



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

May 31, 2007

Mr. Denis McElroy
Assistant City Attorney
The City of Fort Worth
1000 Throckmorton Street
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

OR2007-06812

Dear Mr. McElroy:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 279844.

The Fort Worth Police Department (the "department") received a request for ten categories of information related to a specified motor vehicle accident. You state you will release most of the requested information, including the related accident report. *See* Transp. Code § 550.065(c)(4) (providing for the release of accident reports to a person who provides two of three required pieces of information). You state that a portion of the Texas-issued motor vehicle record information is being withheld pursuant to a previous determination in Open Records Letter No. 2006-14726 (2006). You claim that the remaining information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses confidential criminal history record information ("CHRI") generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that

¹We note that the department has redacted social security numbers in the submitted information. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

the Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except that DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090 - .127. Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. We note, however, that the definition of CHRI does not include driving record information maintained by DPS under chapter 521 of the Transportation Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.082(2)(B). We also note that because the laws that govern the dissemination of information obtained from NCIC and TCIC are based on both law enforcement and privacy interests, the CHRI of a deceased individual that is obtained from a criminal justice agency may be disseminated only as permitted by subchapter F of chapter 411 of the Government Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 565 at 10-12 (1990). Accordingly, we agree that the CHRI you have highlighted must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 encompasses other statutes, including chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code which authorizes the development of local emergency communications districts. Sections 772.118, 772.218 and 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code are applicable to emergency 911 districts established in accordance with chapter 772. *See* Open Records Decision No. 649 (1996). These sections make the originating telephone numbers and addresses of 911 callers that are furnished by a 911 service provider confidential. *Id.* at 2. Section 772.118 applies to an emergency communications district for a county with a population of more than two million. Section 772.218 applies to an emergency communications district for a county with a population of more than 860,000. Section 772.318 applies to an emergency communications district for a county with a population of more than 20,000.

You state that the City of Fort Worth is part of an emergency communications district established under section 772.218. You explain that the highlighted telephone numbers contained in the submitted information were furnished by a 911 service provider. Based on your representations, we conclude that the department must withhold the highlighted telephone numbers under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.218 of the Health and Safety Code.

You claim that some of the information you have highlighted is excepted under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. Common-law privacy protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The type of information

considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. This office has also found that personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992), 545 (1990). Upon review, we agree that the information you have highlighted must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

You also claim that some of the information you have highlighted is subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 excepts from disclosure “information [that] relates to . . . a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license or permit issued by an agency of this state [or] a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state.” Gov’t Code § 552.130. We agree that the motor vehicle record information you have highlighted, as well as the additional motor vehicle record information we have marked, must be withheld under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold the CHRI you have highlighted under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the highlighted telephone numbers under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.218 of the Health and Safety Code. The department must withhold the information you have highlighted under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information you have highlighted, as well as the additional information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov’t Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the

statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Jordan Johnson
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JJ/jb

Ref: ID# 279844

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Judd Joy
M&M Security Service, Inc.
P.O. Box 260168
Plano, Texas 75026-0168
(w/o enclosures)