information under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code, the submitted medical records under section 552.101 in conjunction with the MPA, and the marked information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common law privacy. The city must also withhold the marked test items under section 552.122 of the Government Code, the marked Texas driver’s

¹ The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

²We note that section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person’s social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

license and motor vehicle information under section 552.130 of the Government Code, the marked e-mail address under section 552.137 of the Government Code, and the marked social security number under section 552.147 of the Government Code. The remaining submitted information must be released in accordance with applicable copyright law.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for

contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Anne Prentice
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

AP/sdk

Ref: ID# 251195

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Linda Garner
Legal Investigator
Robert M. Hagy, Legal Investigations
P.O. Box 790272
San Antonio, Texas 78279-0272
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Michael Barnard
General Manager
Yellow Checker Cab
11146 IH 35 North
San Antonio, Texas 78233
(w/o enclosures)