



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

July 11, 2006

Ms. Cynthia Villarreal-Reyna  
Section Chief, Agency Counsel  
Legal and Compliance Division, Mail Code 110-1A  
Texas Department of Insurance  
P. O. Box 149104  
Austin, Texas 78714-9104

OR2006-07310

Dear Ms. Villarreal-Reyna:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 253655.

The Texas Department of Insurance (the "department") received a request for the rules and rates manuals and underwriting guidelines for five named companies. You claim that portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under section 552.137 of the Government Code. Although you take no position regarding the public availability of the remaining requested information, you state that release of this information may implicate third party proprietary interests. Thus, pursuant to section 552.305 of the Government Code, you have notified the following entities of the request and each entity's right to submit arguments to this office: State Farm Lloyds ("State Farm"); Allstate Texas Lloyds ("Allstate"); Farmers Insurance Exchange ("Farmers"); Travelers Lloyds of Texas ("Travelers"); and Nationwide Lloyds ("Nationwide") of the request and of each company's right to submit arguments to this office as to why the information should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (determining that statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception to disclosure under the Act in certain circumstances). We have reviewed the submitted information and considered the submitted arguments.

Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body" unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail

address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). See Gov't Code § 552.137(a)-(c). The e-mail addresses at issue do not appear to be of a type specifically excluded by section 552.137(c). You do not inform us that a member of the public has affirmatively consented to the release of any e-mail address contained in the submitted materials. Therefore, the department must withhold the e-mail addresses you have marked under section 552.137.

Next, we note an interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice under section 552.305(d) to submit its reasons, if any, as to why requested information relating to that party should be withheld from disclosure. See Gov't Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B). As of the date of this letter, Travelers has not submitted any arguments to this office explaining how release of the submitted information would affect its proprietary interests. Therefore, Travelers has provided us with no basis to conclude that it has a protected proprietary interest in the submitted information. See, e.g., Gov't Code § 552.110(b) (to prevent disclosure of commercial or financial information, party must show by specific factual or evidentiary material, not conclusory or generalized allegations, that it actually faces competition and that substantial competitive injury would likely result from disclosure); Open Records Decision Nos. 552 at 5 (1990) (party must establish *prima facie* case that information is trade secret), 542 at 3 (1990). Accordingly, we conclude that the department may not withhold any of the submitted information based on any proprietary interest Travelers may have in the information.

State Farm, Allstate, Farmers, and Nationwide each assert that its respective information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.110 of the Government Code. Section 552.110(a) excepts from disclosure "[a] trade secret obtained from a person and privileged or confidential by statute or judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.110(a). The Texas Supreme Court has adopted the definition of trade secret from section 757 of the Restatement of Torts. *Hyde Corp. v. Huffines*, 314 S.W.2d 763 (Tex. 1958); see also Open Records Decision No. 552 at 2 (1990). Section 757 provides that a trade secret is

any formula, pattern, device or compilation of information which is used in one's business, and which gives him an opportunity to obtain an advantage over competitors who do not know or use it. It may be a formula for a chemical compound, a process of manufacturing, treating or preserving materials, a pattern for a machine or other device, or a list of customers. It differs from other secret information in a business . . . in that it is not simply information as to single or ephemeral events in the conduct of the business. . . . A trade secret is a process or device for continuous use in the operation of the business. . . . [It may] relate to the sale of goods or to other operations in the business, such as a code for determining discounts, rebates or other concessions in a price list or catalogue, or a list of specialized customers, or a method of bookkeeping or other office management.

RESTATEMENT OF TORTS § 757 cmt. b (1939); see also *Huffines*, 314 S.W.2d at 776. In determining whether particular information constitutes a trade secret, this office considers

the Restatement's definition of trade secret as well as the Restatement's list of six trade secret factors.<sup>1</sup> RESTATEMENT OF TORTS § 757 cmt. b (1939). This office has held that if a governmental body takes no position with regard to the application of the trade secret branch of section 552.110 to requested information, we must accept a private person's claim for exception as valid under that branch if that person establishes a *prima facie* case for exception and no argument is submitted that rebuts the claim as a matter of law. Open Records Decision No. 552 at 5-6 (1990). However, we cannot conclude that section 552.110(a) applies unless it has been shown that the information meets the definition of a trade secret and the necessary factors have been demonstrated to establish a trade secret claim. See Open Records Decision No. 402 (1983).

Having considered the arguments of State Farm, Allstate, Farmers, and Nationwide and reviewed the information at issue, we find that the underwriting guidelines and manuals constitute trade secrets for purposes of section 552.110(a). We thus determine that State Farm, Allstate, Farmers, and Nationwide have made *prima facie* cases under section 552.110(a) for that information, and we have received no arguments to rebut their claims. Accordingly, the department must withhold the underwriting guidelines and rules in the submitted information pursuant to section 552.110(a) of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold the e-mail addresses you have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code. The department must also withhold the underwriting guidelines and rules of State Farm, Allstate, Farmers, and Nationwide pursuant to section 552.110(a) of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days.

---

<sup>1</sup>The following are the six factors that the Restatement gives as indicia of whether information constitutes a trade secret: (1) the extent to which the information is known outside of [the company]; (2) the extent to which it is known by employees and others involved in [the company's] business; (3) the extent of measures taken by [the company] to guard the secrecy of the information; (4) the value of the information to [the company] and [its] competitors; (5) the amount of effort or money expended by [the company] in developing the information; (6) the ease or difficulty with which the information could be properly acquired or duplicated by others. RESTATEMENT OF TORTS § 757 cmt. b (1939); see also Open Records Decision Nos. 319 at 2 (1982), 306 at 2 (1982), 255 at 2 (1980).

*Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Brian J. Rogers  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

BJR/krl

Ref: ID# 253655

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Ron B. Bates  
Assistant Vice president  
P & C Product Management  
Horace Mann Insurance Company  
1 Horace Mann Plaza  
Springfield, Illinois 62715  
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Fred J. Marsh  
Attorney for Service  
State Farm Lloyds  
17301 Preston Road  
Dallas, Texas 75252-5727  
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Barry L. Thomas  
Director/Asst. Secretary-Treasurer  
State Farm Lloyds  
Corporate Headquarters  
One State Farm Plaza, D-4  
Bloomington, Illinois 61710  
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Kurt D. Cagle  
Allstate Texas Lloyds  
2775 Sanders Road, Suite A-5  
Northbrook, Illinois 60062  
(w/o enclosures)

CT Corporation System  
Attorney for Service--Allstate  
350 North St. Paul Street  
Dallas, Texas 75201  
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Gerald Galvan  
Attorney for Service – Farmers  
100 Farmers Circle  
Round Rock, Texas 78728-1236  
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Karen J. Rottner  
State Filing Consultant  
Travelers-Personal Lines  
Regulatory Affairs - 10PB  
One Tower Square  
Hartford, Connecticut 06183  
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Thomas B. Schaffner  
Travelers Lloyds of Texas  
1301 East Collins Blvd.  
Richardson, Texas 75081  
(w/o enclosures)

CT Corporation System  
Attorney for Service – Nationwide  
350 North St. Paul Street  
Dallas, Texas 75201  
(w/o enclosures)