



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

April 30, 2007

Mr. Loren B. Smith  
Olson & Olson, L.L.P.  
Wortham Tower, Suite 600  
2727 Allen Parkway  
Houston, Texas 77019

OR2007-04941

Dear Mr. Smith:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 277068.

The City of Friendswood (the "city"), which you represent, received a request for all records related to a dog bite incident. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we address your argument that the records are excepted from disclosure "because they contain a private citizen's medical information protected by the Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 [("HIPAA.")]." At the direction of Congress, the Secretary of Health and Human Services ("HHS") promulgated regulations setting privacy standards for medical records, which HHS issued as the Federal Standards for Privacy of Individually Identifiable Health Information. *See* Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996, 42 U.S.C. § 1320d-2 (Supp. IV 1998) (historical & statutory note); Standards for Privacy of Individually Identifiable Health Information, 45 C.F.R. Pts. 160, 164 ("Privacy Rule"); *see also* Attorney General Opinion JC-0508 at 2 (2002). These standards govern the releasability of protected health information by a covered entity. *See* 45 C.F.R. pts. 160, 164. Under these standards, a covered entity may not use or disclose protected health information, excepted as provided by parts 160 and 164 of the Code of Federal Regulations. 45 C.F.R. § 164.502(a).

This office has previously addressed the interplay of the Privacy Rule and the Act. Open Records Decision No. 681 (2004). In that decision, we noted that section 164.512 of title 45 of the Code of Federal Regulations provides that a covered entity may use or disclose protected health information to the extent that such use or disclosure is required by law and the use or disclosure complies with and is limited to the relevant requirements of such law. See 45 C.F.R. § 164.512(a)(1). We further noted that the Act “is a mandate in Texas law that compels Texas governmental bodies to disclose information to the public.” See Open Records Decision No. 681 at 8 (2004); see also Gov’t Code §§ 552.002, .003, .021. We therefore held that the disclosures under the Act come within section 164.512(a). Consequently, the Privacy Rule does not make information confidential for the purpose of section 552.101 of the Government Code. See *Abbott v. Tex. Dep’t of Mental Health and Mental Retardation*, 212 S.W.3d 648 (Tex. App.—Austin 2006, no pet.); Open Records Decision No. 681 at 9 (2004); see also Open Records Decision No. 478 (1987) (as general rule, statutory confidentiality requires express language making information confidential). Because the Privacy Rule does not make confidential information that is subject to disclosure under the Act, the city may withhold requested protected health information from the public only if the information is confidential under other law or an exception in subchapter C of the Act applies.

Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision,” and encompasses information made confidential by other statutes. Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 58.007(c) of the Family Code provides in pertinent part as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapter B.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). Section 51.02(2)(A) defines "child" as a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age. Fam. Code § 51.02(2)(A). Section 58.007 is not applicable to information that relates to a juvenile as a complainant, victim, witness, or other involved party and not as a suspect or offender. Upon review of the submitted information, we find that you have failed to demonstrate that the submitted report constitutes a law enforcement record or file concerning a juvenile suspect or offender. Therefore, no portion of the submitted information may be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007 of the Family Code.

You also claim that the submitted information is excepted under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 58.005 of the Family Code, which provides:

(a) Records and files concerning a child, including personally identifiable information, and information obtained for the purpose of diagnosis, examination, evaluation, or treatment or for making a referral for treatment of a child by a public or private agency or institution providing supervision of a child by arrangement of the juvenile court or having custody of the child under order of the juvenile court may be disclosed only to:

- (1) the professional staff or consultants of the agency or institution;
- (2) the judge, probation officers, and professional staff or consultants of the juvenile court;
- (3) an attorney for the child;
- (4) a governmental agency if the disclosure is required or authorized by law;
- (5) a person or entity to whom the child is referred for treatment or services if the agency or institution disclosing the information has entered into a written confidentiality agreement with the person or entity regarding the protection of the disclosed information;
- (6) the Texas Department of Criminal Justice and the Texas Juvenile Probation Commission for the purpose of maintaining statistical records of recidivism and for diagnosis and classification; or
- (7) with leave of the juvenile court, any other person, agency, or institution having a legitimate interest in the proceeding or in the work of the court.

Fam. Code § 58.005. In this instance, the submitted information consists of law enforcement records maintained by the animal control division of the city's police department. We find that this information was not obtained for the purpose of diagnosis, examination, evaluation, or treatment, or for making a referral for treatment of a child by a public or private agency or institution providing supervision of a child by arrangement of the juvenile court or having custody of the child under order of the juvenile court. Accordingly, we conclude that the submitted information is not the type of information contemplated by section 58.005 of the Family Code, and none of it may be withheld on that basis.

We end by addressing your argument that section 552.108 excepts from disclosure the requested records. Section 552.108 provides in relevant part:

(a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if:

...

(2) it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]

Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). Section 552.108(a)(2) protects information that relates to a concluded criminal investigation or prosecution that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. We note that a governmental body that claims an exception to disclosure under section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why this exception is applicable to the information that the governmental body seeks to withhold. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977); Open Records Decision No. 434 at 2-3 (1986). You claim that the submitted documents pertain to a police investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Therefore, we conclude that section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to the submitted information.

However, as you acknowledge, section 552.108 is inapplicable to basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). We believe such basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). *See* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of basic information, you may withhold the submitted information from disclosure pursuant to section 552.108(a)(2). We note that you have the discretion to release all or part

of this remaining submitted information that is not otherwise confidential by law. Gov't Code § 552.007.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for

contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Aries Solis".

Aries Solis  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

AS/eeg

Ref: ID# 277068

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Darrell A. Apffel  
Bettison, Doyle, Apffel & Guarino, P.C.  
Galveston Island Professional Center  
6710 Stewart Road, Suite 300  
Galveston, Texas 77551  
(w/o enclosures)