



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

January 22, 2007

Ms. S. McClellan
Assistant City Attorney
Criminal Law and Police Section
City of Dallas
1400 S. Lamar
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2007-00641

Dear Ms. McClellan:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID#269581.

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request for all information pertaining to a specified address over a particular period of time. You claim that the submitted information is *excepted from disclosure* under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Initially, we note that some of the submitted information is not responsive to the present request, which seeks information pertaining to a particular address during a specified period of time. You have submitted information that does not involve the specified address. This ruling does not address the public availability of any information that is not responsive to the request, and the department is not required to release that information in response to the request.

¹We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses section 261.201(a) of the Family Code, which provides as follows:

The following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

- (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and
- (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Upon review, however, we determine that you have failed to demonstrate that any portion of the responsive information constitutes information used or developed in an investigation under chapter 261 of the Family Code. Consequently, no portion of the responsive information may be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code on this basis.

Section 552.101 encompasses section 58.007 of the Family Code. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997 are confidential under section 58.007. For purposes of section 58.007, "child" means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the reported conduct. See Fam. Code § 51.02(2). Section 58.007(c) reads as follows:

Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapter B.

Id. § 58.007. Upon review, we determine that you have failed to demonstrate that any portion of the responsive information constitutes a juvenile law enforcement record for section 58.007 purposes. Accordingly, no portion of the submitted information may be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code on this basis.

The responsive information includes information subject to chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code. Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code, which authorizes the development of local emergency communications districts. Sections 772.118, 772.218, and 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code apply only to an emergency 9-1-1 district established in accordance with chapter 772. *See* Open Records Decision No. 649 (1996). These statutes make confidential the originating telephone numbers and addresses of 9-1-1 callers that are furnished by a service supplier. *Id.* at 2. Section 772.118 applies to emergency communication districts for counties with a population over two million. Section 772.218 applies to emergency communication districts for counties with a population over 860,000. Section 772.318 applies to emergency communication districts for counties with a population over 20,000. Subchapter E, which applies to counties with populations over 1.5 million, does not contain a confidentiality provision regarding 9-1-1 telephone numbers and addresses. *See* Health & Safety Code §§ 772.401, *et seq.* We understand the numbers at issue to have been supplied by 9-1-1 service suppliers to a 9-1-1 district subject to section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code. Accordingly, the numbers we have marked must be withheld pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has found that some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses are excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps). Based on your arguments and our review, we find that the submitted information contains information that is considered highly intimate or embarrassing and is not of legitimate concern to the public. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, the department has failed to demonstrate that the remaining responsive information constitutes highly intimate or

embarrassing information of which there is no legitimate concern to the public. Thus, no portion of the remaining responsive information may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides in relevant part:

(a) Information is excepted from the requirement of Section 552.021 if the information relates to:

- (1) a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state; [or]
- (2) a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state[.]

Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, you must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold the information we have marked pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code. The department must withhold the information we have marked pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. Finally, the department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining responsive information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body

will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Holly R. Davis
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

HRD/krl

Ref: ID# 269581

Enc. Submitted documents

c: J. Refugio Perea
1522 Gillette Circle
Dallas, Texas 75217
(w/o enclosures)