



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

November 7, 2006

Ms. Sylvia McClellan
Assistant City Attorney
Criminal Law and Police Section
City of Dallas
1400 South Lamar Street, #300A
Dallas, Texas 76215-1801

OR2006-13163

Dear Ms. McClellan:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 264282.

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request for the criminal reports related to a certain property for the past three years. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." This section encompasses section 261.201(a) of the Family Code, which provides as follows:

(a) The following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

¹We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). You claim that report number 264388 is subject to section 261.201. Upon review, we find that report number 264388 was used or developed in an investigation under chapter 261. *See id.* § 261.001 (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of Family Code, ch. 261). Thus, this information is within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. You do not inform us that the department has adopted any rules that govern the release of this type of information. Thus, we assume that no such rules exist. Therefore, we find that report number 264388 is confidential pursuant to section 261.201 of the Family Code and must be withheld under section 552.101. *See Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute).*

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 58.007 of the Family Code, which you claim exempts report numbers 0008195, 0295991, and 0299832. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997 are confidential under section 58.007. Section 58.007(c) provides as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapter B.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). Section 51.02(2)(A) defines “child” as a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age. *See id.* § 51.02(2)(A). Upon review, we find that report numbers 0008195, 0295991, and 0299832 involve juvenile delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred after September 1, 1997. *See id.* § 51.03 (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision”). Accordingly, the department must withhold report

numbers 0008195, 0295991, and 0299832 under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses chapter 411 of the Government Code. You argue that some of the remaining police reports contain criminal history record information ("CHRI") generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except that the DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090 - .127. Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. Upon review, we agree that the CHRI you have marked must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with chapter 411 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common law privacy. Common law privacy protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Industrial Found. v. Texas Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. This office has also found that the following types of information are excepted from required public disclosure under common law privacy: some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps), 343 at 1-2 (1982) (references in emergency medical records to drug overdose, acute alcohol intoxication, obstetrical/gynecological illness, convulsions/seizures, or emotional/mental distress); and the identities of victims of sexual abuse, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 440 (1986), 393 (1983). We have marked the information that must be withheld under common law privacy.

Section 552.108(a) excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime." Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law

enforcement. See Gov't Code §§ 552.108(a)(1), (b)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); see also *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You inform us that some of the information you have marked relates to pending criminal cases. Based on your representation and our review, we conclude that the release of the information you have marked would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. See *Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases). Thus, you may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1).

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information that “relates to . . . a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license or permit issued by an agency of this state [or] a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state.” Gov’t Code § 552.130. Thus, the department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle information you have marked, in addition to the information we have marked, in accordance with section 552.130.

Finally, we note that the remaining submitted information contains a social security number. Section 552.147 of the Government Code provides that “[t]he social security number of a living person is excepted from” required public disclosure under Act. Therefore, the department must withhold the social security number contained in the submitted information under section 552.147.²

In summary, report number 264388 is confidential pursuant to section 261.201 of the Family Code and must be withheld under section 552.101. The department must withhold report numbers 0008195, 0295991, and 0299832 under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. The CHRI you have marked must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411 of the Government Code. We have marked the information that must be withheld under common law privacy. The department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1). The department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle information you have marked, in addition to the information we have marked, in accordance with section 552.130. The department must withhold the social security number contained in the submitted information under section 552.147. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited

²We note that section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person’s social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



José Vela III
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JV/eb

Ref: ID# 264282

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Zulma Lawler
Juan C. Hernandez & Associates
4849 Greenville Avenue, Suite 1670
Dallas, Texas 75206
(w/o enclosures)