



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

December 8, 2006

Mr. Rashaad V. Gambrell
Assistant City Attorney
City of Houston
P.O. Box 368
Houston, Texas 77001-0368

OR2006-14453

Dear Mr. Gambrell:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 266459.

The Houston Police Department (the "department") received a request for a specified offense report. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision" and encompasses common law privacy. Gov't Code § 552.101. Information is protected from disclosure by the common law right to privacy when (1) it is highly intimate or embarrassing, such that its release would be highly objectionable to a person of ordinary sensibilities and (2) there is no legitimate public interest in its disclosure. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. Information may also be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common law privacy upon a showing of "special circumstances." *See* Open Records Decision No. 169 (1977). This office considers "special

circumstances” to refer to a very narrow set of situations in which the release of information would likely cause someone to face “an imminent threat of physical danger.” *Id.* at 6. Such “special circumstances” do not include “a generalized and speculative fear of harassment or retribution.” *Id.*

In this instance, you inform us that the submitted information contains information pertaining to the identity of a confidential informant for the Federal Bureau of Investigation that, if released, would endanger the informant’s safety. You state that “confidential informants . . . engage in undercover operations in conjunction with [the department] and the FBI” and release of this information would endanger the life of the informant and “would hinder the working relationship between [the department] and the FBI in future operations.” We have marked the information that the department must withhold under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the “special circumstances” aspect of common law privacy.

Section 552.101 also encompasses information protected by the informer’s privilege, which has long been recognized by Texas courts. *See Aguilar v. State*, 444 S.W.2d 935, 937 (Tex. Crim. App. 1969); *Hawthorne v. State*, 10 S.W.2d 724, 725 (Tex. Crim. App. 1928). The informer’s privilege protects the identities of individuals who report violations of statutes to the police or similar law-enforcement agencies, as well as those who report violations of statutes with civil or criminal penalties to “administrative officials having a duty of inspection or of law enforcement within their particular spheres.” Open Records Decision No. 279 at 2 (1981); Wigmore, *Evidence*, § 2374, at 767 (McNaughton rev. ed. 1961). The report must be of a violation of a criminal or civil statute. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 582 at 2 (1990), 515 at 4-5 (1988).

You represent that the submitted information contains the identity of an individual who furnished information pertaining to a violation of a criminal law to the department. Having considered your representations and reviewed the submitted information, we find that you have demonstrated the applicability of the common law informer’s privilege in this instance. We have marked the information the department may withhold pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code and the common law informer’s privilege.

You claim that some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.130 of the Government Code, which provides in relevant part:

(a) Information is excepted from the requirement of Section 552.021 if the information relates to:

(1) a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license or permit issued by an agency of this state; [or]

(2) a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state; or

(3) a personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or a local agency authorized to issue an identification document.

Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1)-(3). We have marked the information the department must withhold under section 552.130.

We note that some of the remaining information must be withheld under section 552.136 of the Government Code.¹ Section 552.136 provides in relevant part:

(a) In this section, "access device" means a card, plate, code, account number, personal identification number, electronic serial number, mobile identification number, or other telecommunications service, equipment, or instrument identifier or means of account access that alone or in conjunction with another access device may be used to:

(1) obtain money, goods, services, or another thing of value; or

(2) initiate a transfer of funds other than a transfer originated solely by paper instrument.

(b) Notwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.

Gov't Code § 552.136. The department must withhold the credit card number that we have marked pursuant to section 552.136 of the Government Code.

Finally, section 552.147 of the Government Code provides that "[t]he social security number of a living person is excepted from" required public disclosure under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147. Therefore, the department must withhold the social security number we have marked in the remaining information under section 552.147.

In summary, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the "special circumstances" aspect of common law privacy. The department may withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the informer's privilege. The

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception like section 552.136 on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. See Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

department must withhold the information we have marked under sections 552.130, 552.136, and 552.147 of the Government Code. The remaining submitted information must be released to the requestor.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

²We note that the information being released contains information that would be excepted from disclosure to the general public under laws and exceptions designed to protect privacy. However, as the individual to whom the information pertains, the requestor has a special right of access to this information. See Gov't Code § 552.023(b) (governmental body may not deny access to person to whom information relates, or that person's representative, solely on grounds that information is considered confidential by privacy principles). If the department receives another request for this information from a person who would not have a special right of access, the department should resubmit this same information and request another decision. See Gov't Code §§ 552.301(a), .302; Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Tamara L. Harswick". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large, stylized initial "T".

Tamara L. Harswick
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

TLH/sdk

Ref: ID# 266459

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Ignatius Nzegwu
9010 Ketchwood Drive
Houston, Texas 77099
(w/o enclosures)