



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

February 14, 2007

Ms. Sylvia McClellan
Assistant City Attorney
City of Dallas
Criminal Law and Police Section
1400 South Lamar
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2007-01897

Dear Ms. McClellan:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 272451.

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received three separate requests for information relating to a fatal traffic accident. You claim that information beyond that considered "first page" information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Initially, we must determine whether the department complied with section 552.301 of the Government Code in requesting a decision from this office. Section 552.301(b) provides that "[t]he governmental body must ask for the attorney general's decision and state the exceptions that apply . . . not later than the 10th business day after the date of receiving the written request [for information]." Gov't Code § 552.301(b). The department states that it received the first and second requests on December 6, 2006 and the third request on

¹We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

December 7, 2006. However, the first request bears a date stamp indicating it was received by the department on December 4, 2006. The department did not seek a ruling on all three requests from this office until December 20, 2006. Thus, if it were true that the department received the first request on December 6, 2006, then the request for this decision was timely under section 552.301(b). However, if the department received the first request on December 4, 2006 then the department has failed to comply with section 552.301(b). Because the date stamped on the request for information contradicts your statement of the date of receipt, we conclude that the department has not demonstrated that this decision was requested within the ten business days prescribed by section 552.301(b). *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(e)(1)(C) (governmental body must submit signed statement or evidence sufficient to establish date of receipt of written request for information).

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless a compelling reason exists for withholding the information from disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.302; *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). Generally, a compelling reason exists when third party interests are at stake or when information is confidential under law. Open Records Decision No. 150 (1977). Although you assert that portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code, this exception is a discretionary exception to disclosure that may be waived. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). In failing to comply with section 552.301, the department waived its claim under section 552.108. Therefore, the submitted police reports may not be withheld under section 552.108.

We note, however, that the submitted documents include a CRB-3 accident report form completed pursuant to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code.² *See* Transp. Code § 550.064 (officer's accident report). Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. Section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code states that except as provided by subsection (c), accident reports are privileged and confidential.³ *Id.* § 550.065(b). Section 550.065(c)(4) provides for the release of accident reports to a person

²The Texas Department of Public Safety informs us that the Texas Peace Officer's Accident Report, ST-3 form, has been replaced by the Texas Peace Officer's Crash Report, CRB-3 form.

³The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception like section 552.101 on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

who provides two of the following three pieces of information: (1) date of the accident; (2) name of any person involved in the accident; and (3) specific location of the accident. *Id.* § 550.065(c)(4). Under this provision, the Department of Public Safety or another governmental entity is required to release a copy of an accident report to a person who provides the agency with two or more pieces of information specified by the statute. *Id.* Here, only the initial requestor has provided the department with the requisite information. Accordingly, the department must release the accident report form to this requestor. However, the department must withhold the accident report form with respect to the remaining two requestors.

We also note that a portion of the submitted information is subject to chapter 411 of the Government Code. Section 552.101 encompasses information made confidential by statute. One of the submitted documents contains criminal history record information (“CHRI”) generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except that the DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090 - .127. Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. We have marked the CHRI that must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with chapter 411 of the Government Code.

We further note that the submitted information contains motor vehicle record information. Section 552.130 provides in relevant part:

(a) Information is excepted from the requirement of Section 552.021 if the information relates to:

- (1) a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license or permit issued by an agency of this state; [or]
- (2) a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state[.]

Gov’t Code § 552.130 (a)(1), (2). Pursuant to this section, you must withhold the Texas driver’s license numbers, vehicle identification numbers, and license plate numbers that we have marked.

In summary, the department must release to the initial requestor the CRB-3 accident report and must withhold it from the other two requestors. The department must withhold the marked CHRI under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Aries Solis
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

AS/eb

Ref: ID# 272451

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Pettis Norman
4563 South Westmoreland
Dallas, Texas 75237
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Regina L Elkins
Senior Litigation Paralegal
The Bonneau Law Firm
Bonneau Law Building
1038 Elm Street
Old Downtown Carrollton
Carrollton, Texas 75006
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Sixto Quezada, Jr.
1824 Guinevere Street
Arlington, Texas 76014
(w/o enclosures)