



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

August 1, 2006

Ms. Jerris Penrod Mapes
Assistant City Attorney
City of Killeen
402 North Second Street
Killeen, Texas 76541-5298

OR2006-08502

Dear Ms. Mapes:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 255690.

The Killeen Police Department (the "department") received a request for eighteen categories of information pertaining to a named police officer. You state that you will release some of the requested information but claim that the remaining requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.117 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information that other statutes make confidential. You claim that some of the submitted information is confidential under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 143.089 of the Local Government Code.¹ Section 143.089 provides for the existence of two different types of personnel files relating to a police officer, including one that must be maintained as part of the officer's civil service file and another that the police department may maintain for its own internal use. *See* Local Gov't Code § 143.089(a), (g). The officer's civil service file must contain certain specified

¹You inform us that the City of Killeen is a civil service municipality under chapter 143 of the Local Government Code.

items, including commendations, periodic evaluations by the police officer's supervisor, and documents relating to any misconduct in any instance in which the department took disciplinary action against the officer under chapter 143 of the Local Government Code. *Id.* § 143.089(a)(1)-(2). Chapter 143 prescribes the following types of disciplinary actions: removal, suspension, demotion, and uncompensated duty. *Id.* §§ 143.051-.055.

In cases in which a police department investigates a police officer's misconduct and takes disciplinary action against an officer, it is required by section 143.089(a)(2) to place all investigatory records relating to the investigation and disciplinary action, including background documents such as complaints, witness statements, and documents of like nature from individuals who were not in a supervisory capacity, in the police officer's civil service file maintained under section 143.089(a). *See Abbott v. Corpus Christi*, 109 S.W.3d 113, 122 (Tex. App.—Austin 2003, no pet.). All investigatory materials in a case resulting in disciplinary action are "from the employing department" when they are held by or are in the possession of the department because of its investigation into a police officer's misconduct, and the department must forward them to the civil service commission for placement in the civil service personnel file. *Id.* Such records may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 143.089 of the Local Government Code. *See Local Gov't Code* § 143.089(f); Open Records Decision No. 562 at 6 (1990). Information relating to alleged misconduct or disciplinary action taken must be removed from the police officer's civil service file if the police department determines that there is insufficient evidence to sustain the charge of misconduct or that the disciplinary action was taken without just cause. *See Local Gov't Code* § 143.089(b)-(c).

Subsection (g) of section 143.089 authorizes the police department to maintain, for its own use, a separate and independent internal personnel file relating to a police officer. Section 143.089(g) provides as follows:

A fire or police department may maintain a personnel file on a fire fighter or police officer employed by the department for the department's use, but the department may not release any information contained in the department file to any agency or person requesting information relating to a fire fighter or police officer. The department shall refer to the director or the director's designee a person or agency that requests information that is maintained in the fire fighter's or police officer's personnel file.

Id. § 143.089(g). In *City of San Antonio v. Texas Attorney General*, 851 S.W.2d 946 (Tex. App.—Austin 1993, writ denied), the court addressed a request for information contained in a police officer's personnel file maintained by the police department for its use and the applicability of section 143.089(g) to that file. The records included in the departmental personnel file related to complaints against the police officer for which no disciplinary action was taken. The court determined that section 143.089(g) made these records confidential. *See City of San Antonio*, 851 S.W.2d at 949 (concluding that "the legislature intended to

deem confidential the information maintained by the . . . police department for its own use under subsection (g)"); *see also City of San Antonio v. San Antonio Express-News*, 47 S.W.3d 556 (Tex. App.—San Antonio 2000, no pet.) (restricting confidentiality under Local Gov't Code § 143.089(g) to "information reasonably related to a police officer's or fire fighter's employment relationship"); Attorney General Opinion JC-0257 at 6-7 (2000) (addressing functions of Local Gov't Code § 143.089(a) and (g) files).

You indicate that the information submitted as Attachment C is contained in a file maintained by the department under section 143.089(g) of the Local Government Code. Based on your representation and our review of the information at issue, we conclude that Attachment C must be withheld from the requestor in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 143.089(g) of the Local Government Code.

You indicate that the remaining information is held in the officer's civil service file. You claim that portions of this information are subject to section 521.051 of the Transportation Code. This section provides that the department "may not disclose class-type listings from the basic driver's license file to any person" except in certain situations as set out in section 521.049(c) of the Transportation Code. In Open Records Decision No. 618 (1993), this office determined that the purpose of the statutory predecessor to section 521.051 "appears to be to relieve the department of the administrative burden of compiling a list based primarily on location and existence of traffic convictions, i.e., a class type list, when the requestor does not have individual driver's license numbers or names."² *Id* at 3. We agreed that the provision limits access when the requestor seeks license listings by specific type, such as "a list of licensees who have traffic convictions on file, or a list of those who might be subject to administrative hearings to suspend their license." *Id*.

You assert that portions of the remaining information pertaining to "a person's driver's license" are subject to section 521.051. However, upon review we conclude that the remaining information does not include a class-type listing from the basic driver's license file. Thus, section 521.051 does not relieve the department of the burden of releasing the remaining information. Therefore, the remaining information may only be withheld if it is subject to an exception under the Act. Consequently, we will address your arguments for the remaining information.

You also claim that portions of the remaining information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.117. Section 552.101 also encompasses chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. The remaining information includes an ST-3 accident report form completed pursuant to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. *See* Transp. Code § 550.064

²We noted in Open Records Decision No. 618 (1993) that while section 521.051 restricts access to class listings, it does not make the information confidential by law under section 552.101 of the Government Code. *See id.* at 3 n.3.

(Texas Peace Officer's Accident Report form). Section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code states that except as provided by subsection (c), accident reports are privileged and confidential. Section 550.065(c)(4) provides for the release of accident reports to a person who provides two of the following three pieces of information: (1) date of the accident; (2) name of any person involved in the accident; and (3) specific location of the accident. Transp. Code § 550.065(c)(4). In this instance, the requestor has not provided the department with two of the three pieces of information specified by section 550.065. Thus, you must withhold the accident report form under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code.

Section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure a peace officer's home address, home telephone number, social security number, and information indicating whether the peace officer has family members, regardless of whether the officer complies with section 552.024 or section 552.1175. *See* Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(2). Section 552.117(a)(2) applies to peace officers as defined by article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. Upon review, however, we conclude that no portion of the remaining information is encompassed by section 552.117(a)(2). Therefore, none of the remaining information may be withheld on this basis.

We note that the submitted information includes Texas-issued motor vehicle record information. Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides the following:

(a) Information is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if the information relates to:

(1) a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state; [or]

(2) a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state[.]

Gov't Code § 552.130(a). We have marked the Texas motor vehicle record information that must be withheld under section 552.130.

Finally, we note that the remaining submitted information contains social security numbers. Section 552.147 of the Government Code provides that "[t]he social security number of a living person is excepted from" required public disclosure under the Act. Therefore, the department must withhold the social security numbers contained in the submitted information under section 552.147.³

³We note that section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

In summary, the information submitted as Attachment C must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 143.089(g) of the Local Government Code. The remaining information includes an ST-3 accident report form that must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code. The Texas motor vehicle record information we have marked must be withheld under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The social security number we have marked must be withheld under section 552.147 of the Government Code. The remaining submitted information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or

complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



L. Joseph James
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

LJJ/dh

Ref: ID# 255690

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Jesse T. Hernandez
Michalk, Beatty & Alcozer, L.P.
3106 South W.S. Young
Building D, Suite 401
Killeen, Texas 76542
(w/o enclosures)