



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

January 5, 2007

Ms. Bernadette Gonzalez  
Coordinator, Records & Legal Services  
Eanes Independent School District  
601 Camp Craft Road  
Austin, Texas 78746

OR2007-00194

Dear Ms. Gonzalez:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 269698.

The Eanes Independent School District (the "district") received a request for information pertaining to six named employees. You state that some of the requested information will be made available to the requestor, but claim that some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.102, 552.117, 552.130, 552.136, and 552.137 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.<sup>1</sup>

Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, including the Medical Practice Act (the "MPA"), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides the following:

---

<sup>1</sup>We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. See *Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988)*. This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002(b), (c). Medical records may be released only as provided under the MPA. Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). The submitted information does not contain medical records; therefore, none of the submitted information may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with the MPA.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the Americans with Disabilities Act (the "ADA"), 42 U.S.C. §§ 12101 *et seq.* The ADA provides for the confidentiality of certain medical records of employees and applicants. Specifically the ADA provides that information about the medical conditions and medical histories of applicants or employees must be (1) collected and maintained on separate forms, (2) kept in separate medical files, and (3) treated as a confidential medical record. In addition, an employer's medical examination or inquiry into the ability of an employee to perform job-related functions is to be treated as a confidential medical record. 29 C.F.R. § 1630.14(c); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 641 (1996). The Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (the "EEOC") determined that medical information for the purposes of the ADA includes "specific information about an individual's disability and related functional limitations, as well as, general statements that an individual has a disability or that an ADA reasonable accommodation has been provided for a particular individual." *See* Letter from Ellen J. Vargyas, Legal Counsel, EEOC, to Barry Kearney, Associate General Counsel, National Labor Relations Board, 3 (Oct. 1, 1997). The district asserts that some of the submitted information, including the number of sick days taken by one of the employees at issue, is confidential under the ADA; however, after review of your arguments and the information at issue, we find the district has not established that this information contains the medical conditions and medical histories of district applicants or employees. Accordingly, none of the submitted information is confidential under the ADA, and the district may not withhold it under section 552.101 on that ground.

Section 552.101 also encompasses information protected by federal law. The submitted information contains an I-9 form (Employment Eligibility Verification), which is governed by section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code. This section provides that an I-9 form and "any information contained in or appended to such form, may not be used for purposes other than for enforcement of this chapter" and for enforcement of other federal statutes governing crime and criminal investigations. *See* 8 U.S.C. § 1324a(b)(5); *see also* 8 C.F.R. § 274a.2(b)(4). Release of the form in this instance would be "for purposes other than for

enforcement” of the referenced federal statutes. Accordingly, we conclude that the I-9 form and its attachments are confidential and may only be released in compliance with the federal laws and regulations governing the employment verification system.

The submitted information includes a W-4 tax form. Section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code provides that tax return information is confidential. *See* 26 U.S.C. § 6103(a)(2), (b)(2)(A), (p)(8); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 600 (1992); Attorney General Op. MW-372 (1981). Accordingly, this information is confidential under section 6103(a), and the district must withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. This office has found that the following types of information are excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy: some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps); personal financial information not relating to the financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992), 545 (1990); and identities of victims of sexual abuse, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 440 (1986), 393 (1983), 339 (1982). We have marked the information that is confidential under common-law privacy and that the district must withhold under section 552.101. But the remaining information is not highly intimate or embarrassing; therefore, the remaining information is not confidential under common-law privacy, and the district may not withhold it under section 552.101 on that ground.

You assert that some of the submitted information is excepted under section 552.102 of the Government Code. Section 552.102(b) excepts from disclosure all information from transcripts of professional public school employees other than the employee’s name, the courses taken, and the degree obtained. *See* Open Records Decision No. 526 (1989). Thus, with the exception of the employee’s name, courses taken, and degree obtained, the district must withhold the information in the submitted transcripts that we have marked pursuant to section 552.102(b). The district may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.102.

You assert that some of the submitted information is excepted under section 552.117 of the Government Code. Section 552.117(a)(1) excepts from disclosure the current and former home addresses and telephone numbers, social security numbers, and family member

information of current or former officials or employees of a governmental body who request that this information be kept confidential under section 552.024 of the Government Code. Whether a particular piece of information is protected by section 552.117(a)(1) must be determined at the time the request for it is made. *See* Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). You have provided documentation showing that the employees at issue timely elected to keep their home addresses and telephone numbers confidential; therefore, the district must withhold this information, which we have marked, pursuant to section 552.117(a)(1). But these employees did not timely elect to keep their social security numbers or family member information confidential; therefore, the district may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.117.

You assert that some of the remaining information is excepted under section 552.130 of the Government Code, which provides that information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by a Texas agency is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1), (2). The district must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130.

You assert that some of the remaining information is excepted under section 552.136 of the Government Code. Section 552.136(b) states that "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." The information at issue does not consist of an access device number for purposes of section 552.136; therefore, the district may not withhold this information under section 552.136(b).

The district asserts that some of the remaining information is excepted under section 552.137 of the Government Code. Section 552.137 excepts from disclosure "an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body" unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *See* Gov't Code § 552.137(a)-(c). Section 552.137 does not apply to a government employee's work e-mail address because such an address is not that of the employee as a "member of the public," but is instead the address of the individual as a government employee. The e-mail addresses at issue do not appear to be of a type specifically excluded by section 552.137(c). You do not inform us that a member of the public has affirmatively consented to the release of any e-mail address contained in the submitted materials. Therefore, the district must withhold the e-mail addresses we have marked under section 552.137.

We note that the submitted information contains social security numbers. Section 552.147 of the Government Code provides that "[t]he social security number of a living person is

excepted from” required public disclosure under the Act. The district must withhold the social security numbers we have marked under section 552.147.<sup>2</sup>

To conclude, the district must withhold the following: (1) the I-9 form and its attachments under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law; (2) the W-4 tax form under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code; (3) the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy; (4) the information in the transcripts we have marked pursuant to section 552.102(b), except for the employee’s name, courses taken, and degree obtained; (5) the information we have marked under section 552.117 of the Government Code; (6) the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code; (7) the information we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code; and (8) the information we have marked under section 552.147 of the Government Code. The district must release the remaining information to the requestor. As our ruling is dispositive, we do not address your remaining arguments for exception of the information at issue.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov’t Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

---

<sup>2</sup>We note that section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person’s social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



James L. Coggeshall  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

JLC/jww

Ref: ID# 269698

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Kathy Howard  
c/o Bernadette Gonzalez  
Coordinator, Records & Legal Services  
Eanes Independent School District  
601 Camp Craft Road  
Austin, Texas 78746  
(w/o enclosures)