



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

August 10, 2006

Ms. Leslie R. Sweet
Legal Advisor
Dallas County Sheriff's Department
Frank Crowley Courts Bldg., 1st Floor
133 N Industrial Blvd., Lb-31
Dallas Texas 75207

OR2006-09043

Dear Ms. Sweet:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 256257.

The Dallas County Sheriff's Department (the "department") received a request for copies of all department records related to a specified accident report number, including copies of the crash report, incident report, call sheet, field notes, and photographs.¹ You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we must address the department's procedural obligations under section 552.301 of the Government Code. Pursuant to section 552.301(e), a governmental body is required to submit to this office within fifteen business days of receiving an open records request (1) general written comments stating the reasons why the stated exceptions apply that would allow the information to be withheld, (2) a copy of the written request for information, (3) a signed statement or sufficient evidence showing the date the governmental body received the written request, and (4) a copy of the specific information requested or representative samples, labeled to indicate which exceptions apply to which parts of the documents. Gov't

¹As you have not submitted a complete copy of the request, we take our description from the first page of the request and from your brief.

Code § 552.301(e)(1)(A)-(D). In this instance, you submitted an incomplete copy of the written request for information that did not include all of the specific information requested. Additionally, as you have acknowledged, you have not submitted the requested photographs for our review. Consequently, the department failed to comply with the requirements of section 552.301.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released. Information that is presumed public must be released unless a governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information to overcome this presumption. *See* Gov't Code § 552.302; *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). Normally, a compelling reason to withhold information exists where some other source of law makes the information confidential or where third-party interests are at stake. *See* Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977). Section 552.108 of the Government Code is a discretionary exception to disclosure and therefore does not provide compelling reasons to overcome the presumption of openness. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 522 at 4 (1989) (discretionary exceptions in general), 177 (1977) (governmental body may waive statutory predecessor to Gov't Code § 552.108). *But see* Open Records Decision No. 586 (1991) (need of another governmental body to withhold information may provide compelling reason for non-disclosure under Gov't Code § 552.108). Thus, the department may not withhold any of the submitted information pursuant to section 552.108.

We note, however, that the submitted information contains Texas driver's license and motor vehicle information. Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information that "relates to . . . a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state [or] a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state." Gov't Code § 552.130. The department must withhold the Texas driver's license and motor vehicle information we have marked pursuant to section 552.130.

We also note that the submitted information contains an account number. Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides in relevant part:

(a) In this section, "access device" means a card, plate, code, account number, personal identification number, electronic serial number, mobile identification number, or other telecommunications service, equipment, or instrument identifier or means of account access that alone or in conjunction with another access device may be used to:

(1) obtain money, goods, services, or another thing of value; or

(2) initiate a transfer of funds other than a transfer originated solely by paper instrument.

(b) Notwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.

Gov't Code § 552.136. The department must withhold the account number we have marked pursuant to section 552.136.

In summary, the department must withhold the information we have marked pursuant to sections 552.130 and 552.136 of the Government Code. The remaining submitted information must be released to the requestor. Pursuant to section 552.302, any remaining responsive information that has not been submitted for our review must be released to the requestor. We caution that the release of confidential information constitutes a criminal offense. Gov't Code § 552.352.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Jaime L. Flores
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JLF/ir

Ref: ID# 256257

Enc. Submitted documents

C: Ms. Deeanne Ellis
Jenkins & Jenkins
Attorneys at Law
516 West Main Street
Waxahachie Texas 75165
(w/o enclosures)