



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

June 14, 2007

Ms. Julie Joe
Assistant County Attorney
Travis County
P.O. Box 1748
Austin, Texas 78767

OR2007-07566

Dear Ms. Joe:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 281004.

The Travis County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff") received a request for any and all incident reports pertaining to a specified individual and address, including several specific incident reports. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has found that some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses are excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987)(illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs,

illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps). Furthermore, a compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individuals have significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Also, we find that a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. In this instance, the requestor seeks, in part, specified incident reports. This portion of the request does not implicate the common-law privacy of the named individual. The requestor also asks the department to compile unspecified law enforcement records pertaining to the named individual. Such a request implicates the individual's right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the sheriff maintains unspecified law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the sheriff must withhold such information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. The sheriff must withhold the medical information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 also encompasses criminal history record information ("CHRI") generated by the National Crime Information Center ("NCIC") or by the Texas Crime Information Center. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except that the DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090 - .127. Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. Upon review, we find that none of the information at issue may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with federal law and subchapter F of chapter 411 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code. Section 773.091 is applicable to records of the provision of emergency medical services ("EMS") and provides in part:

- (a) A communication between certified emergency medical services personnel or a physician providing medical supervision and a patient that is made in the course of providing emergency medical services to the patient is

confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(b) Records of the identity, evaluation or treatment of a patient by emergency medical services personnel or by a physician providing medical supervision that are created by the emergency medical services personnel or physician or maintained by an emergency medical services provider are confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) Any person who receives information from confidential communications or records as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 773.092 who is acting on the survivor's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was obtained.

Health & Safety Code § 773.091(a)-(c). Section 773.091 further provides, however, that

[t]he privilege of confidentiality under this section does not extend to information regarding the presence, nature of injury or illness, age, sex, occupation, and city of residence of a patient who is receiving emergency medical services.

Id. § 773.091(a)-(c), (g). We note that section 773.091 is applicable to some of the remaining information, which we have marked. Information that is confidential under section 773.091 may be released to “any person who bears a written consent of the patient or other persons authorized to act on the patient’s behalf.” *Id.* § 773.092(e)(4). The consent must be written and signed by the patient, authorized representative, or personal representative and must specify (1) the information to be covered by the release, (2) reasons or purposes for the release, and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. *Id.* § 773.093(a). Thus, the sheriff must withhold the marked EMS records under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code, except as specified by section 773.091(g). However, the sheriff must release these EMS records on receipt of proper consent under section 773.093(a). *See id.* §§ 773.092, .093; Open Records Decision No. 632.

Next, some of the remaining information is governed by the Medical Practices Act (“MPA”). Occ. Code §§ 151.001-165.160. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides in part:

(a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Id. § 159.002(a)-(c). This office has concluded that the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). Medical records must be released upon the patient's signed, written consent, provided that the consent specifies (1) the information to be covered by the release, (2) reasons or purposes for the release, and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. *See* Occ. Code §§ 159.004, .005. §§ 159.005. Any subsequent release of medical records must be consistent with the purposes for which the governmental body obtained the records. *See id.* § 159.002(c); Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). We have marked the medical records that are subject to the MPA. The sheriff may only disclose these records in accordance with the access provisions of the MPA. Absent the applicability of an MPA access provision, the sheriff must withhold these records pursuant to the MPA. *See* Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991).

We now address your claims under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Section 552.108(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You indicate two of the incident reports relate to pending criminal cases. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases). However, we note that report number 030024568 relates to an alleged assault that occurred on September 13, 2003, and report number 040040136 relates to alleged harassment that occurred on December 10, 2004. You received the request for this information on March 28, 2007. An indictment or information for any misdemeanor must be presented within two years from the date of the commission of the offense. *See* Crim. Proc. Code art. 12.02. More than two years elapsed between the dates of the two offenses at issue and the date you received this request for information. Thus the statutes of limitations have run for report numbers 030024568 and 040040136. With regard to these reports, you have neither informed this office that any criminal charges were filed within the limitations period nor have you explained how release

of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of an offense for which the statutes of limitations has run. Thus, the sheriff has not shown the applicability of section 552.108(a)(1) to report numbers 030024568 and 040040136. As you do not raise any other exceptions against disclosure, the sheriff must release these reports to the requestor.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate that the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. You state that report numbers 040000386 and 9600075399 pertain to criminal investigations that concluded in results other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Accordingly, we agree that section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to these reports.

We note, however, that basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime is not excepted from disclosure under section 552.108. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Such basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. See Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of basic information, the sheriff may withhold report numbers 040000386 and 9600075399 pursuant to section 552.108(a)(2).

Next, you claim the remaining information contains information excepted from disclosure under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 excepts from disclosure "information [that] relates to . . . a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state [or] a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state." Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the sheriff must withhold the Texas motor vehicle information you have marked, as well as the additional information we have marked, pursuant to section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Finally, we note that you have marked social security numbers. Section 552.147 of the Government Code provides that "[t]he social security number of a living person is excepted from" required public disclosure under the Act.¹ Therefore, the sheriff may withhold the marked social security numbers under section 552.147.

In summary, to the extent the sheriff maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the sheriff must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The sheriff must withhold the medical information we have marked under

¹We note that section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The marked EMS records must be withheld under section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code, except as specified by section 773.091(g). The marked medical records may only be disclosed in accordance with the access provisions of the MPA. With the exception of basic information, the sheriff may withhold report numbers 040000386 and 9600075399 under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. The sheriff must withhold the marked Texas motor vehicle information under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The marked social security numbers may be withheld under section 552.147 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "M. Alan Akin", with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

M. Alan Akin
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MAA/jb

Ref: ID# 281004

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. David Glenn Gilbrech
13175 Research Boulevard
Austin, Texas 78750
(w/o enclosures)